

**This item is the archived peer-reviewed author-version of:**

Timing of perineuronal net development in the zebra finch song control system correlates with developmental song learning

**Reference:**

Cornez G., Jonckers Elisabeth, Ter Haar S.M., Van Der Linden Anne-Marie, Cornil C.A., Balthazart J.- Timing of perineuronal net development in the zebra finch song control system correlates with developmental song learning  
Proceedings of the Royal Society B: biological sciences - ISSN 0962-8452 - 285:1883(2018), p. 1-10  
Full text (Publisher's DOI): <https://doi.org/10.1098/RSPB.2018.0849>  
To cite this reference: <http://hdl.handle.net/10067/1527740151162165141>

2 **Revised on June 15, 2018.**

3 **Timing of perineuronal nets development in the zebra finch song control system**  
4 **correlates with developmental song learning**

5  
6  
7 Gilles Cornez<sup>1\*</sup>, Elisabeth Jonckers<sup>2\*</sup>, Sita ter Haar<sup>1</sup>, Annemie VanderLinden<sup>2</sup>, Charlotte A.  
8 Cornil<sup>1</sup> and Jacques Balthazart<sup>1</sup>

9  
10 \* These authors contributed equally to this work

11  
12 <sup>1</sup>GIGA Neuroscience, University of Liege; Liege, Belgium 4000; <sup>2</sup>Bio-imaging lab, University of  
13 Antwerp, Belgium;

14  
15 **Keywords:** Vocal learning, Perineuronal nets, Parvalbumin, Sensitive Period, Song System,  
16 Ontogenesis

17  
18  
19 **Corresponding author:**

20 Jacques Balthazart: GIGA Neurosciences, University of Liege, 15 avenue Hippocrate, B-4000  
21 Liège, Belgium

22 Phone: +32 4 366 59 70 ---Fax: +32 4 366 59 71 --- e-mail: [jbalthazart@ulg.ac.be](mailto:jbalthazart@ulg.ac.be)

33  
34  
35  
36  
37  
38  
39  
40  
41  
42  
43  
44  
45  
46  
47  
48  
49  
50  
51  
52

**ABSTRACT**

The appearance of perineuronal nets (PNN) represents one of the mechanisms that contribute to the closing of sensitive periods for neural plasticity. This relationship has mostly been studied in the ocular dominance model in rodents. Previous studies also indicated that PNN might control neural plasticity in the song control system (SCS) of songbirds. To further elucidate this relationship, we quantified PNN expression and their localization around parvalbumin interneurons at key time-points during ontogeny in both male and female zebra finches and correlated these data with the well-described development of song in this species. We also extended these analyses to the auditory system. The development of PNN during ontogeny correlated with song crystallization although the timing of PNN appearance in the four main telencephalic song control nuclei slightly varied between nuclei in agreement with the established role these nuclei play during song learning. Our data also indicate that very few PNN develop in the secondary auditory forebrain areas even in adult birds, which may allow constant adaptation to a changing acoustic environment by allowing synaptic reorganization during adulthood.

53 **1. Introduction**

54 Learning-related neuroplasticity is expressed at its highest level during ontogeny and supports  
55 progressive shaping of the adult brain. Extensive neurogenesis and synaptic organization take  
56 place during this plastic developmental period and are shaped by the environment. These  
57 neurobiological processes are fundamental for the normal development of brain and behavior  
58 both in humans and animals. At the end of development, neural plasticity and new learning  
59 decrease drastically but the underlying mechanisms involved remain poorly understood.

60 It has been suggested that the appearance of perineuronal nets (PNN) is one of the  
61 mechanisms that contribute to the closing of sensitive periods for neural plasticity and  
62 associated learning<sup>1</sup>. In mammals, an increased PNN expression in the somatosensory visual  
63 cortex correlates with the end of the sensitive period for visual<sup>2-7</sup> and other aspects of  
64 learning<sup>8-10</sup>. These PNN are aggregates of chondroitin sulfate proteoglycan chains (CSPGs)  
65 associated with hyaluronic acid and tenascin R that form a scaffold generally surrounding  
66 GABAergic interneurons expressing the calcium-binding protein parvalbumin (PV)<sup>2,11</sup>. They  
67 develop in an experience-dependent manner at the end of the sensitive period for visual  
68 learning in the visual cortex<sup>6</sup> and constitute a physical barrier precluding new synaptic  
69 contacts<sup>2</sup>. On another hand, the development of PV interneurons is usually marking the onset of  
70 sensitive periods for somatosensory learning, while formation of PNN around them marks the  
71 end of such sensitive periods<sup>2,3</sup>.

72 The song of oscines (songbirds) is learned during development by imitation of a conspecific  
73 tutor, a rare feature only observed in a few groups of mammals (humans, some bats, whales  
74 and elephants) and birds (songbirds, some hummingbirds and parrots)<sup>12</sup>. Vocal learning in  
75 songbirds is associated with sensitive periods for sensory learning (song memorization) and  
76 sensorimotor learning (vocal practice) that finally lead to the crystallization of the mature adult  
77 song<sup>13,14</sup>. The sensorimotor stages of song learning (subsong, plastic song and crystallized  
78 song) correspond to human speech learning progressing from babies' babbling to  
79 grammatically correct language<sup>15-17</sup>.

80 The neural network underlying these processes is analogous if not homologous. In  
81 songbirds, the interconnected brain nuclei involved in song learning and production is called  
82 the song control system. It comprises two main pathways. The vocal motor pathway, which  
83 connects HVC (previously High Vocal Center, now used as a proper name) directly to the  
84 premotor nucleus RA (robustus nucleus of the arcopallium), is similar to the connection  
85 between Broca's area and the laryngeal cortex in humans. HVC and RA are also indirectly  
86 connected through Area X from the basal ganglia and LMAN (lateral magnocellular nucleus of

87 the anterior nidopallium) that form the anterior forebrain pathway (AFP) which corresponds  
88 to the corticostriatal motor loop in humans<sup>18-20</sup>. These functional and anatomical similarities  
89 make songbirds a unique model to study brain mechanisms underlying vocal learning.

90 In zebra finches (*Taeniopygia guttata*), sensory learning (template memorization) takes  
91 place between 25 and 65 days post-hatching (dph)<sup>12,13,16</sup>. Sensorimotor learning starts around  
92 30dph in zebra finches and thus overlaps with sensory learning. At that time, the song is still  
93 variable but it will progressively match the memorized template through a feedback process<sup>15</sup>  
94 to reach around 90 dph a fully mature crystallized song that will remain stable for the rest of  
95 each individual's life.

