

This item is the archived peer-reviewed author-version of:

Non-volatile and volatile composition of West African bulk and Ecuadorian fine-flavor cocoa liquor and chocolate

Reference:

Tuenter Emmy, Delbaere Claudia, De Winne Ann, Bijttebier Sebastiaan, Custers Deborah, Foubert Kenn, Van Durme Jim, Messens Kathy, Dewettinck Koen, Pieters Luc.- Non-volatile and volatile composition of West African bulk and Ecuadorian fine-flavor cocoa liquor and chocolate
Food research international / Canadian Institute of Food Science and Technology - ISSN 0963-9969 - 130(2020), 108943
Full text (Publisher's DOI): <https://doi.org/10.1016/J.FOODRES.2019.108943>
To cite this reference: <https://hdl.handle.net/10067/1649820151162165141>

1 Non-volatile and volatile composition of West African bulk and
2 Ecuadorian fine-flavor cocoa liquor and chocolate

3
4 Emmy TUENTER^{1,*}, Claudia DELBAERE², Ann DE WINNE³, Sebastiaan BIJTTEBIER^{1,4}, Deborah CUSTERS¹,
5 Kenn Foubert¹, Jim VAN DURME³, Kathy MESSENS⁵, Koen DEWETTINCK⁶, Luc PIETERS¹

6
7 ¹*Natural Products & Food Research and Analysis (NatuRA), Department of Pharmaceutical Sciences,*
8 *University of Antwerp, Universiteitsplein 1, 2610, Antwerp, Belgium*

9 ²*Cacaolab bvba, Evergem, Belgium*

10 ³*Centre for Aroma & Flavour Technology, Department of Microbial and Molecular Systems (M²S), Cluster*
11 *Bioengineering Technology, KU Leuven, Technology Campus Ghent, Ghent, Belgium*

12 ⁴*Flemish Institute for Technological Research (VITO), Business Unit Separation and Conversion*
13 *Technology (SCT), Mol, Belgium*

14 ⁵*Research Group Molecular Biotechnology (MOBI), Department of Biotechnology, Faculty of Bioscience*
15 *Engineering, Ghent University, Belgium*

16 ⁶*Laboratory of Food Technology and Engineering, Department of Food Technology, Safety and Health,*
17 *Faculty of Bioscience Engineering, Ghent University, Ghent, Belgium*

18
19
20
21
*Corresponding author: Dr. Emmy Tuenter, emmy.tuenter@uantwerpen.be, tel. +32 32 65 27 31

22 **Abstract**

23 Cocoa products are obtained from the seeds of *Theobroma cacao* L. In this research, cocoa liquor and
24 chocolate produced from cocoa beans from West Africa (Forastero, “bulk” cacao) and Ecuador
25 (Nacional variety, “fine-flavor” cacao), were investigated, using a novel approach in which various
26 analytical techniques are combined in order to obtain in-depth knowledge of the studied cocoa
27 samples. The levels of various classes of primary metabolites were determined and a wide range of
28 secondary metabolites, including volatile organic acids, aldehydes, esters, pyrazines, polyphenols,
29 methylxanthines and biogenic amines, were identified and/or quantified by HS-SPME GC-MS
30 (headspace-solid phase microextraction gas chromatography – mass spectrometry) and UPLC-HRMS
31 (ultra-performance liquid chromatography – high resolution mass spectrometry). Odor Activity Values
32 (OAV) were calculated to assess the contribution of individual volatiles on the final aroma.

33 Various volatile aroma compounds were more abundant in the West African cocoa liquor and
34 chocolate, while the Ecuadorian samples were richer in most quantified non-volatile metabolites.
35 Principal component analysis (PCA) confirmed that the four samples can be clearly distinguished.
36 Alcohols, pyrazines, amino acids and biogenic amines were found to be highly influential in causing this
37 differentiation. The proposed approach can be useful in future studies on more extensive cocoa sample
38 collections, in order to highlight similarities and pinpoint typical differences in chemical composition
39 among these samples.

40

41 **Keywords**

42 cocoa liquor, chocolate, proximate analysis, volatile composition, non-volatile composition, HS-SPME
43 GC-MS, UPLC-HRMS, principal component analysis

44

45 **List of abbreviations**

46 CH Chocolate

47 CL Cocoa Liquor

48 ddMS² data-dependent MS fragmentation

49 DVB/CAR/PDMS Divinylbenzene/Carboxen/Polydimethylsiloxane

50 EC Ecuador

51 exp experimental

52 HCD Higher energy Collisional Dissociation

53 HESI Heated ElectroSpray Ionization

54 HS-SPME Headspace Solid-Phase Microextraction

55 KI Kovats retention Index/Indices

56 lit literature

57 OAV Odor Activity Value

58 OTV Odor Threshold Value

59 WA West Africa

60

61 **1. Introduction**

62 Cocoa liquor is the product obtained from the fermented, dried, roasted and ground seeds of
63 *Theobroma cacao* L. Together with cocoa butter (the fat pressed from cocoa liquor) and sugar, it is the
64 major ingredient of dark chocolate. Cocoa is cultivated between 20° north and 20° south of the equator
65 (Beckett, 2009), mainly in West Africa (representing over 70% of the world production), but also in
66 Central and South America, and South-East Asia (ICCO, 2018). Generally, cocoa is classified into four
67 main varieties based on geographic origin, pod morphology, bean yield, genotype, disease resistance
68 and flavor characteristics. Forastero cocoa, the main variety cultivated in West Africa, is considered as
69 bulk cocoa representing over 90% of the global cacao production. The Criollo, Trinitario and Nacional
70 varieties form the fine-flavor cocoa group and represent 5 to 10% of the cocoa world production. The
71 Nacional variety is exclusively grown in Ecuador and produces the typical Arriba beans with distinct
72 floral and spicy flavor notes (Aprotosoai, Luca and Miron, 2016a).

73 With regard to the chemical composition of cocoa samples (cocoa beans, cocoa liquors, chocolates,
74 etc.), a rough division can be made between non-volatile and volatile components, each requiring
75 different methods of analysis. Besides water and primary metabolites like fats, carbohydrates, proteins
76 and dietary fibers, an important group of non-volatile components are the polyphenols, which can be
77 further divided into three main subgroups: flavan-3-ols (mainly (+)-catechin and (-)-epicatechin),
78 anthocyanins and proanthocyanidins (dimers, trimers and oligomers) (Wollgast and Anklam, 2000).
79 Moreover, flavonoids like quercetin and luteolin have been reported, as were several phenolic acids,
80 such as caffeic, ferulic, and coumaric acid (Aprotosoai et al., 2016a). Many reports were published
81 with regard to the beneficial health effects of polyphenols, mainly because of their antioxidant

82 potential and their protective effects on the cardiovascular system (Crozier and Hurst, 2014;
83 Aprotosoiaie et al., 2016b).

84 Another important class of non-volatile compounds in cocoa are the alkaloids, the methylxanthines
85 being the most abundant ones. Theobromine is the major alkaloid, followed by caffeine. Moreover,
86 theophylline is present, but in much lower amounts. Just like the polyphenols, these methylxanthines
87 contribute to the typical bitter taste of cocoa. Compared to coffee, cocoa contains significantly lower
88 levels of caffeine. Theobromine levels are higher though, but its stimulating effects on the central
89 nervous system are far less pronounced than those of caffeine (Aprotosoiaie et al., 2016a; Tuenter,
90 Foubert and Pieters, 2018).

91 Amino acids and biogenic amines, like 2-phenylethylamine, dopamine and tyramine are also present.
92 Especially during roasting, amino acids can be converted to biogenic amines via decarboxylation.
93 Additional enzymatic reactions can occur, like the reaction of dopamine with acetaldehyde, which leads
94 to the formation of salsolinol. Biogenic amines can exert important effects in the human organism. 2-
95 phenylethylamine, for example, has been referred to as the “love drug”, as it is associated with
96 aphrodisiac effects. Moreover, mood lifting and heightened sensitivity were also associated to the
97 presence of phenylethylamine and N-acylethanolamine. However, 2-phenylethylamine is only present
98 in low amounts, and it does not reach the brain after oral intake. Nevertheless, some amines, at high
99 levels, may cause adverse effects to human health. For example, high levels of tyramine, tryptamine
100 and 2-phenylethylamine can cause migraine (do Carmo Brito et al., 2017; Tuenter et al., 2018).

101 Flavor is the most important criterion for chocolate quality. It is influenced by both the volatile and non-
102 volatile fraction. During fermentation, the formation of flavor precursors like reducing sugars and free
103 amino acids is initiated. Mainly during drying and roasting of the cocoa beans, these compounds can

104 undergo further reactions, which are important for the final flavor and aroma of the cocoa liquors and
105 chocolates. Reducing sugars can react with amino acids or oligopeptides via a Maillard reaction, leading
106 to Amadori products. These can be further converted via multiple reactions into various compounds
107 (aldehydes, ketones, furans, pyrazines, etc.) (Aprotosoai et al., 2016a). Finally, conching is of utmost
108 importance as it eliminates undesirable volatiles and reduces the moisture content, thus enhancing the
109 flavor of the final product (Afoakwa, 2011; Aprotosoai et al., 2016a). The specific cocoa aroma and
110 final composition of cocoa liquors and chocolates are influenced by many factors, like the cocoa
111 genotype, place of origin of the cocoa beans, season of harvesting, the practices of local farmers, and
112 all subsequent processing steps (Afoakwa, Paterson, Fowler and Ryan, 2008; Caligiani et al., 2014;
113 Rottiers et al., 2018; Hinnah et al., 2019a).

