

# This item is the archived peer-reviewed author-version of:

Underground dreams. Uncertainty, risk and anticipation in the gold production network

## **Reference:**

Geenen Sara.- Underground dreams. Uncertainty, risk and anticipation in the gold production netw ork Geoforum - ISSN 0016-7185 - 91(2018), p. 30-38 Full text (Publisher's DOI): https://doi.org/10.1016/J.GEOFORUM.2018.02.019 To cite this reference: https://hdl.handle.net/10067/1494430151162165141

uantwerpen.be

Institutional repository IRUA

- 1 This is the author copy. When citing, please refer to
- 2 Geenen, S. 2018. Underground dreams. Uncertainty, risk and anticipation in the gold
- 3 production network. Geoforum 91: 30-38.
- 4

7

# 5 Underground dreams. Uncertainty, risk and anticipation in the gold

6 production network

## 8 Sara Geenen

- 9 Institute of Development Policy (IOB), University of Antwerp
- 10 Research Foundation Flanders (FWO)
- 11

12 Abstract: Gold, precious yet painstakingly extracted, fuels the dreams of diggers, traders, managers, 13 investors and consumers at the local and the global level. But gold extraction and trade are 14 characterized by much uncertainty, related to the commodity's fixity in the underground, its 15 embeddedness in national states and local institutions and its connections to markets. Focusing on the 16 gold production network in Eastern Democratic Republic of Congo, this article reinforces earlier 17 arguments about risk: first, it operates 'at the intersection of capital and rule'; second, it obscures the 18 uneven distribution of capitalism's negative impact, as well as corporate actors' active role in 19 producing such impact. Moreover, it argues that the production of risk (expected costs) and 20 anticipation (expected gains) by corporate actors conceals and devalues the ways in which other actors 21 in the gold production network deal with the extreme uncertainty that characterizes the market and 22 the institutional environment in which they operate, as well as the resource's materiality. It concludes 23 that an analytical focus on uncertainty, risk and anticipation enhances our understanding of relations 24 and conflicts in the gold production network.

Keywords: gold mining; uncertainty; risk; anticipation; artisanal mining; mining companies; global
 production network (GPN); Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR).

27

### 28 Introduction

During my first visit to an artisanal gold mine in Eastern Democratic Republic of Congo (DRC) I took a picture of two gold miners standing in front of their mine shaft. Above the entrance, a piece of corrugated sheet with the slogan: *Qui cherche, trouve*/Those who seek, shall find. Other shafts were named *Kitumainiya kesho*/Tomorrow's hope<sup>1</sup>, or *Bana Espoir*/They have hope<sup>2</sup>. Seven years later I

33 recorded the words of a village chief in an industrial gold concession in the same region:

- "I was the first to ask my children [the villagers, including artisanal miners who had been
   working on the concession] to leave. They asked me: But how are we going to live? I told them:
- 36 Banro [the multinational mining company operating the concession] will take you as workers.
- They made a lot of promises when they arrived. But they haven't taken them as workers"3.

Banro Corporation is a Canada-based mid-tier gold company operating two concessions in Eastern
 DRC: Twangiza and Namoya. Four months after I recorded the words of the village chief, the company

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Fieldnotes, Mukungwe, 31/05/2012.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Fieldnotes, Kamituga, 09/04/2008.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Interview chief, Namoya, 10/09/2015.

announced it was moving into commercial production in Namoya. About fifteen months later a series
 of violent attacks prompted Banro to evacuate its staff and suspend its operations<sup>4</sup>.

42 This article is about 'underground dreams' – dreams fueled by mineral riches - in a context of profound 43 uncertainty. It is about how people deal with this uncertainty; how they hope, anticipate and fear the 44 future. The case I am presenting is the gold production network. I look at this network, following 45 Henderson et al's (2002: 445) global production network (GPN) approach, as "the nexus of interconnected functions and operations through which [gold] is produced, distributed and 46 47 consumed". The global gold production network involves, among others, artisanal miners, producer 48 organizations, multinational mining companies, traders, refineries, jewelers, consumers, and e-waste 49 workers, but also national and regional economies embedded in concrete socio-political contexts. 50 'Underground dreams' drive all actors in this network: artisanal miners hoping to strike it rich, 51 community members awaiting employment, mining corporations advertising new discoveries to 52 investors, consumers tempted by the promise of wealth, and African governments celebrating mineral-53 led growth. But these dreams can also turn into nightmares: forced displacement, environmental 54 pollution, armed mobilization against large-scale mining, the resource curse.

55 My empirical endeavor is to combine a GPN lens with an in-depth case-study. First of all I want to move 56 beyond the common rigid analytical distinction between the artisanal and industrial production modes 57 in gold mining and consider market actors as well as state actors, but also the resource's materiality 58 itself – which I take from GPN theory. I also frequently refer to global network dynamics. Yet at the 59 same time the issues under study require in-depth qualitative data – hence the case study approach. 60 The case of Eastern DRC is a textbook example of a place where underground dreams turn into 61 nightmares (think about the coltan boom and the role mineral resources played in the 1998-2003 war, 62 Vogel and Raeymaekers, 2016). The region has historically known periods of colonial industrial mining, 63 post-colonial nationalized mining, artisanal mining, militarized mining and neoliberal industrial mining 64 (Geenen, 2015). The current situation is characterized by very high degrees of uncertainty in several 65 domains, including security (continuous presence of armed groups and new armed mobilization), 66 politics (president clinging on to power and an uncertain transition period) and economy (sharp 67 inflation since 2016) (Nyenyezi et al, 2017; Berwouts, 2017). In the mining sector, artisanal and 68 industrial production are in many ways entangled and boundaries – physical as well as legal, social, 69 economic and political – are difficult to draw. Therefore I study the actors and activities involved as 70 part of one gold production network. My analysis is based on a range of interview data, documents 71 and observations, collected during more than 18 months of fieldwork in five different gold mines. I will 72 draw upon the empirical material gathered over the years (2008 to 2015) to illustrate my argument.

73 My argument speaks to the literature on uncertainty, risk and anticipation. Uncertainty is defined as 74 when something is not fixed, not determined, vague, subject to change, ambiguous or dependent on 75 unpredictable factors. It is an inherent feature of life. In this article I show how different actors in the 76 Congolese gold production network deal with the extreme uncertainty that characterizes the market 77 and institutional environment in which they operate, but also the production process and the gold 78 itself. I demonstrate how this shapes practices, norms and relations between people. Corporate actors, 79 however, tend to 'calculate' this uncertainty in terms of expected costs or gains. In doing so, they force 80 other actors to operate under the conditions they set. In making this argument I draw on the existing 81 literature on risk, more particularly the Geoforum articles by Emel and Huber (2008) and Stanley 82 (2013). These authors argue that risk operates at the intersection of capital and rule, masking the 83 uneven distribution of the negative impacts of production as well as capital's active role in producing 84 these impacts. I add that not only 'risk', but also 'anticipation' is produced and used as a mode of rule 85 by corporate actors. If risk is about calculating the probability of costs or losses, anticipation is about 86 measuring and making concrete expected gains. In addition I argue that the production of risk and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Press release, Banro reports incident at its Namoya mine site, 18/05/2017.

anticipation by corporate actors conceals and devalues the way in which other actors in the gold production network deal with uncertainty. Focusing on this helps to better understand network relations, more particularly between mining corporations and local communities. In this sense, this article also speaks to the growing literature on conflicts between artisanal and large-scale mining, company-community conflicts and social mobilization against large-scale mining (Bebbington, 2012; Larmer and Laterza, 2017; Conde and Le Billon, 2017).