96 Between hatching and 90 dph the song control nuclei HVC, RA and Area X undergo major  
97 morphological changes including global increases in volume and neuronal size, development of  
98 long distance connections and synaptic reorganization<sup>21,22,23</sup>. LMAN, which directly projects to  
99 RA and modulates song variability, increases in volume until 20dph and then regresses later  
100 on<sup>23</sup>. Sex differences also appear during song learning so that HVC and RA become much bigger  
101 in males than females (Area X is essentially not visible in females)<sup>23,24</sup>. The connections in the  
102 anterior forebrain pathway are established before song production begins but will be refined  
103 during song learning<sup>21</sup>. For example, the connection from LMAN to RA undergoes synaptic  
104 pruning that leads to a topographic reorganization<sup>25</sup> that is probably essential for the  
105 progressive transition from a variable to a crystallized song when the HVC to RA connection is  
106 fully established.

107 It was previously shown that adult male zebra finches have significantly more PNN  
108 especially around PV neurons in HVC and RA than 33 day-old juveniles and this measure in  
109 HVC was positively correlated with song stereotypy. Isolation from tutor song during  
110 development decreased numbers of PNN around PV neurons in HVC<sup>26</sup>. Adult males who sing  
111 proficiently also have more PNN especially around PV neurons in HVC and RA than females  
112 who do not sing<sup>27,28</sup>. Moreover adult male zebra finches who are closed-ended learners have a  
113 higher PNN density in most song control nuclei compared to other songbird species able to  
114 modify their song during adulthood<sup>29</sup>. Together these correlations suggest a causal relationship  
115 between high PNN expression in the song control system and decreased neural and song  
116 plasticity. Nevertheless the specific time-course of PNN development across developmental  
117 song learning is not known. To elucidate this question, we quantified here PNN expression and  
118 their localization around PV interneurons throughout ontogeny (every 10 days from 10 to 60  
119 dph then at 90 and 120 dph) in 4 song control nuclei and 4 auditory nuclei in both male and  
120 female zebra finches and correlated these data with the well-described development of song

121 and of song control nuclei in this species. The results allow us to draw clear links between PNN  
122 in specific brain regions and different aspects of song learning. Specifically, we show that PNN  
123 expression increases markedly in song control nuclei at the end of the sensory phase of vocal  
124 learning ( $\pm 50$ -60 dph) although maximal levels are reached only later during the sensory-  
125 motor phase in a nucleus-specific manner. Sex differences in PNN expression also appear in  
126 parallel in HVC and RA but surprisingly not in area X or LMAN. These data suggest specific roles  
127 of PNN expressed in different song control nuclei in song learning or production.

128

129

## 130 **2. Material and methods**

131

### 132 *(a) Subjects & tissue collection*

133 46 male and 32 female zebra finches (*Taeniopygia guttata*) were raised in a common indoor  
134 aviary containing nesting material, along with their parents and a large group of conspecifics on  
135 a 13L:11D dark/light cycle with food and water *ad libitum*. Brains were collected from 8  
136 developmental ages (10, 20, 30, 40, 50, 60, 90 and 120 dph; 3-6 females and 4-7 males/group;  
137 see figures to determine the actual number of individual data points in each case) after  
138 perfusion under anesthesia (0.5 ml Nembutal™ at 0.6 mg/ml) with phosphate buffer saline  
139 (PBS) followed by paraformaldehyde (4% in PBS). After 24 hours postfixation and  
140 cryoprotection in 30% sucrose in PBS, brains were cut on a cryostat in 30  $\mu$ m coronal sections  
141 that were collected in 6 series of 4 wells.

142

### 143 *(b) Immunohistochemistry*

144 One series from each bird was stained by double-label immunohistochemistry for parvalbumin  
145 and perineuronal nets as previously described<sup>26,28,29</sup>. Free floating sections were incubated in a  
146 mouse monoclonal anti-chondroitin sulfate (1:500) specific for the glycosaminoglycan portion  
147 of the CSPGs that are main components of the PNN and a polyclonal rabbit anti-parvalbumin  
148 (1:1000) and visualized using using Alexa-coupled secondary antibodies (see SI for details).

149 One series generally contained at least 4 sections within each Region Of Interest (ROI).  
150 However, this was not the case for younger birds and some females. For those birds a second  
151 full series was consequently stained to ensure appropriate sampling of all ROIs in most  
152 subjects. Even with this second series of sections, song control nuclei could not be detected in  
153 all subjects at 10 dph, resulting in a smaller number of data point at this age. Sections from the  
154 first series were stained in 3 batches each containing individuals from all age groups to prevent

155 any possible batch effect. Sections for the second series were stained in one batch. No statistical  
156 differences between the 2 staining series could be detected and analysis of data including or  
157 excluding series 2 led to similar statistical results. Only global analyses including all subjects  
158 and sections will thus be presented.

159

#### 160 *(c) PV & PNN quantifications*

161 Staining was bilaterally quantified in the 4 main song control nuclei (HVC, RA, Area X and  
162 LMAN) and in 4 auditory nuclei: CMM (caudomedial mesopallium), NCM (caudomedial  
163 nidopallium), Field L complex that are directly or indirectly connected to HVC<sup>30,31</sup> and in NCC  
164 (caudocentral nidopallium), a multisensory integrative forebrain area processing acoustic  
165 signals and their use in mate choice<sup>32</sup>. Detection of the ROIs was based on the bright PV and/or  
166 PNN staining background of these areas except for NCM & NCC which were located based on  
167 the zebra finch atlas<sup>33</sup>. NCM is a large telencephalic region extending rostro-caudally from the  
168 caudal end of Field L to the caudal edge of the medial telencephalon. NCC is similarly located  
169 but lateral to NCM. In this area, pictures were always taken dorsal to the arcopallium at the  
170 level of RA, between the caudal end of HVC and the rostral end of RA.