114 In the past decades, interest in “functional”, healthy, and high-quality food products has risen, and
115 chocolate is one example of this. A lot of research has been carried out, mainly concerning the
116 cardiovascular effects of (polyphenols in) chocolate. Nevertheless, it is crucial to perform these tests
117 on well-characterized samples, and it is important to take into account also other (minor) constituents
118 when assessing potential biological activities. However, in many studies the levels of flavan-3-ols,
119 procyanidins, methylxanthines and the total phenolic content are determined, but a more detailed
120 analytical characterization of the non-volatile phytochemicals in cocoa liquors and chocolates is
121 relatively rare. Different techniques have been applied for the analysis of such samples, for example
122 High Performance Liquid Chromatography – Ultraviolet detection (HPLC-UV), or Nuclear Magnetic
123 Resonance (NMR) spectroscopy (Natsume et al., 2000; Caligiani et al. 2014). However, Ultra
124 Performance Liquid Chromatography– High Resolution Mass Spectrometry (UPLC-HRMS) is the
125 preferred technique when analyzing also minor non-volatile constituents, (like biogenic amines, as
126 reported by Oracz and Nebesny (2014)) and is applied in this research. With regard to the volatile

127 compounds, different extraction procedures combined with various analytical techniques were already
128 tested (Counet, Callemien, Ouwerx and Collin , 2002; Frauendorfer and Schieberle, 2008; Owusu,
129 Petersen and Heimdal, 2011). Headspace Solid-Phase Micro extraction (HS-SPME) is considered the
130 preferred extraction technique in combination with GC-MS (Gas Chromatography – MS) for the profiling
131 of the aroma of cocoa products and was used for analysis of the aroma compounds.

132 In this study, a comparison is made between cocoa liquors and chocolates, produced from a batch of
133 “blended bulk cocoa beans”, harvested in West Africa, which is common practice in commercial mass
134 production of chocolate, and cocoa beans of the Nacional variety, considered a fine-flavor cocoa, from
135 Ecuador. The nutritional composition of the cocoa liquors was determined; the levels of various
136 phytochemicals, volatile and non-volatile, were assessed by means of GC-MS and UPLC-HRMS.
137 Additionally, the odor activity values (OAVs) of volatile compounds and the contribution of these
138 compounds to overall aroma were calculated. Finally, principal component analysis (PCA) was carried
139 out, based on the GC-MS and UPLC-HRMS data, in order to visualize whether the samples could be
140 distinguished and if so, to look further into the exact compositional differences between the samples.

141

142 **2. Materials and Methods**

143 *2.1 Raw materials*

144 Two cocoa liquors were investigated: a commercial West African cocoa liquor (WA-CL) made from a
145 blend of cocoa beans of different origins and varieties, supplied by Cacaolab bvba (Evergem, Belgium),
146 and an Ecuadorian cocoa liquor (EC-CL) made from cocoa beans of the Nacional variety collected in the
147 Sucumbíos province. The former is considered a bulk cocoa liquor, the latter a fine-flavor cocoa liquor.
148 The cocoa liquor samples provided were obtained from well fermented and dried cocoa beans that

149 were roasted and ground into cocoa liquor. Pre-broken sugar, cocoa butter and soy lecithin were
150 provided by Cacaolab bvba.

151

152 *2.2 Chemicals*

153 UPLC-grade acetonitrile, formic acid and ammonium formate were purchased from Biosolve
154 (Valkenswaard, The Netherlands). HPLC-grade acetone was obtained from Acros Organics (Geel,
155 Belgium), and HPLC-grade *n*-hexane came from Fisher Scientific (Loughborough, UK). Ultrapure water
156 was generated with a Direct Pure Up system of Rephile. Analytical standards were purchased from
157 Extrasynthese (Lyon, France), Sigma-Aldrich (Bornem, Belgium), Santa Cruz Biotechnology (Heidelberg,
158 Germany), or Carl Roth (Karlsruhe, Germany).

159

160 *2.3 Chocolate formulation and production*

161 Dark chocolates consisting of 48.0wt% pre-broken sugar, 18.1wt% non-fat cocoa solids coming from
162 cocoa liquor, 33.5wt% cocoa butter and 0.4wt% soy lecithin were produced on a 5 kg scale at Cacaolab.
163 Two dark chocolates with a cocoa content of 51.6% were made: one from the West African cocoa liquor
164 (WA-CH) and one from the Ecuadorian liquor (EC-CH). The chocolates were produced using the protocol
165 described by Tran et al. (2016), but mixing was done at a rotational speed setting of 1. The chocolates
166 were hand tempered on a marble plate and the temper index was measured with a Chocometer
167 (Aasted-Mikroverk, Farum, Denmark). The chocolate was considered well-tempered when a temper
168 index between 3.5 and 4.5 was obtained, to ensure sufficient contraction and a good gloss and snap.
169 Finally, the tempered chocolate was molded into chocolate tablets of about 6 g (33 x 33 x 5 mm),
170 vibrated, leveled off and cooled in a cooled cabinet at 11 °C for 45 min (Chocolate World, Antwerp,

171 Belgium). After a maturation period of 24 h at 20 °C, the chocolates were individually wrapped into
172 aluminum foil and stored until further analysis.

173

174 *2.4 Proximate analysis*

175 Moisture content of the cocoa liquors was analyzed in triplicate using Karl Fischer titration. The analysis
176 was done using a 719 Titrino (Metrohm, Herisau, Switzerland) with Hydranal solvent (Riedel de Haen,
177 34812) and Hydranal titrant 5 (Riedel de Haen, 34801). The fat, protein, total dietary fiber and ash
178 content of the cocoa liquors were analyzed in duplicate using the official AOAC methods for cocoa
179 products: methods 963.15 (Weibull method), 970.22 (Kjeldahl method using a conversion factor of
180 6.25), 985.29 and 972.1, respectively.

181

182 *2.5 HS-SPME GC-MS analysis*

183 The volatile aroma profiles were recorded using HS-SPME-GC-MS based on the method described by
184 Van Durme, Ingels and De Winne (2016), but confirmation of identified compounds was done with the
185 Wiley 275 library and by comparison of Kovats indices determined after injection of a series of *n*-alkane
186 homologues (C₅–C₁₃) (KI(exp)), with the Kovats indices from literature (KI(lit)).

187 To evaluate whether a volatile contributes to the overall flavor profile, the OAVs were calculated using
188 documented odor threshold values (OTVs) (van Gemert, 2011). The OTVs in oil media were used due
189 to the fat continuous dispersion (ca. 55% fat) of the cocoa liquors. The OAVs were calculated by dividing
190 the headspace concentrations of aroma compounds with their respective OTVs.

191

192 *2.6 UPLC-HRMS analysis*

193 Prior to extraction, samples were defatted three times with *n*-hexane (ratio 1:5 (m/V)). The samples
194 were subjected to ultrasonication for 10 min, followed by centrifugation (5 min, 1370 x G). The defatted
195 cocoa liquors and chocolates were left to dry for at least 24 h at room temperature, protected from
196 light. Extraction of 0.5 g of the samples was carried out three consecutive times with 10 mL of a mixture
197 of 70:29.8:0.2 aceton:H₂O:acetic acid. Samples were vortex mixed and submitted to ultrasonication for
198 1 h, repeating the vortex mixing after 30 min. The samples were centrifuged (5 min, 1370 x G) and the
199 supernatant was collected. All extracts were prepared in triplicate.

200 Standard stock solutions of 50 compounds (including a wide range of substances, previously reported
201 in cocoa and chocolate (Afoakwa, 2011; Aprotosoie et al, 2016a) were prepared at a concentration of
202 1 mg/mL in methanol. Dilutions were prepared in 60:40 (V:V) methanol:40 mM ammonium formate
203 buffer. A list of the analytes can be found in the Supplementary Information, Table S1.

204 All samples were analyzed by UPLC-HRMS. For qualitative purposes, one extract per sample was
205 injected on a UPLC system and analyzed by a Q Exactive HRMS detector (Thermo Fisher Scientific,
206 Bremen, Germany), as described previously by Bijttebier et al. (2016). Quantitative UPLC-HRMS analysis
207 of the chocolates and cocoa liquors was carried out on an Acquity UPLC with XEVO G2-XS QTOF
208 (Quadrupole Time-Of-flight) MS system. Separation was achieved on an UPLC HSS T3 column (2.1 x 100
209 mm, 1.8 µm), kept at 40 °C, and H₂O (A) and CH₃CN (B) both with 0.1% formic acid, as mobile phase.
210 The following gradient was applied: 0-1 min 3% B, 7 min 15% B, 14 min 22% B, 17 min 30% B, 22-24 min
211 100% B, 26-30 min 3% B. The flow rate was 0.4 mL/min. Detection was carried out in ESI+ mode, *m/z*
212 scan range 50-1500. *V*_{cap} 1.0 kV, *V*_{cone} 40 V, source offset 80, *T*_{source} 120 °C, *T*_{desolvation} 550 °C, cone gas 50
213 L/h, desolvation gas 1000 L/h. The 50 reference compounds were analyzed under the same conditions,
214 in concentrations ranging from 610 pg/mL to 5 µg/mL, and calibration curves were constructed, in order

215 to allow a quantitative determination of these compounds in the samples. All samples were analyzed
216 as such, or after a ten-, hundred- or thousand-fold dilution in 50% methanol (injection volume: 5 µL).

217

218 *2.7 Data-analysis*

219 The resulting values of the UPLC-HRMS and GC-MS analysis were subjected to analysis of variance
220 (ANOVA) at 5% significance level, using SPSS Statistics 25 (SPSS Inc., Chicago, USA) or GraphPad Prism
221 6 (GraphPad Software, San Diego, USA). Workflow4Metabolomics 3.0
222 (<http://workflow4metabolomics.org/>), and Matlab R2018a were used to carry out PCA.

223

224 **3. Results and Discussion**

225 *3.1 Nutritional composition of cocoa liquors*

226 Table 1 shows the nutritional composition of the cocoa liquors. Fat (>54%) was the major constituent
227 for both origins, followed by total dietary fibers (14.1-19.8%) and proteins (14.7-15.6%). Ash and
228 moisture content of the cocoa liquor samples were less than 3.5% and 1.5%, respectively. The
229 nutritional composition of the cocoa liquors varied depending on their geographical origin. EC-CL
230 showed a lower moisture content, a higher protein content and a lower total dietary fiber and ash
231 content. No differences were found in total fat content between the two origins. Their fat content was
232 in the range 47-60% defined by the Codex Standards (2001). The fat content of the EC-CL was slightly
233 higher than the values reported by Luna, Crouzillat, Cirou and Buchelli (2002) for Ecuadorian Arriba
234 cocoa liquors (52.2-53.8). The fat content of the WA-CL fell in the range 55-59%, found for most
235 Forastero cocoa beans (Afoakwa, Quao, Takrama, Budu and Saalia, 2013). The moisture content of the
236 cocoa liquor samples was lower than 2%, a value recommended by industrial manufacturers (Beckett,

237 2009). The protein, total dietary fiber and ash content of the cocoa liquors was in the same order of
238 magnitude compared to the values reported by Torres-Moreno, Torrescasana, Salas-Salvadó and
239 Blanch (2015) for cocoa beans from Ghana and Ecuador.