In the next section I position these arguments within the literature on risk and anticipation. Section three develops the case of Eastern DRC, analyzing a) how uncertainty shapes practices, norms and relations in the gold production network, b) how risk and anticipation are produced by corporate actors and c) how this is used to mask the uneven distribution of negative impacts as well as corporate actors' active role in producing these. Section four concludes.

98

## 99 Conceptualizing uncertainty, risk and anticipation

100 **Risk** 

101 The uncertainty, unpredictability, unreliability and unknowns of life are generally taken as a given, yet 102 social scientists from disciplines as diverse as psychology, behavioural economics, sociology, 103 anthropology, geography and political economy have all addressed the question how people deal with 104 this. If 'uncertainty' is just a neutral and inherent feature of life, it can have a positive connotation 105 (when we speak of luck or good fortune), or a negative one (when we speak of risk) (Boholm, 2003: 106 167).

In mathematical terms, risk is defined as the "statistical probability of an outcome in combination with 107 108 severity of the effect construed as a 'cost'" (Boholm, 2003: 160). By using sufficient data and statistical 109 models, the likelihood of (un)desired outcomes can be predicted and hence made 'manageable'. 110 Calculated uncertainty in the form of 'risk' thus informs most current prevention or management 111 strategies, for example in environmental (Stanley, 2013) or security governance (Amoore, 2013). Yet 112 psychologists and behavioural economists have since long acknowledged that decision making is not merely informed by rational choice and cost/benefit calculations (Tversky and Kahneman, 1986). 113 114 Moreover, anthropologists have shown that risks are socially and culturally constructed (Alaszewski, 115 2016). Much of this latter research is tributary to Mary Douglas' work (1966; Douglas and Wildawsky, 116 1982) in which she distinguishes between 'danger' (which all societies face) and 'risk' as those dangers 117 societies choose to worry about and respond to through the use of magic and supernatural forces. In 118 the literature on risk in modern societies sociologist Ulrich Beck's (1992) concept of 'risk society' has 119 been most influential. Beck argues that the complex nature of modern industrial development 120 produces more unforeseen (often disastrous) consequences than ever, exposing us to a high level of 121 risk. Although compelling as a notion, the flaw in Beck's argument seems to be the universal, inevitable 122 and almost apocalyptic character that is ascribed to the global market in producing these risks.

123

124 In response to this, critical geographers and political economists have focused their attention on *who* 125 produces these risks and *for what purpose*. Citing Dillon (2008) and Martin (2007) who made the 126 argument in the domain of security studies, Anna Stanley (2013) sees environmental risk as operating 127 at the intersection of capital and rule. It is a knowledge practice

128

"integral to the workings and arrangements of power and legitimacy present in liberal capitalist political economy, as well as a mode of rule onto itself—a technique for enabling, managing, and producing populations, bodies and circumstances that helps to constitute the forms of action associated with liberalism and capitalism" (idem: 7).

133

134 As a knowledge practice, risk also obscures uneven geographies and "accounts for unevenness and 135 dispossession as natural facts of aleatory phenomena" (idem: 13), the lives that become dispossessed, 136 or that bear the most detrimental health effects, being seen as "existence's unlucky numbers" (idem: 137 10). In their Geoforum article on the mining sector, Jody Emel and Matthew Huber (2008) argue that 138 the prevalence given to 'neoliberal risks' (financial and market risks borne by corporations) in contract 139 negotiations leads to a highly uneven distribution of benefits. This is a political decision, prompted by 140 the World Bank pushing African governments to offer attractive fiscal conditions to corporate capital. 141 As Emel and Huber (2008: 1397) put it:

142

"Capital takes risks and it has the numbers to prove it. Meanwhile, those commonly
experienced, but stubbornly unquantifiable and un-price-able, social and ecological risks borne
by local communities are seen as merely the 'externalized' costs of doing business."

146

147 In other words, only capital's expected costs are framed as risks in need of an anticipatory response.
148 The potential social and ecological costs for local communities, which cannot be easily quantified, is
149 not framed as a risk (for those communities), but as an inevitable negative externality.

150 With the burgeoning of risk audit firms and consultancies, the handling of risk itself has become big 151 business (Skinner, 2000). Even more, some forms of risk are seen as positive, an "opportunity for 152 innovation and accumulation that cannot only be managed, but profited on" (Emel and Huber, 2008: 153 1397). As research by Miyakazi (2003; 2006) and Garsten and Hassenström (2003) shows, financial 154 traders build their status by taking and handling risks. Garsten and Hassenström point to the distinction 155 traders make between risks taken while trading (which can be handled), and risks associated with the 156 functioning of the global market (for which they do not believe they are responsible, as per Beck's 157 interpretation). This enables them, for example, to blame 'the market' for the financial crisis. So risk is 158 being produced in ways that are very useful to capital.

159 In brief, risks are objects of political struggles, whereby financially and politically powerful actors get 160 to define what is risky and what not, how and to what extent the risks should be managed, who is 161 accountable and who is to blame. This article positions itself in this view of risk as being politically 162 produced.

## 163 Anticipation

164

165 If life is uncertain, unpredictable, unreliable and unknown, imaginations about the future become sites
 166 where dreams or fears can be projected, where hope or doubt can be expressed, where positive or
 167 negative outcomes can be anticipated. For Adams et al (2009: 247) anticipation is

- 168
  169 "the palpable effect of the speculative future on the present. (...) Anticipatory modes enable
  170 the production of possible futures that are lived and felt as inevitable in the present, rendering
  171 hope and fear as important political vectors."
- 172

173 But here too, statistical techniques are being applied in an attempt to manage hope and fear. 174 Probabilities are calculated and prediction models are developed in order to better anticipate. If the 175 production of risk sensitizes individuals and society to the probability of a hazard occurring, 176 anticipation fuels individual and collective dreams of a better future, and makes them concrete. In this 177 article 'underground dreams' refer to the dreams (of a better life, of national development, of soaring 178 profits) that are fuelled by mineral riches. I use the term following Miyakazi's 'Economy of Dreams' 179 (2006) and Cross' 'Dream Zones' (2014). Writing about special economic zones in India, Cross coins 180 such places as dream zones for corporate, political and activist dreams (of growth, market freedom, 181 mass employment or labour struggles), but also for more 'modest' dreams of farmers and workers (of 182 a good life, economic security and social mobility) (idem: 5). In his ethnographic account of Japanese financial traders, Miyakazi demonstrates how global financial trade is not merely shaped by riskcalculation or statistical modelling, but also by individual fantasies about soaring profits.