171 Photomicrographs were acquired bilaterally, with a Leica fluorescence microscope with  
172 a 40X objective and fixed settings, in 3-4 sections equally spaced in the rostro-caudal axis for  
173 each ROI. The numbers of PV-positive cells (PV), of cells surrounded by PNN (PNN) and of PV-  
174 positive cells surrounded by PNN were counted in all photomicrographs with Image J software  
175 (<https://imagej.nih/ij>) as previously described<sup>34</sup>

176 For each ROI, PV and PNN were quantified as density/mm<sup>2</sup> and as total number/nuclei.  
177 Additionally we calculated the % PV surrounded by PNN (%PVwithPNN) and the % PNN  
178 surrounding PV (%PNNwithPV) (see SI for details). Pictures were also acquired at 5X  
179 magnification (within 1 or 2 full series) for sections containing HVC, RA or Area X to quantify  
180 their volume as previously described<sup>34</sup>.

181 All counting and measurements were done blind to the age and sex of the subjects, except  
182 for Area X that does not exist in females in which counts were obtained in an equivalent area  
183 located at the same neuroanatomical coordinates.

184

#### 185 *(d) Statistics*

186 All data were analyzed independently for each ROI using a 2-Way ANOVA with sex (n=2) and  
187 age (n=8) as independent factors. Significant interactions or age effects were further analyzed  
188 using Tukey post hoc tests. Significance level was set at  $p < 0.05$ . Some statistical tendencies at

189  $p < 0.10$  are also shown when important for data interpretation. Results of all ANOVAs (F and p)  
190 are reported in SI Tables 1 and 2.

191

### 192 **3. Results**

193

#### 194 *(a) Song control nuclei volume*

195 The volume of HVC and RA increased significantly with age and was different between sexes.  
196 Post hoc analysis of the significant sex by age interaction confirmed that the increase appeared  
197 in males only, starting at 40 dph in HVC and 50 dph in RA, with the sex difference appearing at  
198 the same age (see Fig. 1a-b). Similarly, the volume of Area X increased with age in males starting  
199 at 50 dph (see Fig. 1c). The maximum volume was reached at 40 dph in HVC and at 50 dph in  
200 RA and Area X, (see Fig. 1a-b-c), as previously reported<sup>23</sup>.

201

202 

203

#### 204 *(b) PNN increases around PV cells in the vocal motor pathway after the end of sensory learning*

205 In HVC, the density of PNN+ cells increased progressively with age and this increase was  
206 significant from 60 dph until adulthood (90-120dph) in males but not in females (see Fig. 2a).  
207 Similarly, the total number of PNN in the nucleus increased significantly from 60 dph in males  
208 only and the plateau was reached at 90 dph (see Fig. 2e). In both measures, a significant sex  
209 difference was present from 60 till 120 dph (see Fig. 2a and 2e). In RA, a similar pattern of  
210 progressive PNN increase (density and number/nuclei) was detected in males but the  
211 significant sex difference appeared at 90 dph only (see Fig. 2b and f).

212 In parallel, we observed a significant drop of the density of PV+ cells in HVC and RA after  
213 10 dph (see Fig. 3a-b). However, the total number of PV+ cells in the entire nucleus was not  
214 affected by age in HVC (see Fig. 3e) and it was significantly increased from 50 dph on in the RA  
215 of males only (see Fig. 3f). In HVC, whereas females had overall a higher density of PV+ cells,  
216 males had a higher number of PV in the entire nucleus (see Fig. 3a-e). This opposite sex  
217 difference relates to the large sex difference in the volume of this nucleus appearing around 40  
218 dph. In RA, no sex difference was detected in the density of PV+ cells but males had also more  
219 PV than females in the entire nucleus (see Fig. 3b-f).

220 Interestingly the percentage of PV cells surrounded by PNN increased following a  
221 pattern very similar to the increase of PNN density and number/nuclei in both HVC and RA. In  
222 HVC, this percentage was significantly increased from 60 until 120 dph (see SI Fig. 1a), while in



223 RA, the increase was significant from 60 until 90 dph but no longer at 120dph (see SI Fig. 1b).  
224 This suggests that, in the vocal motor pathway of males, a large amount of PNN starts  
225 developing specifically around PV+ interneurons when the sensory learning period ends and  
226 these PNN continue to increase until the end of the sensorimotor period (90 dph) when PNN  
227 density, PNN/nuclei and the percentage of PV+ neurons with PNN reach a plateau.

228

229 Insert figure 2 about here

230

231 *(c) PNN development in the anterior forebrain pathway*

232 In Area X and LMAN the density of PNN increased with age in both males and females starting  
233 at 60 dph in Area X (see Fig. 2c) and at 50 dph in LMAN (see Fig. 2d). Interestingly, no sex  
234 difference was detected in Area X or LMAN despite the fact that Area X is not visible in females  
235 and counts were made in an anatomically equivalent area. It should also be noted that the  
236 average density of PNN in LMAN of males already reached a level similar to 50-60 dph at 30-40  
237 dph (see Fig. 2d), which was not the case for females. This is probably why the statistical  
238 significance of the age effect (in the absence of a significant interaction) appeared only at 50  
239 dph when both males and females reached the same level of PNN density. In Area X, the total  
240 number of PNN also increased with age in males but the effect only became significant at 90  
241 dph only (see Fig. 2g). Total numbers of PNN could not be calculated for the female Area X nor  
242 for LMAN in both sexes since because boundaries of these ROI could not be delineated.

243 As seen in HVC and RA, the density of PV+ cells dropped significantly after 10 dph in  
244 Area X and LMAN (see Fig. 3c-d). Interestingly, whereas the PV density remained stable at later  
245 ages in HVC, RA and Area X, it increased significantly in LMAN at 90 dph and even further at  
246 120 dph. The total number of PV+ cells in the Area X of males followed a different pattern with  
247 a main effect of age essentially due to the 50 dph males that had more PV than 10 dph males  
248 (see Fig. 3g). The percentage of PV surrounded by PNN in Area X also increased with age, but  
249 the effect became significant only at 90 dph (see SI Fig. 1c) i.e., when the total number of PNN  
250 increased. In LMAN a progressive increase in this measure was present but the percentage was  
251 significantly different only between the 60 and 120 dph birds versus the 20 dph birds (a  
252 tendency was nevertheless observed at 90 dph:  $p=0.0506$ ).

253 As in HVC and RA, the PNN density, total PNN/nuclei and percentage of PV neurons  
254 surrounded with PNN in the anterior forebrain pathway were thus increasing with age but in  
255 both males and females instead of males only, and the PNN development seemed to occur  
256 earlier in LMAN (especially in males). Nevertheless, as in the vocal motor pathway, PNN

257 development starts near the end of the sensitive period for sensory learning and takes place  
258 mostly during the sensorimotor period for song learning.