240

241 *3.2 Volatile aroma composition*

242 Table 2 shows the mean semi-quantitative volatile composition of the cocoa liquors and chocolates,
243 and the linear KI, determined for each compound on the DB-WAX column. A total of 67 volatile
244 components was identified, including acids, alcohols, aldehydes, esters, ketones, pyrazines, furans,
245 furanones, lactones, pyrans, pyrroles and terpenes.

246 The total volatile concentration was higher in the cocoa liquors (20,394 – 63,801 ng/g cocoa liquor)
247 than in the chocolates (7,592 – 9,673 ng/g chocolate). Both the EC-CL and EC-CH showed a lower total
248 volatile concentration than their West African counterpart. For each compound, the OAV was
249 calculated by dividing the values from Table 2 by their respective OTV (van Gemert, 2011) (Table 3). A
250 volatile with $OAV \geq 1$ may be considered odor-active, and only those compounds are given in Table 3.
251 As can be seen from Table 3, not all OTVs were found in literature, and thus, OAVs could not be
252 determined for all components. However, OAV of the most relevant volatiles could be determined. It is
253 worth mentioning that depending on its OTV, a volatile with a relatively higher headspace
254 concentration may not necessarily contribute to the overall flavor profile.

255 Table 2 and 3 show that volatiles, and particularly volatile acids, decreased during chocolate production
256 from cocoa liquor, but that no new key odorants appeared. The reduced concentration of volatiles is
257 mainly due to the conching step and the “dilution of the cocoa liquors” by the addition of sugar and
258 cocoa butter. This was also observed by Counet et al. (2002). The dominating odorant identified in both

259 cocoa liquors and chocolates was acetic acid, which was less abundant in the EC samples than in the
260 WA samples. The presence of acetic acid is typically characterized by sour, vinegar flavor notes
261 (Frauendorfer and Schieberle, 2008). Off-flavor components such as butyric acid and 3-methylbutyric
262 acid were only detected in WA-CL, but disappeared in the respective chocolate.

263 The second most dominant group of odorants were alcoholic compounds, of which 2,3-butanediol and
264 1,3-butanediol were the most prominent in all samples. However, despite the unknown odor thresholds
265 in oil and air (van Gemert, 2011), these two alcohols are expected to have no impact on chocolate flavor
266 and are therefore absent in Table 3. The concentration of the alcoholic volatiles, particularly 2-
267 phenylethanol, was substantially lower in the chocolates compared to the cocoa liquors. 2-
268 Phenylethanol is the most odor-active alcohol with equal amounts in the cocoa liquors and chocolates.
269 It is expected to confer its typical floral note to the chocolates. Despite the low amounts of 2-heptanol
270 in both chocolates, this volatile has a low OTV and, therefore, contributes highly to the fruity aroma.
271 This is in accordance with the results of Rottiers et al. (2019) who studied the volatile aroma
272 composition of fine-flavor Trinitario cocoa beans.

273 The aldehyde fraction contained 2-methylpropanal, and 2- and 3-methylbutanal, odorants contributing
274 to a distinct dark chocolate flavor (Counet et al., 2002). These volatiles are formed through Strecker
275 degradation and are derived from the amino acids valine, leucine, and isoleucine, respectively (Afoakwa
276 et al., 2008). Although the amounts of these flavor aldehydes in EC-CL were significantly lower than in
277 WA-CL, no significant differences were found between the chocolates. Hinneh et al. (2019b) found that
278 high roasting intensities cause a decrease in aldehydes, due to conversion of these Strecker
279 intermediates or their precursors into other volatiles. Benzaldehyde was the most predominant
280 aldehyde (Table 2). With its typical roasted almond odor, it is expected to contribute to the flavor of
281 both liquors and chocolates.

282 In both chocolates, a reduction of most esters was found to an undetectable level, while two important
283 esters remained: 2-phenylethylacetate and butyl benzoate. The former is odor active and likely to
284 confer its honey, floral, fruity character to the flavor of both liquors and chocolates. The banana-like
285 note of 3-methylbutylacetate in the WA-CL was not retained in the chocolate.

286 Among the ketones detected, 2-nonanone was the most abundant and highest in WA-CL. In addition,
287 acetophenone, 3-hydroxy-2-butanone and 1-hydroxy-2-propanone were detected in relatively high
288 concentrations in the cocoa liquors. 2-Nonanone and 2,3-butanedione might contribute to the aroma.
289 Interestingly, the concentration of 2,3-butanedione (buttery note (Januszewska, 2018)) did not
290 decrease after conching in the Ecuadorian sample, but could no longer be detected in the WA-CH.
291 Rottiers et al. (2019) proved that 2-nonanone highly contributes to the fruity aroma, while 2,3-
292 butanedione was responsible for buttery, creamy flavor notes.

293 Nitrogenous heterocyclic components, such as pyrazines derived from Maillard reactions, emerged as
294 interesting volatiles in dark chocolate. Cocoa, hazelnut, coffee, roasted, and popcorn-like attributes of
295 those pyrazines are considered to be highly desirable for chocolate flavor (Afoakwa, 2011).
296 Concentrations of these cyclic nitrogen-containing molecules were highest in the WA-CL. From the 12
297 detected pyrazines, 10 remained after conching. However, taking into consideration the odor threshold
298 value in oil, only 2,3-dimethylpyrazine and 2,3,5-trimethylpyrazine are aroma active in all samples; 2,3-
299 dimethyl-5-ethylpyrazine (roasted cocoa) only in CL and 3-ethyl-2,5-dimethylpyrazine (caramel) only in
300 WA-CL. Moreover, WA-CL was extremely rich in tetramethylpyrazine; more than 87 times higher than
301 in EC-CL. However, the contribution of the last pyrazine to the flavor is negligible due to its high OTV
302 (OAV < 1). The processing of cocoa liquors into chocolates had a major influence on the total pyrazine
303 level. These results correlate well with results of Hinneh et al. (2018) who also found that

304 tetramethylpyrazine was not odor-active, while trimethylpyrazine was, but the most odor-active
305 pyrazine was 2,3-dimethyl-5-ethylpyrazine.

306 The formation of furans, furanones, pyrans and pyrroles mainly occurs by caramelization of sugars. Only
307 γ -butyrolactone is odor active and imparts a sweet, caramel like flavor. The impact on the overall flavor
308 of linalool can likely also be assessed as considerable, due to its relatively low OTV (37 ng/g) (van
309 Gemert, 2011). This component contributes to the flowery, green note in chocolate aroma. No
310 significant difference in linalool content was observed between both chocolates, although the amount
311 in WA-CL was much higher.

312 PCA was carried out, based on the two datasets shown in Tables 2 and 3, to obtain more information
313 about the samples and their differences. The PCA-score plot based on the levels of all volatile
314 components (Table 2) is presented in Figure 1. The score plot of the PCA based on the OAVs alone (Table
315 3) is highly similar and can be consulted in the Supplementary Information, Figure S1. It can be
316 concluded that quantification of these 20 odor-active compounds is sufficient to discriminate the
317 samples.

318 The PCA score plot of the first two principal components shows a clear distinction between the four
319 types of samples, with PC1 accounting for 88.9% and PC2 8.7% of the total variance and 92.8% and
320 5.7%, respectively, when only data of the odor active compounds are used . Samples of the two
321 different liquors and chocolates clustered well in both score plots. EC-CL, and to a lesser extent EC-CH,
322 were related to the floral and buttery components such as 2-phenylethanol, 2-heptanol, γ -
323 butyrolactone and 2,3-butanedione, as could be deduced from the loading plot (Figure 2). WA-CL could
324 be associated with typical malty and chocolate notes such as 2- and 3-methylbutanal and all roasted

325 components, such as 2,3-dimethylpyrazine and 2,3,5-trimethylpyrazine. WA-CH was not characterized
326 by any typical flavor component.

327

328 *3.3 Non-volatile secondary metabolite composition*

329 For identification purposes, the chromatographic and spectral information, without and with MS
330 fragmentation, were analyzed. Structures were assigned to unknown peaks only when both the *m/z*-
331 ratios and molecular formulae of the precursor and product ions were in agreement. Additional
332 information for dereplication was often acquired from in-house and commercial compound databases
333 and peer reviewed publications. The tentatively identified compounds in EC-CL and EC-CH and the
334 diagnostic chromatographic and HRMS data used for compound identification can be found in Table
335 S2, Supplementary Information. Unless otherwise stated (*vide infra*), the compounds were also present
336 in the WA-CL and WA-CH. This table also specifies the literature consulted for confirmation of
337 compound identity.

338 Cocoa is a rich source of catechins and procyanidins, which was also observed in the current study. Next
339 to the major compounds catechin and epicatechin (identified with reference standards), several
340 (epi)catechin hexoside and (epi)catechin sulfonic acid isomers were tentatively identified (their
341 fragmentation was similar to that described by Patras, Milev, Vrancken and Kuhnert (2014)).
342 Furthermore, a multitude of procyanidins ranging from dimeric to heptameric isomers was tentatively
343 identified (Table S2, Supplementary Information). The fragmentation pattern of the detected
344 procyanidins was similar to that of an analytical standard solution of procyanidin B2 and was in
345 accordance with the fragmentation patterns described previously (Patras et al., 2014; Bijttebier et al.,
346 2016). Glycosylated (pro)cyanidins (hexosides and pentosides of procyanidin A and cyanidin) were also

347 detected. However, when comparing the samples of EC with those of WA, both cyanidin glycosides
348 (cyanidin-3-O-galactoside and cyanidin-3-O-arabinoside) were present in higher levels in the former.
349 Three trimeric procyanidins were tentatively identified based on their (de)protonated molecules: one
350 containing one A-type and one B-type connection at 13.24 min, the other two containing two A-type
351 connections at 14.57 and 15.87 min. However, this could not be confirmed by MS² because of low signal
352 intensities, as was the case in the study of Patras et al. (2014). Interestingly, these procyanidins could
353 clearly be detected in the EC-CL and EC-CH, but the trimeric A-type procyanidins at 14.57 and 15.87 min
354 were not found in the WA samples, nor did the WA-CH contain the trimeric procyanidin eluting at 13.24
355 minutes. Furthermore, the hexameric and heptameric procyanidins were far more abundant in the EC
356 samples, compared to the WA samples.