185

186 In the extractive sector, speculation is the quickest way to earn money as the production process itself 187 is very slow (going from exploration over construction to extraction)<sup>5</sup>. But as the famous Bre-X example 188 has highlighted, speculative dreams may just as quickly turn into nightmares (Tsing, 2004: 56)<sup>6</sup>. New 189 geological findings indeed attract a particular form of speculative capital (Dougerhty, 2011), but also 190 set in motion a whole series of anticipatory practices by governments, civil society, domestic firms and 191 so on. Weszkalnys (2008), Cross (2014), Gleiberman (2016) and Witte (2016) have called this 192 'economies of expectation' or 'economies of anticipation'. Weszkalnys for example describes how 193 constant rumors about the presence of oil in Sao Tomé e Principe set in motion a whole institutional 194 infrastructure designed by the government and international donors to capture and channel the oil 195 rents and to prepare civil society to play a role in transparent governance, although until today, oil has 196 not been discovered in commercially exploitable quantities (McTernan, 2017).

197

198 Expectations may differ considerably between groups in society. Owen and Kemp (2013) describe an 199 'expectations gap' as local communities, governments and companies have diverse expectations of 200 what minerals-led development should look like and how rents should be distributed. But even within 201 communities, governments and companies, individuals have different interests and expectations. Yet 202 at the macro-level governments and policy-makers seem to broadly converge on the potential of the 203 extractive sector to contribute to growth, job creation and development, despite the (governance) 204 challenges ahead (World Bank, 2014). In Africa the discovery of oil reserves (e.g. Ghana's Jubilee Field, 205 the Lake Albert Rift Basin in the DRC/Uganda or Kenya's Turkana region) or natural gas (such as on the 206 coasts of Mozambique and Tanzania) "could transform Africa's place in the global energy economy", 207 as the Africa Progress Panel (2013: 42) suggests. In artisanal and small-scale mining (ASM) on the other 208 hand, discoveries of gold, diamond or coltan deposits have attracted thousands of people to promising 209 sites in very short time spans, recalling the American and Australian gold rushes. Although in the past 210 decade researchers have provided nuanced accounts of the motivations and profiles of people 211 engaging in ASM (Hilson, 2009), gold rushes are seen to be animated by extremely mobile fortune 212 seekers who act on rumours rather than concrete, verified information (Bush, 2009; Jønsson and 213 Bryceson, 2009). The next section empirically illustrates how all these actors navigate a context of 214 uncertainty, driven by underground dreams.

215

## 216 Uncertainty, risk and anticipation in the gold production network

217 Bridge (2008) identifies 'materiality' and 'territoriality' as the two distinguishing features of extractive 218 production networks. Materiality refers to the depth, size and location of the deposit and the quality 219 of the resource. Territoriality relates to the way in which the resource is "embedded in the 220 proprietorial, institutional and cultural-political structures of the nation-state" (idem: 413), what 221 Henderson et al (2002) have called 'territorial embeddedness'. In what follows I use this GPN lens to 222 structure my analysis. Next to markets and states, I also consider 'the underground' as an important 223 space where the resource's materiality is formed, and from where this materiality shapes above-224 ground relations. So although markets, states and the underground are obviously all part of, and 225 connected, in the gold production network, I segregate them here for the sake of empirical clarity.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Here I am inspired by Gavin Bridge's keynote speech at the Conference on Extraction and Exclusion, University of Oxford, 19 October 2017.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> In 1994 Bre-X, a small Canadian junior, announced a major gold find in Kalimantan, Indonesia, sending its stock price to a record height. By 1997 it had become clear that the whole discovery was a fraud and that reports and samples had been falsified. Bre-X came to be known as the biggest scam in the history of mining and paved the way for the introduction of some new regulations.

#### 226 Markets

227 The international gold price (London Gold Fixing) is set twice a day by auction at the London Bullion 228 Market. For investors, gold is an excellent hedge against inflation as it holds or even increases value 229 when the value of the dollar decreases (such as after the 2008 financial crisis, Bloomfield, 2017). Gold 230 also provides a hedge against geopolitical uncertainties and is a safe haven in times of political unrest 231 and instability. Still, the industry frames price fluctuations as one of the most important risks for their 232 operations. Every year Ernst&Young lists the "top-10 business risks facing mining and metals" – the list 233 in itself being an illustration of how risks are framed, calculated and ranked. For 2016-2017, price and 234 currency volatility has been ranked as risk number one for gold miners (Ernst&Young, 2016). The drop 235 in gold prices in 2013 (decline of 27%, which was the commodity's biggest annual decline in 30 years) 236 led to a severe crisis with major gold producers experiencing a USD 20 billion loss in net profits (PWC, 237 2014: 7). According to a PWC survey companies adjusted their expectations with respect to future 238 price evolutions and accordingly, the estimations of their reserves' value (PWC, 2013: 5). Not 239 surprisingly, PWC's (Price Waterhouse Coopers) annual 'global trends in gold mining' report for 2014 240 was titled "Realigning expectations".

241 Major companies responded to this by lowering operation costs and increasing efficiency (PWC, 2014: 242 18). Figures on employment are hard to come by, but evidence from Ghana and South Africa shows 243 that lowering costs also means laying off workers and putting stops on new hires. In South Africa 244 "employment could drop by 43 percent over the next ten years, halving gold mining sector 245 employment to 68.000" (Aboobaker, 2015). In Ghana, young mining engineers reproduced the 246 corporations' discourse about the 'crisis', while several laid off workers returned to artisanal mining<sup>7</sup>. 247 In other words, companies' responses to falling prices and their anticipatory strategies in the face of 248 price-related risks produce new, or increased risks (unemployment) for those people who are directly 249 and indirectly dependent upon them. This is intrinsically related to dynamics in ASM as workers in 250 large-scale mining may shift to small-scale mining and vice versa. Indeed, ASM emerged in some 251 countries during the 1980s as the most viable livelihood activity in the wake of structural adjustment, 252 deteriorating employment opportunities and increasing pressure on land (Hilson, 2011). While the sectoral dynamics in ASM are complex and beyond the scope of this paper (Hilson, 2009; Bryceson and 253 254 Geenen, 2016), they should be seen as structurally linked to large-scale mining (Verbrugge, 2015).

Price volatility also plays a role in local markets for artisanal gold. Local prices are based on the London Gold Fixing, about which miners and traders are generally well-informed thanks to internet and mobile phones. But aside from this, local prices are also influenced by personal relationships and loans given out. Some master traders (based in the regional trade hubs) have easier access to financial capital and can build up a reserve stock of gold, allowing them to play upon fluctuations in the world market price by selling when prices are high<sup>8</sup>. But for most gold traders this is not an option.