259

260 *(d) The percentage of PNN located around PV+ interneurons varies between sexes*

261 In HVC and RA, the percentage of PNN surrounding PV was not affected by age but differed  
262 between sexes. Overall the majority of PNN were located around PV cells and this localization  
263 was more prominent in males than in females (HVC: 79% vs. 61%; RA: 85% vs. 49%)(see SI Fig.  
264 2a-b). In contrast, in Area X, a higher proportion of PNN were surrounding PV in females (72%)  
265 than in males (50%) (see SI Fig. 2c). In LMAN there was no sex difference affecting this  
266 percentage but it was lower at earlier ages (10-20 dph) and significantly higher at 120dph  
267 (73%) compared to 20 dph birds (see SI Fig. 2d). Taken together, these data indicate that PNN  
268 stabilize the connectivity of different cell types (PV-positive and others) depending on the sex  
269 and the nucleus considered but this association with different cell types does not change with  
270 age except in LMAN.

271

272 Insert figure 3 about here

273

274 *(e) PNN and PV expression in auditory nuclei during development*

275 Overall, the density of PNN in the auditory nuclei CMM, NCM and NCC was very low compared  
276 to densities observed in the four main song control nuclei. In the majority of birds, the density  
277 was smaller than 20 PNN/mm<sup>2</sup> and the mean of each group rarely exceed 10 PNN/mm<sup>2</sup> (see SI  
278 Fig. 3b-c-d). This density was ten times higher in HVC and RA and five times higher in Area X  
279 and LMAN in adult males. The PNN density in these three nuclei did not change as a function of  
280 age or sex (see SI Fig. 3b-c-d) nor did the percentage of PV+ cells surrounded by PNN (see SI  
281 Fig. 1f-g-h). PNN in CMM, NCM and NCC are thus unlikely involved in the song crystallization  
282 process. In contrast, a high density of PNN was found in Field L and it significantly increased  
283 with age (see SI Fig. 3a for detail of post-hoc tests comparing ages). As observed in Area X and  
284 LMAN, this increase occurred in both males and females.

285 The densities of PV+ cells in CMM, NCM and NCC were comparable to the densities  
286 observed in song control nuclei and they were significantly affected by the sex of the subjects.  
287 Females had a slightly higher PV density in CMM and NCM (see SI Fig. 4b-c, only in older ages in  
288 the latter case, there was a significant interaction of sex by age) whereas males had slightly  
289 more PV in NCC (see SI Fig. 4d). This density of PV cells also increased with age in NCM (120  
290 dph had more PV/mm<sup>2</sup> than 10-50 dph birds; SI Fig. 4c) and CMM in which 10 dph had fewer

291 PV/mm<sup>2</sup> than all the other age groups (see SI Fig. 4b). In NCM, the interaction showed that this  
292 age effect was partly due to 120 dph females who had a significantly higher PV density than-20-  
293 60 dph males (statistics not shown in the graph). The low density of PNN in these nuclei was  
294 reflected in the percentage of PV surrounded by PNN that was lower than 3% in most groups  
295 and was not affected by age or sex (see SI Fig. 1f-g-h).

296 The density of PV+ cells was also affected by age in Field L essentially because it was  
297 much higher at 10 dph than in all older age groups (see SI Fig. 4a). Note however that in the  
298 brain of 10 dph birds Field L was not clearly discernable as it is in older birds. We therefore  
299 quantified photomicrographs taken at the same location within the telencephalon but  
300 corresponding results should be taken cautiously. Counts at 10 dph could relate to another  
301 adjacent area. Even ignoring the 10 dph data, the percentage of PV neurons with PNN increased  
302 with age in parallel to the PNN density reaching maximal levels around 50 dph (see SI Fig. 1e  
303 for detail of post-hoc tests) in the absence of any sex difference.

304

#### 305 **4. Discussion**

306 This study demonstrates that in the four main song control nuclei PNN and their localization  
307 around PV interneurons generally start increasing around 50-60 dph, an age that corresponds  
308 to the end of the sensory phase of vocal learning when the tutor song has been memorized. The  
309 maximum PNN expression is reached later at an age that varies between nuclei. A sex  
310 difference in PNN expression and/or colocalization with PV also develops starting at 60 dph in  
311 HVC and RA that are involved in song production, but not in Area X and LMAN that play a role  
312 in song learning and variability.

313 A similar pattern of changes with age was observed in the auditory Field L but increases  
314 were observed earlier (first increase at 30 dph and plateau at 50 dph) and were not associated  
315 with a sex difference. Surprisingly, however, in the other telencephalic auditory areas, few PNN  
316 were detected and their density did not change as a function of age suggesting that these nuclei  
317 possibly retain their plasticity in adulthood.

318

319 *(a) PNN increase in the motor pathway corresponds to the end of the sensorimotor sensitive*  
320 *period and song crystallization*

321 In HVC and RA, the largest increase in PNN expression started at the end of the sensitive period  
322 for sensory learning (60 dph) and reached a plateau at the end of the sensorimotor learning  
323 period (90 dph). This temporal pattern is consistent with a role of PNN in song crystallization.  
324 As the majority of PNN are located around GABAergic inhibitory interneurons expressing PV<sup>35</sup>

325 and PNN are known to increase fast spiking activity of these neurons<sup>36,37</sup>, song crystallization  
326 could result from an increased inhibition within HVC, resulting in a decreased synaptic  
327 plasticity<sup>2</sup>. A higher neural inhibition in HVC indeed correlates with song stability in adult zebra  
328 finches<sup>38</sup>. In RA the density of PNN and the percentage of PV neurons with PNN followed a  
329 similar pattern of increase although absolute numbers were smaller and the peak observed at  
330 90 dph was followed by a small (non-significant) decrease at 120 dph. The PNN density and the  
331 percentage of PV neurons with PNN were thus maximal at 90 dph in both HVC and RA  
332 suggesting a clear link between PNN in these nuclei and song crystallization that is completed  
333 at 90 dph..

334 In both HVC and RA, males had a higher proportion of PNN around PV-interneurons  
335 (more than 80%) than females (60% in HVC, 50% in RA). In the female HVC and RA, PNN thus  
336 develop around different neuronal types or around interneurons expressing different calcium-  
337 binding proteins such as calretinin or calbindin. It is nevertheless likely that PNN are expressed  
338 mainly around GABAergic interneurons as shown in mammals<sup>37,39</sup>. Together with the higher  
339 density of PNN in males, this suggests a differential role of PNN in the vocal motor pathway of  
340 the two sexes in relation with the fact that females do not sing and only produce calls<sup>12</sup>.