357 Several other flavonoids such as quercetin, and glycosides thereof, luteolin and an apigenin-hexoside
358 were also tentatively identified (Table 2, Supplementary Information). In addition, some
359 hydroxycinnamic acid-amino acid conjugates such as coumaroyl-aspartate, clovamide (caffeoyl-
360 dihydroxyphenylalanine) and dideoxyclovamide (coumaroyl-tyrosine) were detected, in accordance
361 with Kothe (2013) and Arlorio et al. (2008). A wide variety of phenolic constituents was thus tentatively
362 identified in the cocoa samples in the current study.

363 Three unknown structures corresponding to molecular formulae C₁₄H₂₄O₁₀, C₁₇H₃₀O₁₀ and C₁₉H₃₄O₁₀
364 were detected in positive and negative ionization mode. These unknown compounds with similar
365 fragmentation patterns were previously detected by Patras et al. (2014). In negative ionization mode
366 the three compounds all fragmented to render the pseudomolecular ions [M-H-C₄H₆O₃]⁻ (loss of 102
367 Da) and [M-H-C₆H₈O₄]⁻ ions (loss of 144 Da), which can be indicative for the presence of a 3-hydroxy-3-
368 methylglutaryl substituent, as previously described by Mencherini et al. (2013) in citrus fruits. Another
369 product ion that was detected in this study at 161 Da (most probable molecular formula C₆H₉O₅)

370 corresponded to a deprotonated hexose sugar moiety with the loss of water. In positive ion mode the
371 loss of CO₂ was observed, indicative for a carboxyl group, which is in agreement with the presence of a
372 3-hydroxy-3-methylglutaryl moiety. Notwithstanding the indications for a 3-hydroxy-3-methylglutaryl
373 and a hexose moiety, further research is required to reveal the structures of these unknowns.

374 For completeness' sake, several disaccharides, amino acids and organic acids were also observed in the
375 chromatograms of the cocoa extracts. Some compounds, such as cynaroside, epicatechin-4(S)-
376 benzylthioether and (epi)gallocatechin, which have been reported before in cocoa samples were not
377 detected in the current study, probably due to natural phytochemical variations between plants and/or
378 processing conditions (Patras et al., 2014).

379 For quantitative purposes, the cocoa liquors and chocolates were analyzed by UPLC-HRMS in ESI+ mode
380 and 17 compounds could be quantified, including flavonoids, procyanidins B1 and B2, methylxanthines,
381 and some biogenic amines and amino acids (Table 4). With regard to the cocoa liquors, significantly
382 higher levels of catechin, epicatechin, procyanidin B1 and B2, caffeine, theophylline, serotonin,
383 tryptamine and salsolinol were found in the EC-CL, while luteolin, L-tyrosine and tyramine were more
384 abundant in the WA-CL. Only the levels of quercetin, theobromine and L-tryptophan did not differ
385 significantly. When comparing the levels of the different phytochemicals in the two chocolates, less
386 significant differences were found. Catechin, epicatechin and procyanidin B1 and B2 were more
387 abundant in EC-CH, and L-tyrosine was present in higher levels in WA-CH, which is in correspondence
388 to the results of the cocoa liquors. For the other compounds, however, the differences between the
389 two chocolates were not significant. *N*-oleylethanolamine could be identified in all samples by
390 comparison with the retention time and mass spectrum of the reference compound, but could not be
391 quantified, due to poor linearity of the calibration curve.

392 In general, the phenolic compounds were the most abundant in EC-CL. With regard to the biogenic
393 amines and amino acids, varying results were obtained. For example, L-tyrosine is much more
394 concentrated in the WA samples, and higher levels were also found in these samples for tyramine, but
395 the levels of serotonin and tryptamine, were higher in EC-CL. No general conclusion can be drawn for
396 the differences in the levels of methylxanthine compounds (caffeine, theobromine and theophylline)
397 between the samples from EC and WA. Theobromine levels did not differ significantly, in contrast to
398 caffeine.

399 Quantitative comparison of phytochemicals in cocoa bean processing products with other studies
400 should be performed with caution, as the content is highly dependent on the origin of the beans and
401 the conditions applied during processing (Wollgast and Anklam, 2000). Indeed, the content of
402 polyphenols in cocoa liquor or chocolate is dependent on, among others, the time and/or temperature
403 of heat treatment and the pH value, and depending from the applied conditions, either these
404 compounds can be retained, or a decrease in polyphenolic compounds can occur (Toker et al., 2019;
405 Afoakwa et al., 2008; Sulistyowati and Misnawi, 2008). In the current study, processing of cocoa liquor
406 into chocolate consisted of mixing, refining and conching. The conching was carried out for 2 h at 60 °C,
407 followed by 4 h at 70 °C, which can be considered common conditions in the production of dark
408 chocolate (Toker et al., 2019; Beckett et al., 2009; Afoakwa et al., 2008). The non-volatile compounds
409 were present in lower amounts in CH compared to CL samples. These lower values are mainly caused
410 by a dilution factor introduced by adding other ingredients during the production of the chocolate
411 samples. However, a certain degree of degradation or conversion of the compounds of interest can not
412 be excluded, based on our data.

413 Alañón, Castle,, Siswanto, Cifuentes-Gómez and Spencer (2016) investigated the levels of epicatechin
414 and catechin in 41 commercial milk and dark chocolates. In general, epicatechin is present in higher
415 levels than catechin in cocoa samples, and the levels of both flavan-3-ols decrease during the different
416 processing steps from cocoa bean to chocolate. During these steps, polymerization/condensation to
417 procyanidins takes place, but also the epimerization of (-)-epicatechin to (-)-catechin can occur (Hurst,
418 Krake, Bergmeier, Payne, Miller and Stuart, 2011). As mentioned before, the specific processing
419 conditions will affect the final composition of the cocoa liquors and chocolates, and thus, it is no
420 surprise that Alañón et al. (2016) found highly varying levels of catechin and epicatechin in the different
421 chocolates. The ratio of epicatechin:catechin also varied greatly. Our results showed that epicatechin
422 is present in concentrations three to four times higher than catechin, and this is true for both CL and
423 the CH.

424 With regard to the methylxanthines, the level of caffeine is approximately twice as high in the samples
425 from Ecuador, compared to the samples from West Africa, while theobromine levels did not differ
426 significantly between the same type of samples prepared from cocoa beans of different origin. Zoumas,
427 Kreiser and Martin (1980) reported the levels of theobromine and caffeine in 22 samples of cocoa liquor
428 and found that caffeine levels can vary by a factor 6 to 7, while theobromine levels varied by a factor 2
429 at most. This is in agreement with our finding that the theobromine levels between samples show less
430 variance than the caffeine levels. Various researchers studied the relationship between methylxanthine
431 levels in cocoa beans and cocoa varieties (Carrillo et al., 2014; Brunetto et al., 2008; Davrieux et al.,
432 2005). Given the fact that methylxanthines are rather stable and do not suffer much loss during further
433 processing into cocoa liquors, a comparison of these data with ours seems justified. Typically, cocoa of
434 the Forstero variety shows lower levels of caffeine as such, and higher theobromine/caffeine ratios,
435 compared to Trinitario and Criollo varieties. This is in correspondence to our data, showing that the

436 level of caffeine in the WA samples is about half of the level in the fine-flavor sample. In addition, the
437 ratio of theobromine/caffeine in the cocoa liquor samples was calculated as 4.7:1 for EC-CL and 9.2:1
438 for WA-CL, so the ratio is clearly higher in the bulk cocoa sample.

439

440 Finally, PCA was carried out to obtain more information about the four types of samples and their
441 differences. Two approaches were followed: a targeted one using the results of the quantified
442 compounds, and an untargeted one using the complete UPLC-HRMS data-set. PCA based on the results
443 of the quantified compounds showed a clear distinction between the four types of samples (Figure 3).
444 PC1 explained 90.6% and PC2 8.8% of the total variance. According to the loading plot (Figure 3), the
445 cocoa liquors are characterized by higher levels of theobromine, L-tryptophan, luteolin and quercetin
446 compared to the chocolates. The samples from Ecuador typically contain procyanidin B2 and serotonin
447 in relatively high amounts, while a higher level of L-tyrosine and tyramine is characteristic for the
448 samples of West Africa.

449 The second PCA was carried out after data pre-processing of the raw UPLC-HRMS data with
450 Workfow4Metabolomics. All data between 0 and 24 min were taken into account, but features with
451 >50% missing values were removed. This resulted in a total of >10,000 features, and thus this PCA is
452 based on a much more thorough data-comparison. In this case, PC1 could account for 64.9% of the
453 total variance, PC2 for 4.6% and PC3 for 4.5%. Interestingly, in the score plot of PC1 vs. PC2 (Figure 4),
454 chocolates and cocoa liquors can be easily distinguished, but samples of the same type and of different
455 origin are not clearly separated into different clusters. The division in four distinct clusters is clear
456 though, when PC1 is plotted against PC3. PCA of cocoa samples, based on compounds quantified by
457 GC-MS was carried out before (Cambrai, Marcic, Morville, Houer, Bindler and Marchioni, 2010; Tran et

458 al., 2015). However, this is the first report of PCA, based on the complete dataset resulting from UPLC-
459 HRMS analysis of CL and CH samples. In this case even minor compounds, and/or compounds which
460 could not be identified due to the absence of the corresponding reference compound, or due to the
461 fact that the MS² analysis was not conclusive, are taken into account.

462 Thus, either PCA based on the limited set of quantified compounds, or based on the complete raw
463 dataset, proved to be capable of distinguishing the four samples analyzed in this work. Future
464 research is needed though, to confirm these findings, since only a limited number of samples, which
465 differed strongly, were analyzed here. When choosing for one of the two types of PCA for assessing
466 variance amongst a set of samples, various factors need to be taken into account. For example, in
467 case of using the complete raw dataset, there is no need to analyze the reference compounds and to
468 generate calibration curves. This can save (instrument)time and money, which can be considered an
469 important advantage. However, when using the results of the quantified compounds, it is easier to
470 deduce which compounds are the most distinctive and data pre-processing and –analysis are less
471 complicated. The preferred outcome will define which method is the most appropriate.