Yet aside from price fluctuations, gold traders in the region have to navigate many more uncertainties. I illustrate this by looking at trust and smuggling. For sociologists like Luhmann (1988), trust is a solution for specific problems of risk. It presupposes the incorporation of risk (considering potential losses and gains) in the decision whether or not to interact, based upon information gathered from repeated interaction with a person. But in the Congolese gold network trust has become more generalized, responding to economic and institutional as well as political uncertainties, which go beyond individual

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Figures are hard to come by, but anecdotal evidence suggests that there were many. Fieldnotes, Ghana Western Region, 10-20/04/2015.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> Interview trader, Bukavu, 27/03/2008.

- transactions and cost/benefit analyses. It has become part of the prevailing professional ethic. When
  asked about what qualities a 'good gold trader' should have, a Bukavu based trader declared:
- "We are all men of trust : we give trust, we receive trust and we deserve trust. That is how we
  do our business"<sup>9</sup>.

271 The importance of trust can be related to dysfunctional public services, high amounts of illegal taxes 272 levied by individual state agents, absence of banking systems, bad road conditions and the constant 273 threat of being robbed. In this context trustwothiness appears to be a conditio sine qua non to make a 274 long career in the business, although this does not (at all) mean that cheating and stealing do not 275 occur<sup>10</sup>. But if you work with people 'from the network', as a master trader from Bujumbura (in 276 neighbouring Burundi) insisted, chances of being cheated are slim<sup>11</sup>. This network consists of a whole 277 chain of patron-client relationships, linking master traders in regional centres to small traders in the 278 mines, the latter operating as commission agents who work with the master traders' financial capital 279 (Geenen, 2011). In this way large sums of cash are being transferred, but formal contracts are absent.

280 Up to 98% of artisanally produced gold in Eastern DRC is smuggled across the border to Burundi or 281 Uganda, from where most of it is taken to Dubai and traded for electronic goods, computers and cars. 282 Gold, one of the most important sources of foreign exchange in the DRC, is used here as a hard currency 283 and a hedge against soaring inflation, which was common before 2005 and again since 2015. Smuggling 284 has become part of a wider cross-border political economy, which involves corrupt border officials and 285 clientelistic relations with high-level security people and politicians. The master traders can afford to 286 make costly arrangements with these officials in return for protection. This actually illustrates the point 287 that something is never a risk in itself. If large traders can use their political connections to make sure 288 the risk of confiscation does not apply to them, if they can actively produce the *absence* of such a risk, 289 this means that the *presence* of this risks is also produced, by specific people (border officials, security 290 agents, politicians) for specific people (smaller traders without the necessary connections).

291 In this part I have provided some illustrations of how different actors in the gold production network 292 deal with uncertainties in markets. I have shown that uncertainty shapes practices (such as downsizing 293 in mining companies), norms (such as trustworthiness in the Congolese gold trade) and relationships 294 (such as those between large-scale and artisanal mining). When one condition of uncertainty is 295 calculated and ranked vis-à-vis other uncertain conditions, it is framed as a 'risk' and is supposed to 296 become 'manageable'. For example, companies manage the risk of falling gold prices by adjusting their 297 reserves estimates or by cutting costs. But this produces other risks, in casu the risk for workers to 298 loose their job. As Emel and Huber (2008) have pointed out, governments and companies generally do 299 not have much consideration for the latter risk. Concretely, the financial, political and geological risks 300 borne by companies are believed to be much more important than the social, economic, political, 301 environmental and cultural risks borne by host governments and communities. In addition to that, 302 corporations attempt to externalize the risks they are facing to local populations (Alexandrescu, 2012).

303 **States** 

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> Interview trader, Bukavu, 29/07/2009.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> Interview trader, Bujumbura, 17/03/2010.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> There are many ways in which traders may cheat. Master traders normally put financial capital at the disposal of smaller traders. The latter have an incentive to run away with the money, which sometimes happens, but which ruins the small traders' career in gold trade. Gold is transported and smuggled by middlemen. They may as well have an incentive to steal the gold. Finally, traders may sell false material, or gold with a lower purity.

304 Bridge (2008) reminds us about the particular territoriality of mineral resources. As in most countries 305 governments are the owners of whatever can be found below the surface, mineral production 306 networks are much more embedded in state structures than, for example, manufactured goods, which 307 can be produced in networks of firms relatively disconnected from state structures. When arriving in 308 a territory where the state holds the underground reserves and communities hold access or property 309 rights to the surface land, companies thus have to negotiate with both, which causes "all kinds of 310 frictions, controversies and possibly confrontations", which may turn violent (Mommer, cited in 311 Bridge, 2008: 405). Therefore, when making an investment decision, corporations consider the host 312 country's regulatory environment. This shows in the prevalence of global rankings scoring countries 313 on their 'investability', such as the Global Mining Survey (Le Billon and Sommersville 2017).

Banro's financial information form for the year 2015 includes an impressive twelve page long list of 'risk factors' (Banro Corporation, 2016). The first factor is: "The assets and operations of Banro are subject to political, economic and other uncertainties as a result of being located in the DRC" (idem: 17). More specifically, the following risks have been identified:

318 "the risks of war and civil unrest, expropriation, nationalization, renegotiation or nullification
319 of existing licenses, permits, approvals and contracts, taxation policies, foreign exchange and
320 repatriation restrictions, changing political conditions, international monetary fluctuations".

And the list goes on to include issues of dispute settlement, regional conflict, artisanal miners' presence, physical and institutional infrastructure and HIV/AIDS.

323 Banro Corporation acquired its research and exploitation permits in a context of political instability 324 and war. In the 1990s Banro was a junior company, speculating on the promising gold concessions that Sominki<sup>12</sup>, which was on the verge of bankruptcy, sought to sell. After negotiations with both the dying 325 Mobutu regime as well as with the AFDL<sup>13</sup> rebels led by later president Laurent Kabila, all Sominki's 326 327 titles were transferred to Banro<sup>14</sup>. However, one year after coming to power, Laurent Kabila deprived 328 Banro of these titles and created a new state-owned company, Somico<sup>15</sup>. In line with this nationalist 329 move, Kabila also appointed Luhwindja's chief Philemon Naluhwindja, who portrayed himself as the 330 legitimate rights holder as opposed to the 'foreign occupier', as director of Somico. Just two days after this, the RCD<sup>16</sup> rebellion broke out and large parts of Eastern DRC were seized. During the war that 331 332 lasted until 2003, Banro took the side of the RCD rebels, whereas Somico supported local defence 333 groups and was backed by the Kabila government. Thus the access to the gold mines was at stake in a 334 highly politicised and militarized power struggle. At the local level, the conflict between Banro and 335 Somico was exemplified by a succession conflict after Philemon Naluhwindja's death in 2000. 336 Philemon's brother Justin continued to support Somico and nourished the popular narrative that 337 Somico had been created to mine gold on the 'people's land' for the good of Luhwindja's inhabitants. 338 Yet Somico was never operational due to lack of investors. In practice, Justin effectively controlled and 339 derived rents from artisanal mining and contracted FDLR rebels as personal security guards<sup>17</sup>.

<sup>16</sup> Rassemblement Congolais pour la Démocratie. Kabila's former allies Uganda and Rwanda turned against him in 1998 and supported the RCD rebellion in the East, which managed to occupy a large part of the entire Congolese territory.