341

342 *(b) PNN increase in the AFP corresponds to the progressive decrease of song variability during the*  
343 *sensorimotor period*

344 In agreement with previously published studies on adult zebra finches<sup>27,28</sup>, no sex difference in  
345 the PNN density could be detected in Area X and LMAN throughout development. This is  
346 particularly surprising for Area X since this nucleus is not visible in Nissl-stained sections of  
347 females and quantification was made here in the corresponding part of the basal ganglia. In  
348 males, Area X was discernible based on a higher background staining for PV and a higher  
349 density of PNN compared to the rest of the basal ganglia. These differences were not clearly  
350 visible in females although PV background density tended to be higher in the lateral part of the  
351 basal ganglia (but no shape reminiscent of Area X was detectable) and PNN density tended to  
352 be higher in the female "Area X" than in the rest of the basal ganglia. It should be noted that an  
353 anterograde and retrograde tract-tracing study published in poster form demonstrated that  
354 HVC in female zebra finches projects to a clearly defined cluster of cells in the basal ganglia  
355 (Shaughnessy D.W., Flores D., Moore L., Bertram R., Wu W., Hyson R.L. & Johnson F. 2016. Brain  
356 connectivity not to blame for a sex difference in singing behavior of zebra finches. Abstract  
357 629.04/AAA23, Society for Neuroscience, San Diego CA). A functional Area X might thus exist  
358 in females also.

359 PNN density increased significantly starting at 60 dph in Area X and 50 dph in LMAN but  
360 these changes were similar in both sexes. Here again, the beginning of this rise corresponds to  
361 the end of the sensory learning period (60 dph) but it is not followed by any major changes  
362 later in development contrary to what is observed in the motor pathway. However, the AFP has  
363 never been associated with song memorization. Moreover the total number of PNN in Area X  
364 continued to increase after 60 dph, in relation to the global increase in volume of the nucleus, to  
365 reach a plateau at 90 dph at end of the sensorimotor period. The development of PNN in the  
366 AFP is consequently more likely related to the sensorimotor than to the sensory learning stage.

367 Knowing that a) LMAN plays a key role in vocal learning at early stages of sensorimotor  
368 learning<sup>21,40</sup>, b) song variability<sup>13</sup> is highest between 30 and 60 dph<sup>41</sup>, c) LMAN volume  
369 decreases between 20 and 50 dph in male zebra finches and no change occurs later<sup>23</sup> and d)  
370 LMAN lesions between 55 and 65 dph are less effective in disturbing song production than  
371 lesions performed between 35 and 50 dph<sup>42</sup>, it is interesting that this is the nucleus where the  
372 increase in PNN density occurred at the earliest age (around 50 dph or maybe even earlier in  
373 males). A large (though not significant, possibly due to the large number of comparisons)  
374 increase of the average PNN density (4x) and of the percentage of PV neurons with PNN (5.5x)  
375 takes place between 20 and 30dph in the LMAN of males specifically. These measures remain  
376 relatively constant afterwards, whereas they only increase after 50 dph in females to reach  
377 male levels. This early increase of PNN in LMAN of males was not observed in Area X.

378 This specific timing of PNN development in LMAN and Area X suggests a delay between  
379 the synaptic maturation of these two nuclei in males only. Area X sends inhibitory projections  
380 into DLM which in turn sends excitatory projections to LMAN<sup>13</sup>. LMAN is known to induce song  
381 variability through its connectivity with RA<sup>43</sup>. LMAN activity could thus be stabilized early (30  
382 dph) by the development of PNN in males to control the firing of the LMAN-RA projection  
383 neurons during a period of high song variability (30-50 dph). The subsequent development of  
384 PNN around PV interneurons in Area X would then progressively inhibit the excitatory action of  
385 DLM on LMAN, in turn decreasing its activity and thus song variability when the song becomes  
386 completely stereotyped. This scenario is consistent with the fact that, in males, the percentage  
387 of PNN neurons around PV in Area X (50%) and LMAN (56%) is much lower than in HVC (79%)  
388 and RA (85%) indicating that in the AFP a large portion of PNN potentially develop around  
389 neurons that are not expressing PV and are eventually projection neurons. Furthermore, PV  
390 positive cells can also be projection neurons<sup>44</sup>.

391

392 *(c) Role of PNN in the auditory nuclei*

393 We observed an early increase of PNN density and of the percentage of PV neurons with PNN in  
394 Field L between 10 and 30 dph. This increased expression of PNN in Field L occurs during the  
395 early steps of song memorization. Field L, as the mammalian primary auditory cortex, relays  
396 the auditory information directly to HVC but also to CMM and NCM<sup>31</sup>. This brain region is  
397 however processing all kinds of auditory stimuli besides species-specific vocalizations and it is  
398 difficult to imagine that plasticity in this area should decrease with age. The absence of sex  
399 differences in Field L is however in agreement with the fact that both males and females need  
400 to be able to discriminate male songs.

401 In the other auditory nuclei, the density of PNN was much lower (PNN density peak in  
402 males: CMM: 16.6/mm<sup>2</sup>, NCM: 7.2/mm<sup>2</sup>, NCC: 6.8/mm<sup>2</sup>) as previously observed in adult male  
403 starlings<sup>34</sup> and adult male and female canaries (unpublished data from our lab). Moreover, the  
404 density of PNN was not affected by age or sex in these regions. Either synaptic plasticity in  
405 these auditory forebrain areas is controlled by other mechanisms or it is surprisingly retained  
406 in adulthood. CMM and NCM are thought to be involved in song perception and decoding<sup>31</sup> and  
407 NCM could, in addition together with the vocal pathway, contain (in part) the memory of the  
408 tutor song template<sup>46</sup>. Neurons in both Field L, CMM and NCM respond selectively to the  
409 species-specific songs during development<sup>47-50</sup> but CMM and NCM neurons respond in a non-  
410 predictable manner and this response continuously evolves with the acoustic environment  
411 even in adulthood which is not the case for Field L<sup>51-54</sup>. The relative absence of PNN in the NCM  
412 and CMM may consequently allow constant adaptation of adult zebra finches to a changing  
413 acoustic environment by providing a larger possibility of synaptic reorganization.