472 **4. Conclusion**

473 In this study, cocoa liquor and chocolate, produced with either a bulk cocoa blend of *Theobroma cacao*
474 beans from West Africa or with fine-flavor cocoa beans of the Nacional variety, grown in Ecuador, were
475 analyzed for a wide range of properties. The scope of this study was broader than most researches on
476 cocoa, since a wide range of compounds and characteristics of the samples has been investigated.
477 Volatile and non-volatile constituents were analyzed, both influencing the final flavor of chocolate.

478 Most of the analyses showed clear differences between the West African and Ecuadorian cocoa
479 products. The levels of various compounds were examined by GC-MS and UPLC-HRMS, and in general

480 higher levels of non-volatile phytochemicals were found in the samples produced with the fine-flavor
481 beans originating from Ecuador, compared to those produced with West African beans. In contrast,
482 higher levels of volatile compounds were found in the West African cocoa liquor than in the Ecuadorian
483 cocoa liquor, and the same trend was seen in the chocolates, although less pronounced.

484 The UPLC-HRMS methodology is of added value because of its more extended approach compared to
485 previous analyses of this type of samples. The UPLC analysis with MS² detection allowed for the
486 (tentative) identification of 40 substances. Quantification of both phenolic and non-phenolic
487 compounds was performed. PCA was carried out, using different data-sets, obtained by UPLC-HRMS
488 and GC-MS analysis, thus taking into account not only the major, but also the minor constituents.

489 In summary, in this work an approach is proposed to analyse cocoa samples in order to obtain in-depth
490 knowledge of the composition of the samples, and to carry-out a more thorough comparison between
491 the samples. In future research, this methodology could be applied for distinguishing, and perhaps
492 classifying, a broader range and variety of cocoa samples.

493

494 **Acknowledgements**

495 CD, ADW, JVD, SB and ET carried out the analyses, analyzed the data and contributed to the writing of
496 the manuscript. DC contributed to the data-analysis and revised the manuscript. KF, KM, KD and LP
497 participated in the conception of the study, helped with the interpretation of the data and revised the
498 manuscript. We would like to thank Professor Jenny Ruales from the Escuela Politécnica Nacional in
499 Ecuador for providing the Ecuadorian cocoa liquor. This research did not receive any specific grant from
500 funding agencies in the public, commercial, or not-for-profit sectors.

501

502 **Declaration of competing interest**

503 The authors declare that they have no conflict of interest.

504

505

506 **References**

- 507 1. Afoakwa, E. O., Paterson, A., Fowler, M., Ryan, A., (2008). Flavor Formation and Character in
508 Cocoa and Chocolate : A Critical Review. *Critical Reviews in Food science and Nutrition*, 48(9), 840-
509 857. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/10408390701719272>.
- 510 2. Afoakwa, E.O. (2011). Chocolate Science and Technology (Google eBook). Wiley Blackwell.
511 Retrieved from <http://book.google.com/books?id=404r7yb-618C&pgis=1>
- 512 3. Afoakwa, E.O., Quao, J., Takrama, J., Budu, A.S., Saalia, F.K. (2013). Chemical composition and
513 physical quality characteristics of Ghanaian cocoa beans as affected by pulp pre-conditioning and
514 fermentation. *Journal of Food Science and Technology*, 50(6), 1097-1105.
515 <http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/s13197-011-0446-5>.
- 516 4. Alañón, M.E., Castle, S.M., Siswanto, P.J., Cifuentes-Gómez, T., Spencer, J.P.E. (2016). Assessment
517 of flavanol stereoisomers and caffeine and theobromine content in commercial chocolates. *Food*
518 *chemistry*, 208, 177-184. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.foodchem.2016.03.116>.
- 519 5. Aprotosoiaie, A.C., Luca, S.V., Miron, A. (2016a). Flavor chemistry of cocoa and cocoa products – an
520 overview. *Comprehensive Reviews in Food Science and Food Safety*, 15(1), 73-91.
521 <https://doi.org/10.1111/1541-4337.12180>.
- 522 6. Aprotosoiaie, A.C., Miron, A., Trifan, A., Luca, S.V., Costache, I-I. (2016b). The cardiovascular effects
523 of cocoa polyphenols – an overview. *Diseases*, 4, 39. <https://doi.org/10.3390/diseases4040039>.
- 524 7. Arlorio, M., Locatelli, M., Travaglia, F., Coisson, J.D., Del Grosso, E., Minassi, A., Appendino, G.,
525 Martelli, A. (2008). Roasting impact on the contents of clovamide (N-caffeoyl-L-DOPA) and the
526 antioxidant activity of cocoa beans (*Theobroma cocoa* L.). *Food Chemistry*, 106(3), 967–975.
527 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodchem.2007.07.009>.

- 528 8. Beckett, S.T. (2009). *Industrial chocolate manufacture and use*. (4th ed.). West Sussex (UK):
529 Blackwell Publishing Ltd (Chapter 1, 2 & 6).
- 530 9. Bijttebier, S., Van der Auwera, A., Voorspoels, S., Noten, B., Hermans, N., Pieters, L., Apers, S.
531 (2016). A First step in the quest for the active constituents in *Filipendula ulmaria* (Meadowsweet):
532 comprehensive phytochemical identification by liquid chromatography coupled to quadrupole-
533 orbitrap mass spectrometry. *Planta Medica*, 82(6), 559-72. [https://doi.org/10.1055/s-0042-
534 101943](https://doi.org/10.1055/s-0042-101943).
- 535 10. Brunetto, M.R., Gutierrez, L., Delgado, Y., Gallignani, M., Zambrano, A., Gomez, A., Ramos, G.,
536 Romero, C. (2007). Determination of theobromine, theophylline and caffeine in cocoa samples by
537 a high-performance liquid chromatographic method with on-line sample cleanup in a switching-
538 column system. *Food Chemistry*, 100, 459-467. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodchem.2005.10.007>
- 539 11. Caligiani, A., Palla, L., Acquotti, D., Marseglia, A., Palla, G. (2014). Application of ¹H NMR for the
540 characterisation of cocoa beans of different geographical origins and fermentation levels. *Food*
541 *Chemistry*, 157, 94-99. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodchem.2014.01.116>.
- 542 12. Cambrai, A., Marcic, C., Morville, A., Huer, P.S., Bindler, F., Marchioni E. (2010). Differentiation of
543 chocolates according to the cocoa's geographical origin using chemometrics. *Journal of*
544 *Agricultural and Food Chemistry*, 58(3), 1478-1483. <https://doi.org/10.1021/jf903471e>.
- 545 13. Carrillo, L.C., Londoño-Londoño, J., Gil, A. (2014). Comparison of polyphenol, methylxanthines and
546 antioxidant activity in *Theobroma cacao* beans from different cocoa-growing areas in Colombia.
547 *Food Research International*, 60, 273-280. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodres.2013.06.019>
- 548 14. Codex Standards 141-1983: Standard for cocoa (cacao) mass (cocoa/chocolate liquor) and cocoa
549 cake.
550 Codex Alimentarius 1983, revision 2001.

- 551 15. Counet, C., Callemien, D., Ouwerx, C., Collin, S. (2002). Use of Gas Chromatography – Olfactometry
552 To Identify Key Odorant Compounds in Dark Chocolate . Comparison of Samples before and after
553 Conching. *Journal of Agricultural and Food Chemistry*, 50(8), 2385-2391.
554 <https://doi.org/10.1021/jf0114177>.
- 555 16. Crozier S.J., Hurst W.J. (2014). Cocoa polyphenols and cardiovascular health. In: Ross Watson R.,
556 Preedy V.R., Zibadi S., editors. Polyphenols in human health and disease. Waltham: Academic
557 Press. p. 1077–1082.
- 558 17. Davrieux, F., Assemat, S., Sukha, D.A., Bastianelli, D., Boulanger, R., Cros, E. (2007). Genotype
559 characterization of cocoa into genetic groups through caffeine and theobromine content
560 predicted by near infra red spectroscopy. In : Near infrared spectroscopy : Proceedings of the
561 12th International Conference, Auckland, New Zealand, 9th - 15th April 2005. Burling-Claridge
562 G.R. (ed.), Holroyd S.E. (ed.), Sumner R.M.W. (ed.). NIRCE. Chichester : IM Publications, pp. 382-
563 386. ISBN 978-0-473-11646-0|978-0-473-11746-7
- 564 18. do Carmo Brito, B.N., Chisté, R.C., da Silva Pena, R., Abreu Gloria, M.B., Santos Lopes, A. (2017).
565 Bioactive amines and phenolic compounds in cocoa beans are affected by fermentation. *Food*
566 *Chemistry*, 228, 484-490. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodchem.2017.02.004>.
- 567 19. Frauendorfer, F., Schieberle, P. (2008). Changes in key aroma compounds of Criollo cocoa beans
568 during roasting. *Journal of Agricultural and Food Chemistry*, 56(21), 10244-10251.
569 <https://doi.org/10.1021/jf802098f>.
- 570 20. Hinneh, M., Semanhyia, E., Walle, Van De Walle, D., De Winne, A., Tzompa-Sosa, D. A., Scalone
571 G.L.L., De Meulenaer, B. Messens, K., Van Durme, J. Afoakwa, E.O., De Cooman, L., Dewettinck, K.
572 (2018). Assessing the influence of pod storage on sugar and free amino acid profiles and the