<sup>17</sup> Forces Démocratiques pour la Libération du Rwanda was a rebel group composed of Rwandan Hutu fighters. Interview community leaders, Luhwindja, 11/2011.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> Société Industrielle et Minière du Kivu.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> Alliance des Forces Démocratiques pour la Libération du Congo.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> Convention minière entre la République du Zaïre et la Société Minière et Industrielle du Kivu 'Sominki' et Banro Resource Corporation, 13/02/1997.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> Société Minière du Congo was created on 31/07/1998.

340 In January 2001 Laurent Kabila was murdered and succeeded by his son Joseph who turned to 341 collaborate with Banro and concluded a 'gentlemen's agreement' restoring all gold titles to Banro<sup>18</sup>. 342 But Banro was not able to actually access the concession because of the continued presence of FDLR. 343 In July 2005 the Congolese army launched a military operation chasing the rebels, installing Banro and 344 taking violent action against community members accused of sympathizing with FDLR. Justin fled to 345 Kinshasa and Banro relied on Philemon's widow (mwamikazi) to appease and convince the population 346 of welcoming the company. The company, evolving from a junior to a mid-tier company (Dougherty, 347 2011), had just announced a massive exploration programme and had listed its shares at the New York 348 and Toronto stock exchange, so investors needed reassurance. A strategic alliance with loyal factions 349 of the local elite was believed to simplify this. but eventually turned out to create major tensions as 350 excluded elite factions turned against the power holders. This local conflict became entangled with 351 provincial and national politics and affects the company's operations until today (see Geenen, 2015; 352 Geenen and Verweijen, 2017).

353 Uncertainties regarding mining titles also shape practices, norms and relations in ASM. While the 354 Congolese Mining Code provides for 'artisanal mining zones' in which miners can legally carry out their 355 activities, the actual number and scope of these zones is very limited. In practice, almost all artisanal 356 gold miners are working in areas that have officially been given in concession to industrial companies, 357 which contributes to their uncertain position. This is also the case in Kadumwa mine, which is actually 358 very close to Banro's processing plant in the Twangiza concession (Luhwindja chiefdom). Faced with 359 artisanal miners' resistance to their forced displacement and the government's inability or 360 unwillingness to relocate the miners to artisanal mining zones, the company has been tolerating 361 artisanal miners in this pit. This very much reflects an older practice, as Sominki had abandoned the 362 mines around Twangiza already in the 1970s and had left these pits to be exploited by artisanal miners. 363 Sominki accepted, if not encouraged, the fact that the local chief (mwami) levied monthly fees and taxes on the production (amounting to 10%)<sup>19</sup>, because the company had an interest in maintaining 364 good relations with the customary authorities. 365

366 From the artisanal miners' point of view, access to land is uncertain. Since their property rights are not 367 protected by the state, they use various other mechanisms to maintain access to the pits. These 368 mechanisms include making illegal payments to state representatives; paying customary fees to the chiefs who have traditionally been in charge of managing access to land<sup>20</sup>; and legitimizing access by 369 370 referring to a first settler's right. As one interviewee told me in Kamituga, another one of Banro's concessions: "We only take what is ours; it's the land of the Congolese"<sup>21</sup>. However, such access 371 372 mechanisms remain precarious. Suppose that Banro makes a new discovery in an area where artisanal 373 miners are currently tolerated, or that Banro decides to frame their presence as a security risk, the 374 company has the power (and alliance with the government) to use repression and forcefully displace 375 the artisanal miners, as has happened in the past.

Summing up, in this part I have given examples of how uncertainty in states shapes practices (such as the de facto cohabitation of a company with artisanal miners), norms (such as the way in which artisanal miners try to secure resource access) and relationships (such as the company's strategic alliance with local elites) in the gold production network. I argue that by attempting to 'calculate' this uncertainty and framing it as 'risk', the company forces other actors to operate under the conditions they set. The risks (as shown here in Banro's example) are presented as being exogenous to corporate

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> Avenant n.1 à la convention minière du 13 février 1997, 18/04/2002.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> Interviews former miners, Luhwindja, 08/01/2011.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup> Interview former miners, Burhinyi, 26/10/2011.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> Interview miner, Kamituga, 04 and 11/04/2008.

actions. They are the 'result of being located in the DRC', hence inevitable consequences of the 382 383 territoriality of the gold production network. The company thus discursively sheds responsibility and 384 accountability. However, issues such as artisanal miners' presence, war and civil unrest, changing 385 political conditions and even HIV/AIDS are not necessarily external to company actions. On the 386 contrary, actions (or inactions, in the sense of not doing something) taken by corporate actors may 387 play a role in shaping social, political and security events (see also Le Billon, 2001). In our case, practices 388 such as the co-optation of local elites and strategic alliances with contested leaders created new 389 political conflicts and exacerbated existing ones. Moreover, uncertainty surrounding attitudes vis-à-vis 390 artisanal miners – switching from acquiesence to collaboration, repression and forced displacement – 391 may be one factor explaining violent mobilization against the company (Geenen and Verweijen, 2017). 392 These practices should not necessarily be seen as intentional though, nor are they emanating from a 393 monolithic, homo economicus type of corporation (Welker, 2014). As Marina Welker (2014) 394 convincingly argued, corporations are 'enacted' by individuals and these individual actions are crucial 395 in the production of risk and anticipation, as the next section will further clarify.

### 396 Underground

In this part I analyse how uncertainty related to 'the underground' plays out in the gold production network. The focus on the underground, next to markets and states, reflects the typical nature of gold production that heavily depends on the depth, size and locations of underground deposits. This, as well as the properties of the resource itself, is what Bridge (2008) called materiality. The first example I give relates to the unpredictability of gold earnings in artisanal mining; the second to companies' investments in community development through Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR).

403 In my research sites gold is extracted from underground pits. Some are abandoned pits left behind by 404 industrial companies; others have been opened by artisanal miners who may follow different sources 405 of information: discoveries by colleagues, knowledge of former company workers, maps made by 406 companies, traces left behind by geologists, colour and composition of the soil or presence of thin 407 veins close to the surface. Still, artisanal miners have a hard time predicting the exact location and 408 orientation of gold veins as their means for exploration are limited. As a consequence, the outcomes 409 of an underground gold mining project are always uncertain. In most cases it takes a long time before 410 a mining team hits the gold-bearing vein and considerable investments are needed in manpower, 411 equipment and working tools. These investments are made by the 'pit manager', who in turn borrows 412 money from small traders, who borrow it from master traders. The first period during which the shaft 413 is opened up, is called the 'preparatory period'. Once the team reaches the gold vein, a 'high 414 production period' starts. But mining teams may be hindered by material factors such as cave-ins or 415 mounting groundwater during the rainy season. As such, high production periods are always alternated 416 with preparatory works and low production periods, and earnings are unpredictable. But all the time 417 miners are driven by the hope to 'strike it rich'. This is actually a crucial factor in understanding the 418 attractiveness of gold mining, although it does not fully explain people's motivations to enter and stay 419 in the sector<sup>22</sup>. In the case of Tanzania, Bryceson and Fisher (2014: 187) argue that

"over time, this belief is tempered by the experience of the real probabilities and risks involved
in mining, the exceptionally hard work it entails and the market practices and price fluctuations
that can undermine the miner's earnings. Nonetheless, even at the stage of greater awareness
of the pitfalls, an imaginary of 'anyone can get rich', may continue to prevail because it is
observed that some do succeed".