414

#### 415 *(e) Conclusions*

416 We demonstrate here sex-specific and age-specific changes in the expression of PNN and of PV  
417 interneurons in the song control nuclei and auditory areas of developing zebra finches that  
418 display temporal relationships with the sensory and sensorimotor phases of song development.  
419 The differences observed between nuclei suggest that each nucleus has its own timing of  
420 connectivity stabilization (sensitive period?) during which it plays one key role in the vocal  
421 learning process. These correlations raise a number of important questions. One type of  
422 question concern the role of PNN in song learning. Are they slowing down or inhibiting the  
423 learning process? Are they implicated in the crystallization of song? Are different nuclei  
424 differentially affected as a function of their role in song acquisition and production as suggested  
425 by differences in the temporal patterns of expression? The other type of questions relates to the  
426 mechanisms controlling PNN formation. Do they develop directly in response to physiological,

427 in particular hormonal, changes that take place as the bird ages or are they the consequence of  
428 changes in the vocal behavior that would feedback on the underlying brain structures?

429 We previously showed that the density of PNN is lower in open-ended learner species  
430 that are still able to modify their song in adulthood (canaries, starlings) than in closed-ended  
431 learner species such as the zebra finch that crystallize a song when reaching adulthood and will  
432 no longer change it during the rest of their life. This suggests that PNN development might  
433 relate to song crystallization and the developmental patterns identified here are consistent  
434 with this view. The functional significance of these correlations should now be tested by causal  
435 manipulations, in particular experiments that would experimentally dissolve the PNN in  
436 specific brain regions and assess whether this would result in a regain of behavioral plasticity  
437 as previously shown in a number of experimental models in mammals. An initial attempt  
438 published only as a poster obtained mixed results: application of chondroitinase ABC dissolved  
439 the PNN in HVC but no clear modification of song structure was detected in males kept in  
440 acoustic isolation. However, in males maintained with a female after PNN dissolution, song  
441 became more plastic: song duration decreased, some syllables were lost while others were  
442 added (Best B.J., Day N.F., Larson G.T., Carels V.M. & Nicks T.A. 2011. Vocal effects of  
443 perineuronal net destruction in adult zebra finch. 303.18/XX51, Society for Neuroscience,  
444 Washington DC). We also observed some alterations of song in male canaries following  
445 application of chondroitinase ABC over HVC (Cornez G., Cornil C.A. & Balthazart J, unpublished  
446 data). Future work will have to better characterize these changes in vocal production and  
447 learning in order to assign a specific role to PNN in each song control nuclei. The age- and  
448 nuclei-specific changes described here will clearly help formulating specific hypotheses and  
449 testing them.

450

451

452 *Ethics.* All experimental procedures were in agreement with the Belgian laws on animal  
453 experimentation and had been approved by the local Animal Care Committee (Commission  
454 d’Ethique de l’Utilisation des Animaux d’Expérience de l’Université de Liège; Protocol number  
455 1396).

456

457 Data accessibility.

458 All data raw data are available for review at [datadryad.org](https://datadryad.org) (doi:10.5061/dryad.515n9k9)

459

460

461 Authors' contributions. G.C., S.t.H, AVdL and J.B designed the study, G.C., E.J., and S.t.H. collected  
462 the data, G.C, E.J and J.B. analyzed the data, G.C. and E.J. wrote the initial draft of the paper that  
463 was edited by AVdL, C.A.C and J.B.

464  
465 Competing interests. We declare no competing interests.

466  
467 Funding. This work was supported by a grant from the Interuniversity Attraction Pole (IAP  
468 P7/17) to AVdL, CAC & JB. CAC is FRS-FNRS Senior Research Associate and GC is Research  
469 Fellow of the FRS-FNRS. EJ is a FWO postdoctoral research fellow.

470  
471 Acknowledgments. We thank Sander Raymaekers from the Laboratory of Comparative  
472 Endocrinology, Biology department, KU Leuven, Belgium (headed by Veerle Darras) for  
473 providing a few additional brain sections to complete our sampling.

474



475 **Figure legends**

476

477 Figure 1: HVC (a), RA (b) and Area X (c) volumes of males (blue) and females (red) across ages  
478 10-120 dph. Results of the ANOVAs are summarized in the insets. If a significant sex by age  
479 interaction was detected, significant sex differences within age groups as determined by Tukey  
480 post hoc tests are shown as follows: \* $p < 0.05$ , \*\* $p < 0.01$ , \*\*\* $p < 0.001$ , (\*) $p < 0.10$ . Letters indicate  
481 significant ( $p < 0.05$ ) age differences within males only as follows: a=different from 10-40 dph,  
482 b= different from 10-30 dph, c= different from 10-20 dph, d= different from 10 dph. Bars  
483 represent means  $\pm$  SEM but all individual values are also plotted.

484

485 Figure 2: PNN density (left; a-d) and number/nuclei (right; e-g) in the song control system of  
486 males (blue) and females (red) across ages 10-120 dph. Statistical results of the ANOVA are  
487 summarized in the insets. If a significant sex by age interaction was detected, significant sex  
488 differences within age groups as determined by Tukey post hoc tests are shown as follows:  
489 \* $p < 0.05$ , \*\* $p < 0.01$ , \*\*\* $p < 0.001$ , (\*) $p < 0.10$ . Letters indicate significant ( $p < 0.05$ ) age differences  
490 within males only (when interaction is significant) or among all birds (when a main effect of  
491 age without interaction is found) as follows: a= different from 10-60 dph, b= different from 10-  
492 50 dph, c= different from 10-40 dph, d= different from 10-30 dph, e= different from 10 dph, f=  
493 different from 20 dph (f). Panel h shows representative photomicrographs of PV+PNN double  
494 staining in HVC of an adult male (upper left), a 20 dph males (down left), an adult female (down  
495 right) and higher magnification of a PV cell surrounded by PNN in the adult male. Bars  
496 represent means  $\pm$  SEM but all individual values are also plotted.

497

498 Figure 3: PV density (left; a-d) and number/nuclei (right; e-g) in the song control system of  
499 males (blue) and females (red) across ages 10-120 dph. Statistical results of the ANOVA are  
500 summarized in the insets. If a significant sex by age interaction was detected, significant sex  
501 differences within age groups as determined by Tukey post hoc tests are shown as follows:  
502 \* $p < 0.05$ , \*\* $p < 0.01$ , \*\*\* $p < 0.001$ , (\*) $p < 0.10$ . Letters indicate significant ( $p < 0.05$ ) age differences  
503 within males only (when interaction is significant) or among all birds (when a main effect of  
504 age without interaction is found) as follows: a= different from 20-120 dph, b= different from  
505 20-90 dph, c= different from 20-60 dph, d= different from 50-120 dph, e= different from 10  
506 dph, f= different from 20 dph, g= different from 90 dph. Panel h shows representative  
507 photomicrographs of PV+PNN double staining in RA of an adult male (upper left), a 20 dph  
508 males (down left), an adult female (down right) and higher magnification of a PV cell

509 surrounded by PNN in the adult male. Bars represent means  $\pm$  SEM but all individual values are  
510 also plotted.