- 573 implications on some Maillard reaction related flavor volatiles in Forastero cocoa beans. *Food*
574 *Research International*, 111, 607–620. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodres.2018.05.064>.
- 575 21. Hinneh, M., Van de Walle, D., Tzompa-Sosa, D.A., De Winne, A., Termote, S., Messens, K., Van
576 Durme, J., Afoakwa, E.O., De Cooman, L., Dewettinck, K. (2019a). Tuning the aroma profiles of
577 FORASTERO cocoa liquors by varying pod storage and bean roasting temperature. *Food Research*
578 *International*, 125, 108550. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodres.2019.108550>.
- 579 22. Hinneh, M., Van de Walle, D., Tsomp-Sosa, D.A., Haeck J., Abotsi, E.E., De Winne, A. Messens, K.
580 Van Durme, J. Afoakwa, E.O., De Cooman, L., Dewettinck, K. (2019b). Comparing flavor profiles of
581 dark chocolates refined with melanger and conched with Stephan mixer in various alternative
582 chocolate production techniques. *European Food Research and Technology*, 245(4), 837-852.
583 <https://doi.org/10.1007/s00217-018-3221-2>.
- 584 23. Hurst, W.J., Krake, S.H., Bergmeier, S.C., Payne, M.J., Miller, K.B., Stuart, D.A. (2011). Impact of
585 fermentation, drying, roasting and Dutch processing on flavan-3-ol stereochemistry in cacao
586 beans and cocoa ingredients. *Chemistry Central Journal*, 5:53. <https://doi.org/10.1021/jf102391q>.
- 587 24. ICCO (2018). ICCO Quarterly Bulletin of Cocoa Statistics, Vol. XLIV, No. 3, Cocoa year 2017/18.
588 Published: 31-08-2018.
- 589 25. Januszewska, R. (2018) Hidden persuaders in cocoa and chocolate, a flavor lexicon for cocoa and
590 chocolate sensory professionals. Woodhead publishing, an imprint of Elsevier.
- 591 26. Kadow, D., Bohlmann, J., Philips, W., Lieberei, R. (2013). Identification of main fine flavor
592 components in two genotype of the cocoa tree (*Theobroma cacao* L.). *Journal of Applied Botany*
593 *and Food Quality*, 86(1), 90-98. <https://doi.org/10.5073/JABFQ.2013.086.013>.

- 594 27. Kothe, L. (2013). Analyse technologisch bedingter Veränderungen phenolischer Verbindungen in
595 Kakao und Kakaoprodukten mit LC-MS und Kapillarelektrophorese. PhD thesis, Rheinischen
596 Friedrich-Wilhelms-Universität Bonn.
- 597 28. Luna, F., Crouzillat, D., Cirou, L., Buchelli, P. (2002). Chemical composition and flavour of Ecuadorian
598 cocoa liquor. *Journal of Agricultural and Food Chemistry*, 50(12), 3527-3532.
599 <https://doi.org/10.1021/jf0116597>.
- 600 29. Mencherini, T., Campone, L., Piccinelli, A.L., García, Mesa M., Dulce Armenteros, D.M., Aquino,
601 R.P., Rastrelli, L. (2013). HPLC-PDA-MS and NMR characterization of a hydroalcoholic extract of
602 *Citrus aurantium* L. var. *amara* peel with antiedematogenic activity. *Journal of Agricultural and*
603 *Food Chemistry*, 61 (8), 1686–1693. <https://doi.org/10.1021/jf302815t>.
- 604 30. Natsume, M., Osakabe, N., Yamagishi, M., Takizawa, T., Nakamura, T., Miyatake, H., Hatano, T.,
605 Yoshida, T. (2000). Analyses of polyphenols in cacao liquor, cocoa and chocolate by normal-phase
606 and reversed-phase HPLC. *Bioscience, Biotechnology and Biochemistry*, 64 (12), 2581-2587.
607 <https://doi.org/10.1271/bbb.64.2581>.
- 608 31. Oracz, J., Nebesny, E. (2014) Influence of roasting conditions on the biogenic amine content in
609 cocoa beans of different *Theobroma cacao* cultivars. *Food Research International*, 55, 1-10.
610 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodres.2013.10.032>.
- 611 32. Owusu, M., Petersen, M. A., & Heimdal, H. (2011). Effect of fermentation method , roasting and
612 conching conditions on the aroma volatiles of dark chocolate. *Journal of food processing and*
613 *preservation*, 36(5), 446–456. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1745-4549.2011.00602.x>.
- 614 33. Patras, M.A., Milev, B.P., Vrancken, G., Kuhnert, N. (2014). Identification of novel cocoa flavonoids
615 from raw fermented cocoa beans by HPLC–MSⁿ. *Food Research International*, 63, 353–359.
616 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodres.2014.05.031>.

- 617 34. Rottiers, H., Tzompa Sosa, D.A., Van de Vyver, L., Hinneh, M., Everaert, H., De Wever, J., Messens,
618 K., Dewettinck, K. (2018). Discrimination of cocoa liquors based on their odor fingerprint: a fast
619 GC electronic nose suitability study. *Food Analytical Methods*, 12(2), 475-488.
620 <https://doi.org/10.1007/s12161-018-1379-7>.
- 621 35. Rottiers, H., Tzompa Sosa, D.A., De Winne, A., Ruales, J., De Clippeleer, J., De Leersnyder, I., De
622 Wever, J., Everaert, H., Messens, K., Dewettinck, K. (2019). Dynamics of volatile compounds and
623 flavor precursors during spontaneous fermentation of fine flavor Trinitario cocoa beans. *European*
624 *Food Research and Technology*, <https://doi.org/10.1007/s00217-019-03307-y>.
- 625 36. Sulistyowati, M., Misnawi, J. (2008). Effects of alkali concentration and conching temperature on
626 antioxidant activity and physical properties of chocolate. *International Food Research Journal*,
627 15(3), 297-304.
- 628 37. Toker, O.S., Palabiyik, I., Konar, N. (2019). Chocolate quality and conching. *Trends in Food Science &*
629 *Technology*, 91, 446-453. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tifs.2019.07.047>.
- 630 38. Torres-Moreno, M., Torrescasana, E., Salas-Salvadó, J., Blanch, C. (2015). Nutritional composition
631 and fatty acids profile in cocoa beans and chocolates with different geographical origin and
632 processing conditions. *Food Chemistry*, 166, 125-132.
633 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodchem.2014.05.141>.
- 634 39. Tran, P.D., Van de Walle, D., De Clercq, N., De Winne, A., Kadow, D., Lieberei, R., Messens, K.,
635 Tran, D.N., Dewettinck, K., Van Durme, J. (2015). Assessing cocoa aroma quality by multiple
636 analytical approaches. *Food Research International*, 77, 657-669.
637 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodres.2015.09.019>.
- 638 40. Tran, P. D., Van Durme, J., Van De Walle, D., De Winne, A., Delbaere, C., De Clercq, N., Phan,
639 T.T.Q., Nguyen, C.P., Tran, D.N., Dewettinck, K. (2016). Quality attributes of dark chocolate

- 640 produced from Vietnamese cocoa liquors. *Journal of Food Quality*, 39 (4), 311–322.
641 <https://doi.org/10.1111/jfq.12200>.
- 642 41. Tuenter, E., Foubert, K., Pieters, L. (2018). Mood components in cocoa and chocolate: the mood
643 pyramid. *Planta Medica*, 84(12/13), 839-844. <https://doi.org/10.1055/a-0588-5534>.
- 644 42. Van Durme, J., Ingels, I., De Winne A. (2016). Inline roasting hyphenated with gas
645 chromatography-mass spectrometry as an innovative approach for assessment of cocoa
646 fermentation quality and aroma formation potential. *Food chemistry*, 205, 66-72.
647 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodchem.2016.03.004>.
- 648 43. van Gemert, L.J. (2011). Odour thresholds: Compilations of odour threshold values in air, water
649 and other media. Den Haag: Oliemans Punter & Partners BV, Nederland.
- 650 44. Wollgast, J, Anklam, E. (2000). Review on polyphenols in *Theobroma cacao*: changes in
651 composition during the manufacture of chocolate and methodology for identification and
652 quantification. *Food Research International*, 33, 423-447. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0963-](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0963-9969(00)00068-5)
653 [9969\(00\)00068-5](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0963-9969(00)00068-5).
- 654 45. Zoumas ,B.L., Kreiser, R., Martin, R.A. (1980). Theobromine and caffeine content of chocolate
655 products. *Journal of Food Science*, 45, 314-316. [https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1365-](https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1365-2621.1980.tb02603.x)
656 [2621.1980.tb02603.x](https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1365-2621.1980.tb02603.x).

657

658 **Figure captions**

659

660 Figure 1. PCA-score plot of volatile components in cocoa liquors (CL) and chocolates (CH) of
661 Ecuador (EC) and West Africa (WA).

662

663 Figure 2. PCA-loading plot of odor-active volatile components in cocoa liquors (CL) and
664 chocolates (CH) of Ecuador (EC) and West Africa (WA).

665

666 Figure 3. PCA-score plot (left) and loading plot (right) of quantified non-volatile components in
667 cocoa liquor (CL) and chocolates (CH) of Ecuador (EC) and West Africa (WA).

668

669 Figure 4. PCA-score plots of non-volatile components in cocoa liquor (CL) and chocolates (CH)
670 of Ecuador (EC) and West Africa (WA).

671

672 **Table 1.** Nutritional composition of the cocoa liquors (CL) from Ecuador (EC) and West Africa (WA).

Proximates (g/100 g)	EC-CL	WA-CL
Moisture	1.13 (1.09, 1.19)	1.35 (1.28, 1.45)
Fat	54.8 (54.7, 54.8)	55.0 (54.9, 55.2)
Protein	15.6 (15.4, 15.8)	14.7 (14.6, 14.8)
Total dietary fiber	14.1 (13.7, 14.4)	19.8 (19.3, 20.3)
Ash	2.8 (2.8, 2.9)	3.3 (3.2, 3.3)

673

Table 2. Semi-quantitative concentrations measured by HS-SPME GC-MS (expressed as ng/g undecane equivalents) of aroma volatiles identified in cocoa liquors (CL) and chocolates (CH) of Ecuador (EC) and West Africa (WA). Data are mean \pm SD ($n = 3$). KI = Kovats retention index, exp = experimental, lit = literature.