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> These are also related of course, to poverty, lack of formal jobs, low attractiveness of agriculture and so on.

425 As mentioned in the introduction, the names of some of the shafts reflect these 'underground dreams' 426 (see also Pijpers, 2017). They are also nourished by the stories about miners earning thousands of 427 dollars and spending them the same night, about miners returning to their home village after striking 428 it rich and being punished for becoming too arrogant, about rich gold deposits guarded by a venomous 429 snake, or about treasures the colonial agents have buried in mountains and houses. Miners often talk about their earnings in terms of luck (Kazi yetu ni bahati or "Our work depends on luck"<sup>23</sup>), God's will 430 ("Everything depends on your chance, on the way in which God will bless you"<sup>24</sup>), magic ("This work is 431 432 like magic")<sup>25</sup>, or lottery. But luck can also be enforced by prayers, customary practices or witchcraft<sup>26</sup>.

Another factor contributing to the unpredictability of earnings is the distribution of ore among the 433 434 members of a mining team. As I have described for underground gold mining in Eastern DRC (Geenen 435 2013, 2015, but see also Jønsson and Fold, 2009 for Tanzania and Grätz, 2003 for West-Africa) artisanal 436 miners are not paid in cash, but in a quantity of ore or sand, or more precisely a number of bags 437 containing ore or sand. First, the pit manager takes the largest share (commonly one third or up to half 438 of the mined ore), which reflects him having taken the greatest risk by making the investments 439 mentioned above. The remaining ore is distributed among the workers (with specific arrangements for 440 workers with particular ranks and specializations), who then need to process the ore so as to extract 441 the gold particles. This means that individual earnings will always be unpredictable and depend on the 442 ore concentration and the losses incurred during processing.

443 What is in the underground is shaping relations, practices and norms above the ground. This is not only 444 the case in artisanal mining, but also in large-scale mining. Companies generally spend years and 445 hundreds of thousands of dollars on exploration. This not only creates uncertainties regarding ore 446 concentration, efficiency of the extraction process and quality of the refining; it also produces 447 expectations and anxieties on the side of the population surrounding the mine. Among the 'risk factors' 448 identified in Banro's financial information form (Banro, 2016: 17-29), many relate to the reserve 449 estimates, geological characteristics of the deposits and physical characteristics of the ore. Estimates 450 are inevitably imprecise and depend on interpretation and statistical inference drawn from drilling and 451 sample analysis. Positive feasibility studies do not guarantee anything: "It is not unusual in new mining 452 operations or mine expansion to experience unexpected problems during the start-up phase. Delays 453 often can occur in the commencement of production" (idem: 19). In the case of Namoya, after 454 Twangiza the second concession where Banro Corporation has started commercial production (since 455 January 2016), production was indeed delayed because of technical problems.

But the company also had to deal with numerous community protests, including violent manifestations in Namoya in September 2012 and January 2014. Artisanal miners for example demanded compensation of around 28,000 USD per pit<sup>27</sup>. The General Director of Namoya Mining responded that Banro was willing to compensate, but only for those pit managers with an official land title. As explained above, artisanal miners lack such titles, but use various other access mechanisms to maintain access to their mining pits. Still, in 2014 a negotiation process was initiated between a representation

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> Interview miner, Kamituga, 07/04/2008.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> Group interview miners, Lugushwa, 26/01/2011.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>25</sup> Interview miner, Burhinyi, 18/01/2012.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> A large-scale survey (not yet published) carried out by colleagues Marijke Verpoorten, Nik Stoop and Janvier Kilosho among 469 miners in Kamituga revealed that 3 out of 4 miners believe in witchcraft; 28% categorize witchcraft as a very important threat to their mining activities, 13% consider the threat important, 10% of little importance, 8% of very little importance and 41% not at all important. In the latter category, many believe that prayer is an effective protection against witchcraft and the belief in a monotheistic God as the only supernatural belief that is permissible.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> Letter by Association des filoniens creuseurs d'or de Namoya to the Provincial Governor, 29/07/2013.

462 of community members through the Community Forum, and Banro's Department for Community Relations. This led to the Salamabila Chief presenting a Cahier de Charges<sup>28</sup> and both parties signing a 463 Memorandum of Understanding (MoU)<sup>29</sup> in September of the same year. The *Cahier de Charges* gives 464 465 a good idea about community expectations, including improvements in the domain of education, 466 health, infrastructure, sports and employment. In the MoU Banro indicates a few activities from the Cahier de Charges that will not be possible to execute, but leaves other possibilities open. For example, 467 468 it is made clear that the Salamabila-Kindu road (300km) cannot be tarred, but "this does not exclude other interventions in road rehabilitation"<sup>30</sup>. With respect to the hydraulic plant, Banro states that "if 469 470 Namoya Mining has an excess of electricity itself, it will "consider the possibility of channelling it to the community"<sup>31</sup>. The document clearly states that "it will not be possible to meet all expectations"<sup>32</sup>. But 471 472 on the other hand it still leaves considerable room for interpretation and hence, for underground 473 dreams:

474 "The '*Cahier de Charges*' has been signed by both parties. But until today Banro has not kept
475 one promise. And still, they continue making promises and saying that we have to await the
476 production phase. But we are waiting in vain. This creates discontent in the community.
477 Instead of feeling fortunate we now feel more exploited"<sup>33</sup>.

One of the chiefs said that Community Relations staff "did a customary ceremony, offered four goats, rice and drinks. We ate and we talked. They told us that once the mine would start producing, they would bring us our 'customary share'. But nothing"<sup>34</sup>. In this case actions taken by Banro staff to acknowledge customary authority have created high expectations. Staff members acknowledged that managing these expectations is one of the biggest challenges, because "these people want everything, and now, and for free"<sup>35</sup>.

The MoU came with a roadmap specifying projects that will be executed in the short, medium and long 484 485 run. More specific time frames were not set, nor was there an explicit mentioning of priorities. 486 Communities are not sufficiently aware of the fact that execution of these projects depends on 487 company performance, a Banro staff member said<sup>36</sup>. All this created misunderstandings and 488 frustrations, and eventually resulted in violence. In January 2016 the police dispersed a protest match and killed one civil society leader<sup>37</sup>. In September of the same year six trucks were burned in an attack 489 490 on a convoy transporting fuel and mining equipment. In December a similar attack targeted two 491 vehicles of Banro's subcontractor CIVICON. In March 2017 five workers were kidnapped. In May police 492 and military around the mine were attacked and there was an attempt to invade the camp, prompting 493 the company to evacuate its staff and suspend its operations (Geenen and Verweijen, 2017).