511

512

514 **References**

- 515 1. Celio, M. R., Spreafico, R., De Biasi, S. & Vitellaro-Zuccarello, L. Perineuronal nets: Past and  
516 present. *Trends Neurosci.* **21**, 510–515 (1998).
- 517 2. Karetko, M. & Skangiel-Kramska, J. Diverse functions of perineuronal nets. *Acta*  
518 *Neurobiol. Exp. (Wars)*. **69**, 564–577 (2009).
- 519 3. Wang, D. & Fawcett, J. The perineuronal net and the control of cns plasticity. *Cell Tissue*  
520 *Res.* **349**, 147–160 (2012).
- 521 4. Liu, H. *et al.* Expression of perineuronal nets, parvalbumin and protein tyrosine  
522 phosphatase  $\sigma$  in the rat visual cortex during development and after BFD. *Curr. Eye Res.*  
523 **38**, 1083–94 (2013).
- 524 5. Pizzorusso, T. *et al.* Reactivation of ocular dominance plasticity in the adult visual cortex.  
525 *Science* **298**, 1248–51 (2002).
- 526 6. Ye, Q. & Miao, Q. long. Experience-dependent development of perineuronal nets and  
527 chondroitin sulfate proteoglycan receptors in mouse visual cortex. *Matrix Biol.* **32**, 352–  
528 363 (2013).
- 529 7. Vorobyov, V., Kwok, J. C. F., Fawcett, J. W. & Sengpiel, F. Effects of digesting chondroitin  
530 sulfate proteoglycans on plasticity in cat primary visual cortex. *J. Neurosci.* **33**, 234–43  
531 (2013).
- 532 8. Gogolla, N., Caroni, P., Luthi, A. & Herry, C. Perineuronal nets protect fear memories from  
533 erasure. *Science (80-. )*. **325**, 1258–1261 (2009).
- 534 9. Happel, M. F. K. *et al.* Enhanced cognitive flexibility in reversal learning induced by  
535 removal of the extracellular matrix in auditory cortex. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. U. S. A.* **111**,  
536 2800–5 (2014).
- 537 10. Slaker, M. *et al.* Removal of Perineuronal Nets in the Medial Prefrontal Cortex Impairs the  
538 Acquisition and Reconsolidation of a Cocaine-Induced Conditioned Place Preference  
539 Memory. *J. Neurosci.* **35**, 4190–4202 (2015).
- 540 11. Deepa, S. S. *et al.* Composition of perineuronal net extracellular matrix in rat brain: A  
541 different disaccharide composition for the net-associated proteoglycans. *J. Biol. Chem.*  
542 **281**, 17789–17800 (2006).
- 543 12. Williams, H. Birdsong and singing behavior. *Ann N Y Acad Sci* **1016**, 1–30 (2004).
- 544 13. Mooney, R. Neural mechanisms for learned birdsong. *Learn. Mem.* **16**, 655–69 (2009).
- 545 14. Brenowitz, E. A. Plasticity of the adult avian song control system. *Ann N Y Acad Sci* **1016**,  
546 560–585 (2004).
- 547 15. Brainard, M. S. & Doupe, A. J. Auditory feedback in learning and maintenance of vocal  
548 behaviour. *Nat Rev Neurosci* **1**, 31–40. (2000).
- 549 16. Brainard, M. S. & Doupe, A. J. What songbirds teach us about learning. *Nat. Insight Rev.*  
550 **417**, 351–358 (2002).
- 551 17. Doupe, A. J. & Kuhl, P. K. Birdsong and human speech: Common themes and mechanisms.  
552 *Annu.Rev.Neurosci.* **22**, 567–631 (1999).
- 553 18. Pfenning, A. R. *et al.* Convergent transcriptional specializations in the brains of humans  
554 and song-learning birds. *Science* **346**, 1256846 (2014).
- 555 19. Jarvis, E. D. Learned birdsong and the neurobiology of human language. *Ann N Y Acad Sci*  
556 **1016**, 749–777 (2004).
- 557 20. Doupe, A. J. & Kuhl, P. K. Bird Song and Human Speech: Common Themes and  
558 Mechanisms. *Annu. Rev. Neurosci.* **22**, 567–631 (1999).
- 559 21. Bottjer, S. W. & Arnold, A. P. Developmental plasticity in neural circuits for a learned  
560 behavior. *Annu.Rev.Neurosci.* **20**, 459–481 (1997).
- 561 22. Bottjer, S. W. & Johnson, F. Matters of life and death in the songbird forebrain. *Journal of*  
562 *Neurobiology* **23**, 1172–1191 (1992).