	EC-CL	WA-CL	EC-CH	WA-CH	KI (exp)	KI (lit)*
Acids						
Acetic acid	13.06·10 ³ b \pm 0.98·10 ³	33.7·10 ³ a \pm 2.2·10 ³	5.07·10 ³ c \pm 0.96·10 ³	6.5·10 ³ c \pm 1.1·10 ³	1418	1404 - 1477
Butyric acid	n.d.	89 ^a \pm 11	n.d.	n.d.	1604	1607 - 1663
3-Methylbutyric acid	n.d.	1,02·10 ³ a \pm 0.20·10 ³	n.d.	n.d.	1634	1624 - 1665
Alcohols						
Ethanol	350 ^a \pm 50	53.3 ^b \pm 7.9	70.4 ^b \pm 8.8	14.8 ^b \pm 3.2	949	929 - 959
Isobutanol	22.7 ^a \pm 4.1	n.d.	6.1 ^b \pm 0.9	n.d.	1087	1054 - 1125
2-Pentanol	95 ^b \pm 14	210 ^a \pm 13	n.d.	n.d.	1121	1118
2-Methyl-1-butanol	19.4 ^b \pm 2.3	28.8 ^a \pm 4.4	6.4 ^c \pm 1.2	n.d.	1208	
3-Methyl-1-butanol	83.2 ^a \pm 8.3	85.1 ^a \pm 7.9	24.8 ^b \pm 3.6	n.d.	1219	1205 - 1247
2-Heptanol	249 ^b \pm 40	361 ^a \pm 31	22.4 ^c \pm 2.9	6.4 ^c \pm 0.6	1330	1273 - 1332
2,3-Butanediol	1.30·10 ³ b \pm 0.13·10 ³	4.33·10 ³ a \pm 0.44·10 ³	553 ^c \pm 92	0.99·10 ³ b,c \pm 0.15·10 ³	1516	1492 - 1582
1,3-Butanediol	1.09·10 ³ b \pm 0.10·10 ³	2.30·10 ³ a \pm 0.14·10 ³	488 ^c \pm 88	470 ^c \pm 83	1546	1566 - 1600
1-Phenylethanol	28.3 ^b \pm 3.6	95.4 ^a \pm 5.0	5.7 ^c \pm 0.4	6.5 ^c \pm 0.7	1723	
2-Phenylethanol	1.39·10 ³ a \pm 0.23·10 ³	1.75·10 ³ a \pm 0.11·10 ³	323 ^b \pm 28	184 ^b \pm 20	1810	1837 - 1927
Benzyl alcohol	59.5 ^b \pm 5.5	124 ^a \pm 18	71.7 ^b \pm 5.7	79.8 ^b \pm 7.2	1840	1837 - 1864
Aldehydes						
2-Methylpropanal	31.6 ^b \pm 2.3	93.4 ^a \pm 7.6	13.2 ^c \pm 1.2	14.3 ^c \pm 2.5	814	611 - 834
2-Methylbutanal	27.3 ^b \pm 5.7	115.5 ^a \pm 0.8	7.9 ^c \pm 1.6	10.2 ^c \pm 1.8	935	864 - 936
3-Methylbutanal	132 ^b \pm 12	593 ^a \pm 25	64 ^c \pm 11	88 ^{b,c} \pm 16	937	912 - 936
Hexanal	34.9 ^b \pm 4.4	63.1 ^a \pm 6.5	26.4 ^b \pm 1.5	28.4 ^b \pm 2.7	1068	1059 - 1089
5-Methyl-2-isopropyl-2-hexenal	n.d.	217 ^a \pm 16	n.d.	n.d.	1374	1388
Benzaldehyde	215 ^b \pm 18	1.58·10 ³ a \pm 0.15·10 ³	99 ^b \pm 13	275 ^b \pm 29	1499	1470 - 1568
2-Phenyl-2-butenal	17.2 ^b \pm 3.1	244 ^a \pm 18	10.1 ^b \pm 1.6	19.4 ^b \pm 1.9	1862	1872 - 1965
5-Methyl-2-phenyl-2-hexenal	12.2 ^b \pm 2.3	118.0 ^a \pm 9.4	4.1 ^b \pm 0.5	8.9 ^b \pm 1.3	2038	2024 - 2083
Esters						
Methyl acetate	21.6 ^b \pm 1.5	88 ^a \pm 11	7.1 ^b \pm 2.6	7.2 ^b \pm 2.0	888	828 - 864
Pentyl acetate	n.d.	247 ^a \pm 16	n.d.	n.d.	1052	1050 - 1080
2-Methylbutyl acetate	n.d.	130.6 ^a \pm 2.2	n.d.	n.d.	1097	1055 - 1147
3-Methylbutyl acetate	n.d.	7.1·10 ² a \pm 1.2·10 ²	n.d.	n.d.	1109	1100 - 1117
Heptyl acetate	32.7 ^b \pm 3.2	112.7 ^a \pm 9.9	n.d.	n.d.	1278	1250 - 1266

	EC-CL	WA-CL	EC-CH	WA-CH	KI (exp)	KI (lit)*
Ethyl isobutanoate	n.d.	108.1 ^a ± 4.1	n.d.	n.d.	1588	
4-Ethylphenyl acetate	26.1 ^b ± 2.6	95.3 ^a ± 7.7	n.d.	n.d.	1700	1724
2-Phenylethyl acetate	74.7 ^b ± 8.4	533 ^a ± 50	28.6 ^b ± 2.1	53.3 ^b ± 4.4	1757	1771 - 1821
Butyl benzoate	71 ^b ± 11	160.2 ^a ± 9.3	22.5 ^c ± 2.2	22.3 ^c ± 2.4	1808	1839
Ketones						
2-Butanone	n.d.	87.5 ^a ± 2.3	n.d.	n.d.	930	917 - 950
2,3-Butanedione	30.5 ^b ± 4.3	68.0 ^a ± 8.5	29.6 ^b ± 3.8	n.d.	975	970 - 984
2-Heptanone	72 ^b ± 14	156.8 ^a ± 5.3	13.4 ^c ± 1.9	6.0 ^c ± 0.7	1170	1160 - 1181
1-Hydroxy-2-propanone	72.1 ^b ± 5.6	173 ^a ± 14	25.9 ^c ± 4.3	29.5 ^c ± 3.1	1296	1300 - 1323
3-Hydroxy-2-butanone	190 ^a ± 19	260 ^a ± 53	n.d.	n.d.	1274	1250 - 1295
2-Nonanone	124 ^b ± 11	434 ^a ± 41	27.8 ^c ± 2.7	28.8 ^c ± 1.0	1388	1347 - 1420
Acetophenone	71.2 ^b ± 6.7	3.6·10 ² ^a ± 1.5·10 ²	16.0 ^b ± 1.0	15.7 ^b ± 4.6	1623	1600 - 1655
Pyrazines						
Methylpyrazine	38.3 ^b ± 3.4	236 ^a ± 17	31.0 ^b ± 2.2	37.1 ^b ± 5.7	1266	1235 - 1312
2,5-Dimethylpyrazine	28.6 ^b ± 2.9	532 ^a ± 43	11.1 ^b ± 0.4	30.9 ^b ± 5.2	1323	1290 - 1358
2,6-Dimethylpyrazine	21.7 ^b ± 2.1	493 ^a ± 49	11.6 ^b ± 3.5	22.2 ^b ± 3.0	1328	1300 - 1370
2,3-Dimethylpyrazine	27.2 ^b ± 7.5	301 ^a ± 19	15.8 ^b ± 2.3	20.5 ^b ± 0.7	1346	1315 - 1344
2-Ethyl-6-methylpyrazine	10.2 ^b ± 0.6	217 ^a ± 19	n.d.	9.1 ^b ± 0.4	1376	1381 - 1415
2-Ethyl-5-methylpyrazine	12.3 ^b ± 1.4	233 ^a ± 20	n.d.	13.2 ^b ± 1.2	1384	1386 - 1453
2-Ethyl-3-methylpyrazine	n.d.	88 ^a ± 16	n.d.	7.4 ^b ± 1.2	1392	1397 - 1414
2,3,5-Trimethylpyrazine	57.8 ^b ± 3.9	1.59·10 ³ ^a ± 0.18·10 ³	18.2 ^b ± 1.6	41.0 ^b ± 5.4	1404	1381 - 1413
3-Ethyl-2,5-dimethylpyrazine	n.d.	3.6·10 ² ^a ± 1.1·10 ²	n.d.	n.d.	1465	
2,3-Dimethyl-5-ethylpyrazine	20.9 ^b ± 1.6	4.1·10 ² ^a ± 1.4·10 ²	n.d.	n.d.	1468	1445 - 1493
Tetramethylpyrazine	53.3 ^b ± 4.8	4.67·10 ³ ^a ± 0.50·10 ³	67.3 ^b ± 5.6	156 ^b ± 18	1472	1438 - 1474
2,3,5-Trimethyl-6-ethylpyrazine	n.d.	229.6 ^a ± 30.9	n.d.	12.9 ^b ± 2.6	1498	
Furans, furanones, lactones, pyrans, pyrroles						
2-Pentylfuran	24.6 ^b ± 2.3	148.5 ^a ± 9.4	23.8 ^b ± 2.1	24.4 ^b ± 1.9	1228	1193 - 1265
2-Methyl-tetrahydro-3-furanone	10.2 ^b ± 1.8	66.4 ^a ± 6.3	3.9 ^b ± 0.3	7.0 ^b ± 0.4	1257	
γ-Butyrolactone	357 ^a ± 29	408 ^a ± 50	152 ^b ± 20	92 ^b ± 13	1564	1595 - 1673
2-Furanmethanol	103.4 ^b ± 7.8	388 ^a ± 42	37.3 ^c ± 4.6	72.7 ^{b,c} ± 8.9	1633	1614 - 1669
2-Acetylpyrrole	54.4 ^b ± 7.6	379 ^a ± 32	19.4 ^b ± 1.9	60.8 ^b ± 7.0	1951	1930 - 2020
2-Formylpyrrole	24.9 ^b ± 6.5	100 ^a ± 23	12.1 ^b ± 0.5	27.7 ^b ± 4.7	1984	2028 - 2048
2-Pyrrolidinone	56 ^b ± 15	130.5 ^a ± 6.0	17.4 ^c ± 1.0	26.9 ^c ± 6.9	2004	1988 - 2019
2,3-Dihydro-3,5-dihydroxy-6-methyl-4H-pyran-4-one	97 ^b ± 35	381 ^a ± 39	27.3 ^b ± 2.3	54 ^b ± 18	2166	2211
Terpenes						
α-Pinene	53.7 ^a ± 7.8	35.5 ^b ± 0.6	n.d.	n.d.	993	
δ-3-Carene	70 ^a ± 13	33.6 ^b ± 4.9	11.5 ^c ± 0.8	n.d.	1136	