Sadly, these kinds of events are quite typical of what a mining company encounters when it starts
operating (Bebbington et al, 2008; Conde and Le Billon, 2017). Local communities are internally divided
and do not respond in homogeneous ways. Company staff, and especially the department of
Community Relations, plays into this by co-opting some groups (customary chiefs, economic elites, civil

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup> Cahier des Charges des communautés locales versé à la Société Namoya Mining filiale de Banro Corporation par les forces vives sous le patronage du Chef de Secteur des BB/Salamabila.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup> Protocole d'Accord signé entre la société Namoya Mining Sarl et le Secteur de Bangubangu Salamabila.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>30</sup> Protocole d'Accord, p.3.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>31</sup> Protocole d'Accord, p.4.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>32</sup> Protocole d'Accord, p.4.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>33</sup> Group interview religious leaders, Namoya, 09/09/2015.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>34</sup> Interview chief, Namoya, 10/09/2015.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>35</sup> Interview Banro staff, Namoya, 10/09/2015.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>36</sup> Interview Banro staff, Namoya, 11/09/2015.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>37</sup> Memo adressé aux organisations non gouvernementales internationales intervenants dans le secteur des ressources naturelles en RDC, Maniema Libertés MALI, 16/02/2016.

498 society and ASM leaders) and feeding into their expectations, while other groups are excluded (Geenen 499 and Verweijen, 2017). For companies, these co-optation strategies are important in gaining a 'social 500 license to operate' (SLO). Indeed, in the abovementioned Ernst&Young (2016) ranking, SLO was considered to be the 4<sup>th</sup> most important risk. Another study reported that 'stakeholder-related risks' 501 502 (broader than just local communities) account for nearly half of the total risks faced by major extractive 503 companies (Davis and Franks, 2014). However, all this completely obscures the fact that by reaching 504 out to certain local stakeholders (and thereby inevitably excluding others), companies actually play 505 into existing local conflicts, or even produce new ones.

506 In this part I have analysed how uncertainties related to the materiality of gold shape practices (such 507 as the vague planning of CSR interventions), norms (such as those concerning output sharing) and 508 relationships (such as those between companies and communities). In the case of company-509 community relations, many tensions and conflicts around CSR, resettlement or compensation can be 510 ascribed to the production of risk and anticipation, as well as the denial of the ways in which 511 communities and artisanal miners deal with uncertainty. In the conclusion I further reflect on this.

512

#### 513 Conclusion

I have built upon the idea of risk as being produced to serve the interests of capital and being used as 514 515 a mode of rule. My case study shows that Banro's financial reports include detailed lists of risk factors, 516 which fuel the idea that if risks can be named and calculated, they can also be prevented or managed. 517 But this obscures the company's active role in producing new risks and conflicts. For example, a 518 company may lay off workers to anticipate falling gold prices, but this may pressure artisanal miners 519 to forcefully occupy the company's concession, constituting a security risk. For those artisanal miners, 520 the risk of losing their livelihoods is larger than the risk of being caught as an intruder in the concession. 521 Yet such (livelihood) risks are largely invisible to the companies. The latter put a lot of effort in making 522 it very concrete what can 'go wrong' for the company as compared to what can go wrong for 523 communities (Emel and Huber, 2008). CSR brochures, for example, frequently mention alternative 524 livelihoods programmes for artisanal miners, but remain relatively silent on the livelihoods that have 525 been destroyed. The endless listing of risk factors may serve at the same time as a safeguard vis-à-vis 526 investors and an excuse for potential negative externalities of company presence, as if these 527 externalities are completely independent from corporate actions. When such negative externalities 528 occur, it is easier to blame contextual factors than corporate agency.

529 Paradoxically, for some of my informants (both on the side of the company and on the communities' 530 side) the solution to company-community conflicts lies in even more specific information about what 531 to expect, for example a more specific roadmap accompanying the MoU, or in the case of a 532 resettlement very clear timelines. Indeed, once could argue that the more concrete information is 533 available, the better outcomes can be anticipated. Moreover, it seems like a moral imperative to 534 inform communities about how the mining project will evolve, what its future effects will be, when a 535 resettlement process will start and end (and indeed this is what is required in community participation 536 instruments such as Free, Prior and Informed Consent). This is why staff in the Community Relations 537 Department occupied such a crucial position. But on the other hand, this recommendation also shows 538 how management discourses shape our ideas about how development problems can be 'fixed', if only 539 we have the right numbers and our mitigation plans are good enough.

Although space constraints in this article have not allowed me to do so, this focus on uncertainty and
 risk should be extended to other nodes in the global gold production network. E-waste workers, for
 example, are part of this network as they recycle gold from used computers and mobile devices. By far

543 most policy and research attention has, rightly, gone to the health and environmental risks they are 544 exposed to. But this framing has for a long time obscured the reality that most e-waste is not just 545 dumped but recycled, that value is created and livelihoods are built (Wong, 2015). The perceptions of 546 NGOs and policy makers on the risks e-waste workers are facing may thus considerably differ from the 547 workers' own perspectives. Another example is Fairtrade gold. As for other Fairtrade products, the 548 price premium is presented as a major incentive for producers to join, a safety net for fluctuating world 549 market prices. However, research in different countries has shown that prices paid locally amount to 550 about 85-90% of the London Gold Fixing<sup>38</sup>. Moreover, the practice of miners taking credit from the 551 traders to whom they later sell, is what sustains local investments in mining shafts (Geenen, 2011). Hence the price premium for Fairtrade gold appears not to be particularly attractive (Fischer and 552 553 Childs, 2014). Miners are more interested in increasing productivity and acquiring financial and 554 material support to deal with the unpredictability of gold deposits, underground water and geological 555 conditions such as the presence of hard rocks that make excavation difficult. Once again, the framing 556 of what constitutes the major risk for producers may vary.

557 Just like risk, anticipation is built on the basis of data (geological information, feasibility studies, 558 financial projections), but also on previous experiences and promises. In Eastern DRC community 559 expectations are fed by the historical experience of colonial mining companies, which functioned 560 according to a paternalistic model and organized education, health care and even leisure facilities for 561 workers and families (Geenen, 2015). But as Cross (2014) observed for India's special economic zones, 562 people's dreams are not only shaped by past experience, but at least as much by imagined and desired 563 futures. Artisanal miners' hopes are thus fuelled by the omnipresent stories about fellow-miners 564 striking it rich. For communities around industrial mining sites, the presence of a multinational mining 565 company fuels the hope to benefit from infrastructures, social projects and most importantly, jobs -566 especially in a context where the government is unable to provide all of this. Often, people's dreams 567 are turned into more concrete anticipatory actions through interactions with company 568 representatives. Company staff, especially Community Relations people, frequently make promises, 569 be it formally (for example in MoU's), informally, or implicitly. They may not even intend to make 570 promises, but local people interpret their words otherwise. People's expectations are fed by these 571 promises, and their frustrations generally result from unfulfilled promises – even if these were never 572 formal or explicit.