- 563 23. Nixdorf-Bergweiler, B. E. Divergent and parallel development in volume sizes of  
564 telencephalic song nuclei in male and female zebra finches. *J.Comp.Neurol.* **375**, 445–456  
565 (1996).
- 566 24. Bottjer, S. W., Glaesner, S. L. & Arnold, A. P. Ontogeny of brain nuclei controlling song  
567 learning and behavior in zebra finches. *J.Neurosci.* **5**, 1556–1562 (1985).
- 568 25. Miller-Sims, V. C. & Bottjer, S. W. Auditory experience refines cortico-basal ganglia inputs  
569 to motor cortex via remapping of single axons during vocal learning in zebra finches. *J.*  
570 *Neurophysiol.* **107**, 1142–1156 (2012).
- 571 26. Balmer, T. S., Carels, V. M., Frisch, J. L. & Nick, T. A. Modulation of perineuronal nets and  
572 parvalbumin with developmental song learning. *J Neurosci* **29**, 12878–12885 (2009).
- 573 27. Meyer, C. A., Boroda, E. & Nick, T. A. Sexually dimorphic perineuronal net expression in  
574 the songbird. *Basal Ganglia* **3**, 229–237 (2014).
- 575 28. Cornez, G., Ter Haar, S. M., Cornil, C. A. & Balthazart, J. Anatomically discrete sex  
576 differences in neuroplasticity in zebra finches as reflected by perineuronal nets. *PLoS One*  
577 **10**, (2015).
- 578 29. Cornez, G. *et al.* Perineuronal nets and vocal plasticity in songbirds: A proposed  
579 mechanism to explain the difference between closed-ended and open-ended learning.  
580 *Dev. Neurobiol.* **77**, 975–994 (2017).
- 581 30. Vates, G. E., Broome, B. M., Mello, C. V & Nottebohm, F. Auditory pathways of caudal  
582 telencephalon and their relation to the song system of adult male zebra finches  
583 (*Taenopygia guttata*). *J.Comp.Neurol.* **366**, 613–642 (1996).
- 584 31. Woolley, S. M. N. Early experience shapes vocal neural coding and perception in  
585 songbirds. *Dev. Psychobiol.* **54**, 612–631 (2012).
- 586 32. Van Ruijssevelt, L. *et al.* fMRI Reveals a Novel Region for Evaluating Acoustic Information  
587 for Mate Choice in a Female Songbird. *Curr. Biol.* 1–11 (2018).  
588 doi:10.1016/j.cub.2018.01.048
- 589 33. Karten, H. J. *et al.* Digital atlas of the zebra finch (*Taeniopygia guttata*) brain: A high-  
590 resolution photo atlas. *J. Comp. Neurol.* **521**, 3702–3715 (2013).
- 591 34. Cornez, G. *et al.* Perineuronal Nets and Vocal Plasticity in Songbirds: A Proposed  
592 Mechanism to Explain the Difference Between Closed-Ended and Open-Ended Learning.  
593 **0**, 1–21 (2017).
- 594 35. Pinaud, R. & Mello, C. V. GABA immunoreactivity in auditory and song control brain areas  
595 of zebra finches. *J. Chem. Neuroanat.* **34**, 1–21 (2007).
- 596 36. Hu, H., Gan, J. & Jonas, P. Interneurons. Fast-spiking, parvalbumin<sup>+</sup> GABAergic  
597 interneurons: from cellular design to microcircuit function. *Science* **345**, 1255263  
598 (2014).
- 599 37. Morris, N. P. & Henderson, Z. Perineuronal nets ensheath fast spiking, parvalbumin-  
600 immunoreactive neurons in the medial septum/diagonal band complex. *Eur. J. Neurosci.*  
601 **12**, 828–838 (2000).
- 602 38. Liberti, W. A. *et al.* Unstable neurons underlie a stable learned behavior. *Nat. Neurosci.*  
603 **19**, 1665–1671 (2016).
- 604 39. Wintergerst, E. S., Faissner, A. & Celio, M. R. The proteoglycan DSD-1-PG occurs in  
605 perineuronal nets around parvalbumin-immunoreactive interneurons of the rat cerebral  
606 cortex. *Int. J. Dev. Neurosci.* **14**, 249–255 (1996).
- 607 40. Brainard, M. S. Contributions of the anterior forebrain pathway to vocal plasticity. *Ann N*  
608 *Y Acad Sci* **1016**, 377–394 (2004).
- 609 41. Bottjer, S. W., Glaessner, S. L. & Arnold, a P. Ontogeny of brain nuclei controlling song  
610 learning and behavior in zebra finches. *J. Neurosci.* **5**, 1556–1562 (1985).
- 611 42. Bottjer, S. W., Miesner, E. A. & Arnold, A. P. Forebrain lesions disrupt development but  
612 not maintenance of song in passerine birds. *Science (80-. )*. **224**, 901–903 (1984).
- 613 43. Boettiger, C. A. & Doupe, A. J. Intrinsic and thalamic excitatory inputs onto songbird

614 LMAN neurons differ in their pharmacological and temporal properties. *J. Neurophysiol.*  
615 **79(5)**, 2615–2628 (1998).

616 44. Martin Wild, J., Williams, M. N. & Suthers, R. A. Parvalbumin-positive projection neurons  
617 characterise the vocal premotor pathway in male, but not female, zebra finches. *Brain*  
618 *Res.* **917**, 235–252 (2001).

619 45. Scotto-Lomassese, S., Rochefort, C., Nshdejan, A. & Scharff, C. HVC interneurons are not  
620 renewed in adult male zebra finches. *Eur J Neurosci* **25**, 1663–1668 (2007).

621 46. Gobes, S. M. H. & Bolhuis, J. J. Birdsong Memory: A Neural Dissociation between Song  
622 Recognition and Production. *Curr. Biol.* **17**, 789–793 (2007).

623 47. Grace, J. A., Amin, N., Singh, N. C. & Theunissen, F. E. Selectivity for conspecific song in the  
624 zebra finch auditory forebrain. *J Neurophysiol* **89**, 472–487 (2003).

625 48. Mello, C. V & Clayton, D. F. Song-induced ZENK gene expression in auditory pathways of  
626 songbird brain and its relation to the song control system. *J. Neurosci.* **14**, 6652–6666  
627 (1994).

628 49. Mello, C. V, Vicario, D. S. & Clayton, D. F. Song presentation induces gene expression in the  
629 songbird forebrain. *Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A* **89**, 6818–6822 (1992).

630 50. Stripling, R., Kruse, A. A. & Clayton, D. F. Development of song responses in the zebra  
631 finch caudomedial neostriatum: Role of genomic and electrophysiological activities. *J*  
632 *Neurobiol* **48**, 163–180 (2001).

633 51. Mello, C., Nottebohm, F. & Clayton, D. Repeated exposure to one song leads to a rapid and  
634 persistent decline in an immediate early gene's response to that song in zebra finch  
635 telencephalon. *J. Neurosci.* **15**, 6919–6925 (1995).

636 52. Chew, S. J., Mello, C., Nottebohm, F., Jarvis, E. D. & Vicario, D. S. Decrements in auditory  
637 responses to a repeated conspecific song are long-lasting and require two periods of  
638 protein synthesis in the songbird forebrain. *PNAS* **92**, 3406–3410 (1995).

639 53. Gentner, T. Q. & Margoliash, D. Neuronal populations and single cells representing  
640 learned auditory objects. *Nature* **424**, 669–674 (2003).

641 54. Thompson, J. V. & Gentner, T. Q. Song Recognition Learning and Stimulus-Specific  
642 Weakening of Neural Responses in the Avian Auditory Forebrain. *J. Neurophysiol.* **103**,  
643 1785–1797 (2010).

644