	EC-CL	WA-CL	EC-CH	WA-CH	KI (exp)	KI (lit)*
β -Myrcene	18.1 ^b \pm 0.4	272 ^a \pm 11	n.d.	n.d.	1159	1145 - 1180
Limonene	72.9 ^a \pm 7.4	73.4 ^a \pm 7.3	70.6 ^a \pm 2.5	73.6 ^a \pm 9.0	1189	
trans- β -Ocimene	34.3 ^b \pm 5.3	284 ^a \pm 21	n.d.	n.d.	1241	1225 - 1252
Linalool	146 ^b \pm 16	473 ^a \pm 50	20.2 ^c \pm 2.3	23.8 ^c \pm 2.8	1518	1500 - 1537
cis-Linalool oxide	45.1 ^b \pm 3.3	275 ^a \pm 78	n.d.	n.d.	1431	1423 - 1468
trans-Linalool oxide	15.3 ^b \pm 0.9	84 ^a \pm 20	n.d.	n.d.	1456	1451 - 1453
Others						
Dimethyltrisulfide	n.d.	47.5 ^a \pm 1.3	n.d.	n.d.	1357	1377
Grand total	20,394^b \pm 1,610	63,801^a \pm 4,542	7,592^c \pm 1,281	9,673^c \pm 1,552		

* KI(lit) sourced from webbook.nist.gov or pherobase.com. n.d. = not detected. Different superscripts in a row point out significant differences ($p < 0.05$).

Table 3. Odor Activity Values (OAVs) of aroma components in cocoa liquor (CL) and chocolates (CH) of Ecuador (EC) and West Africa (WA). Data are mean \pm SD ($n = 3$).

Chemical group	Chemical component	OTV* (ng/g)	Odor Activity Value				Odor description**
			EC-CL	WA-CL	EC-CH	WA-CH	
Acids	Acetic acid	124	105.3 ^b \pm 7.9	271.6 ^a \pm 17.8	40.9 ^c \pm 7.7	52.4 ^c \pm 9.1	sour, vinegar
	3-Methylbutyric acid	22	n.d.	46.3 ^a \pm 9.2	n.d.	n.d.	acidic, overripe fruit
Alcohols	2-Heptanol	10	24.9 ^b \pm 4.0	36.1 ^a \pm 3.1	2.2 ^c \pm 0.3	0.6 ^c \pm 0.1	fruity, citrus, herbal
	2-Phenylethanol	211	6.6 ^a \pm 1.1	8.3 ^a \pm 0.5	1.5 ^b \pm 0.1	0.9 ^b \pm 0.1	honey, rummy, floral
Aldehydes	2-Methylpropanal	3.4	9.3 ^b \pm 0.7	27.5 ^a \pm 2.2	3.9 ^c \pm 0.4	4.2 ^c \pm 0.7	(un)roasted cocoa,malty
	2-Methylbutanal	2.2	12.4 ^b \pm 2.6	52.5 ^a \pm 0.4	3.6 ^c \pm 0.7	4.7 ^c \pm 0.8	(un)roasted cocoa,malty
	3-Methylbutanal	5.4	24.4 ^b \pm 2.2	109.8 ^a \pm 4.7	11.9 ^c \pm 2.0	16.2 ^{b,c} \pm 2.9	(un)roasted cocoa,malty
Esters	Benzaldehyde	60	3.6 ^b \pm 0.3	26.3 ^a \pm 2.5	1.7 ^b \pm 0.2	4.6 ^b \pm 0.5	roasted almonds
	Pentyl acetate	13	n.d.	19.0 ^a \pm 1.2	n.d.	n.d.	fruity, orange, tropical
	3-Methylbutyl acetate	9.6	n.d.	73.8 ^a \pm 12.3	n.d.	n.d.	banana
	2-Phenylethyl acetate	137	0.5 ^b \pm 0.1	3.9 ^a \pm 0.4	0.2 ^b \pm 0.0	0.4 ^b \pm 0.0	rose, floral, fruity, honey
Ketones	2,3-Butanedione	4.5	6.8 ^b \pm 1.0	15.1 ^a \pm 1.9	6.6 ^b \pm 0.8	n.d.	buttery
	2-Nonanone	100	1.2 ^b \pm 0.1	4.3 ^a \pm 0.4	0.3 ^c \pm 0.0	0.3 ^c \pm 0.0	milky
Pyrazines	2,3-Dimethylpyrazine	123	0.2 ^b \pm 0.1	2.4 ^a \pm 0.2	0.1 ^b \pm 0.0	0.2 ^b \pm 0.0	caramel, cocoa
	2,3,5-Trimethylpyrazine	290	0.2 ^b \pm 0.0	5.5 ^a \pm 0.6	0.1 ^b \pm 0.0	0.1 ^b \pm 0.0	cocoa, roasted nuts
	3-Ethyl-2,5-dimethylpyrazine	24	n.d.	14.9 ^a \pm 4.6	n.d.	n.d.	caramel, cocoa
	2,3-Dimethyl-5-ethylpyrazine	60	0.3 ^b \pm 0.0	6.8 ^a \pm 2.4	n.d.	n.d.	roasted cocoa
Lactone	γ -Butyrolactone	35	10.2 ^a \pm 0.8	11.7 ^a \pm 1.4	4.4 ^b \pm 0.6	2.6 ^b \pm 0.4	sweet, caramel flavor
Terpenes	β -Myrcene	9.18	2.0 ^b \pm 0.0	29.6 ^a \pm 1.2	n.d.	n.d.	pistachio
	Linalool	37	3.9 ^b \pm 0.4	12.8 ^a \pm 1.4	0.5 ^c \pm 0.1	0.6 ^c \pm 0.1	floral

* OTV, odor threshold value according to van Gemert, 2011; n.d. not detected; **Odor description, according to Januszewska (2018), Kadow, Bohlmann, Philips and Lieberei (2013). Different superscripts in a row point out significant differences ($p < 0.05$).

Table 4. Levels of various compounds in cocoa liquor (CL) and chocolate (CH) from Ecuador (EC) and West Africa (WA). Values are reported in $\mu\text{g}/\text{gram}$ defatted sample. Data are mean \pm SD ($n = 3$).

Compound	EC-CL	WA-CL	EC-CH	WA-CH
Flavan-3-ols				
Catechin	$3.2 \cdot 10^3 \pm 0.2 \cdot 10^3$ ^a	989 ± 20 ^b	$6.610^2 \pm 1.210^2$ ^c	164 ± 15 ^d
Epicatechin	$10.5 \cdot 10^3 \pm 0.4 \cdot 10^3$ ^a	$3.5 \cdot 10^3 \pm 0.2 \cdot 10^3$ ^b	$1.9 \cdot 10^3 \pm 0.2 \cdot 10^3$ ^c	542.3 ± 8.6 ^d
Proanthocyanidins				
Procyanidin B1	639 ± 39 ^a	224.6 ± 7.3 ^b	180 ± 16 ^b	53.0 ± 2.2 ^c
Procyanidin B2	$6.0 \cdot 10^3 \pm 0.2 \cdot 10^3$ ^a	$1.12 \cdot 10^3 \pm 0.03 \cdot 10^3$ ^b	$1.09 \cdot 10^3 \pm 0.08 \cdot 10^3$ ^b	371 ± 13 ^c
Flavonoids				
Apigenin	0.54 ± 0.09 ^a	0.41 ± 0.03 ^a	0.12 ± 0.02 ^b	0.11 ± 0.02 ^b
Naringenin	1.0 ± 0.1 ^a	0.62 ± 0.04 ^b	0.29 ± 0.09 ^c	0.167 ± 0.008 ^c
Luteolin	3.4 ± 0.2 ^b	4.4 ± 0.1 ^a	<LOQ ^a	<LOQ ^a
Quercetin	88.4 ± 7.7 ^a	78.1 ± 3.8 ^a	21.8 ± 3.9 ^b	17.1 ± 0.9 ^b
Methylxanthines				
Caffeine	$33.8 \cdot 10^3 \pm 3.9 \cdot 10^3$ ^a	$17.6 \cdot 10^3 \pm 2.5 \cdot 10^3$ ^b	$9.8 \cdot 10^3 \pm 0.6 \cdot 10^3$ ^c	$4.3 \cdot 10^3 \pm 0.8 \cdot 10^3$ ^c
Theobromine	$159 \cdot 10^3 \pm 17 \cdot 10^3$ ^a	$163 \cdot 10^3 \pm 20 \cdot 10^3$ ^a	$54.5 \cdot 10^3 \pm 2.7 \cdot 10^3$ ^b	$48.2 \cdot 10^3 \pm 7.6 \cdot 10^3$ ^b
Theophylline	13.1 ± 1.8 ^a	7.4 ± 0.2 ^b	2.4 ± 0.1 ^c	<LOQ ^b
Amino acids				
L-Tryptophan	76.6 ± 8.3 ^a	78.1 ± 4.5 ^a	14.6 ± 2.4 ^b	16.0 ± 0.8 ^b
L-Tyrosine	454 ± 15 ^b	$1.15 \cdot 10^3 \pm 0.01 \cdot 10^3$ ^a	134 ± 24 ^d	228 ± 13 ^c
Biogenic amines and related compounds				
Serotonin	68.9 ± 9.1 ^a	12.7 ± 0.9 ^b	11.8 ± 1.6 ^b	2.0 ± 0.1 ^b
Tyramine	9.0 ± 0.3 ^b	12.9 ± 0.4 ^a	2.8 ± 0.8 ^c	3.6 ± 0.5 ^c
Tryptamine	6.6 ± 1.2 ^a	3.1 ± 0.3 ^b	0.77 ± 0.13 ^c	0.38 ± 0.03 ^c
Salsolinol	66.3 ± 7.5 ^a	36.6 ± 2.1 ^b	14.3 ± 1.6 ^c	7.8 ± 0.1 ^c

^aLOQ = 1.2 $\mu\text{g}/\text{g}$, ^b LOQ = 1.8 $\mu\text{g}/\text{g}$. Different superscripts in a row point out significant differences ($p < 0.05$).