573 Finally, I have argued that the production of risk and anticipation by corporations conceals and 574 devalues the ways in which other actors in the gold production network deal with uncertainty. As has 575 been illustrated, the extreme uncertainty that characterizes the market and the institutional 576 environment in which Congolese actors operate as well as the resource's materiality, shapes many of 577 the practices, norms and relationships in the network. This is easily overlooked, for example when only 578 artisanal miners with an official license are entitled to compensation, when attempts to formalize the 579 gold supply chain fail because of the resilience of informal norms, or when companies try to deal with 580 armed mobilization against their operations. My intent is not to claim that the production of risk and 581 anticipation can fully explain company-community conflicts. As I have shown elsewhere (Geenen and 582 Claessens, 2014; Geenen 2014, Geenen and Verweijen, 2017) such conflicts have complex socio-583 economic, cultural and political dimensions. But I do believe that it helps to see how all actors and 584 activities in the gold production network are linked, how they influence each other, and how all are 585 chasing underground dreams in a context of extreme uncertainty.

#### 586 References

 $<sup>^{\</sup>rm 38}$  Own research and communication with other ASM experts working in Burkina Faso and Ghana.

587 588	Aboobaker, S., 2015. Retrenchments hit gold mining industry, 31/05/2015 http://www.iol.co.za/business-report/economy/retrenchments-hit-gold-mining-industry-1865540.
589 590	Adams, V.; Murphy M. and Clarkec, A., 2009. Anticipation: Technoscience, life, affect, temporality. Subjectivity 28: 246-265.
591 592	Africa Progress Panel, 2013. Equity in extractives. Stewarding Africa's natural resources for all, Progress Report 2013, Africa Progress Panel, Geneva.
593 594 595	Alaszewski, A., 2016. Anthropology and risk: insights into uncertainty, danger and blame from other cultures. A review essay. Health, risk and society 17 (3-4): 205-225.
596	Alexandrescu, F., 2012. Gold and displacement in Eastern Europe. Risks and uncertainty at Rosia
597 598	Montana. Romanian Journal of Sociology 1–2: 27–56.
599 600 601	Amoore, L., 2013. The politics of possibility: Risk and security beyond probability. Durham: Duke University Press.
602 603 604	Banro Corporation, 2016. Annual information form for the financial year ended December 31, 2015. Dated March 28, 2016, <u>https://www.banro.com/assets/docs/2015aif.pdf</u> .
605 606 607 608	Bebbington, A., Humphreys Bebbington, D., Bury, J., Lingan, J., Pablo Munoz, J. and Scurrah, M., 2008. Mining and social movements: struggles over livelihood and rural territorial development in the Andes. World Development 36 (12): 2888-2905.
609 610 611 612	Bebbington, A., 2012. Underground political ecologies: The second annual lecture of the Cultural and Political Ecology Specialty Group of the Association of American Geographers. Geoforum 43: 1152-1162.
613 614	Berwouts, K., 2017. It's no longer possible to predict what'll happen in the Congo. African Arguments, <u>http://africanarguments.org/2017/06/08/its-no-longer-possible-to-predict-whatll-happen-in-the-</u>
615 616	<u>congo/</u> .
617 618	Bridge, G., 2008. Global production networks and the extractive sector: governing resource-based development. Journal of Economic Geography 8 : 389–419.
619	
620	Bush, R., 2009. 'Soon there will be no-one left to take the corpses to the morgue': accumulation and
621	abjection in Ghana's mining communities. Resources Policy 34: 57-63.
622	Devenue D.F. and Ficker, F. 2014. Anticenel minimum deventicing disections and devictions. Inc.
623	Bryceson, D.F. and Fisher, E., 2014. Artisanal mining's democratizing directions and deviations. In: Bryceson, D.F. Eicher, F. Musinono, P. (eds.) Mining and social transformation in Africa.
024 625	Mineralizing and democratizing trends in artisanal production London Routledge 179-206
626	
627	Bryceson, D. and Geenen, S., 2016. Artisanal frontier mining of gold in Africa: labour transformation in
628	Tanzania and the Democratic Republic of Congo. African Affairs 115 (459): 296-317.
629	Conde, M. and Le Billon, P. 2017. Why do some communities resist mining projects while others do
630	not? The Extractive Industries and Society 4 (4): 681-697.
031 632	Cross 1 2014 Dream zones: Anticinating canitalism and development in India New York: Pluto
633	Press.
634	

635 Davis, R. and Franks, D., 2014. Costs of company-community conflict in the extractive sector. 636 Corporate Social Responsibility Initiative Report No. 66. Cambridge, MA: Harvard Kennedy School. 637 638 Dillon, M., 2008. Underwriting security. Security Dialogue 39 (2–3): 309–332. 639 640 Dougherty, M., 2011. The global gold mining industry, junior firms, and civil society resistance in 641 Guatemala. Bulletin of Latin American Research : 1-16. 642 643 Douglas, M., 1996 (2000). Purity and danger. An Analysis of Concepts of Pollution and Taboo. 644 London, Routledge. 645 646 Douglas, M. and Wildavsky, A., 1983. Risk and culture: An essay on the selection of technical and 647 environmental dangers. Berkeley: University of California Press. 648 649 Emel, J. and Huber, M.T., 2008. A risky business: Mining, rent and the neoliberalization of 'risk'. 650 Geoforum 39 : 1393–1407. 651 652 Ernst&Young, 2016. Top-10 business risks facing mining and metals. 653 654 Fisher, E. and Childs, J. 2014. An ethical turn in African mining. Voluntary regulation through fair 655 trade. In: Bryceson, D.F.; Fisher, E., Jønsson J.B.; Mwaipopo R. (eds.) Mining and social 656 transformation in Africa. Mineralizing and democratizing trends in artisanal production, New York, 657 Routledge, 130-147. 658 Garsten, C. and Hasselström, A., 2003. Risky business: Discourses of risk and (ir)responsibility in 659 660 globalizing markets. Ethnos, 68 (2): 249-270. 661 662 Geenen, S., 2011. Relations and regulations in local gold trade networks in South-Kivu, Democratic 663 Republic of Congo. Journal of eastern African studies 5 (3): 427-446. 664 Geenen, S. and Claessens K. 2013. Disputed access to the gold mines in Luhwindja, eastern DRCongo. 665 666 Journal of Modern African Studies 51 (1): 85-108. 667 668 Geenen, S. 2013. 'Who seeks, finds': how artisanal miners and traders benefit from gold in the 669 Eastern Democratic Republic of Congo. European Journal of Development Research 25 (2): 197-212. 670 671 Geenen, S. 2014. Dispossession, displacement and resistance: artisanal miners in a gold concession in 672 South Kivu, Democratic Republic of Congo. Resources Policy 40: 90-99. 673 674 Geenen, S., 2015. African artisanal mining from the inside out. Access, norms and power in Congo's 675 gold sector, Routledge, Abingdon. 676 677 Geenen, S. and Verweijen, J., 2017. Explaining fragmented and fluid mobilization in gold mining 678 concessions in eastern Democratic Republic of the Congo. The Extractive Industries and Society 4 (4): 679 758-765. 680 681 Gleiberman, M., 2016. Capturing the benefits of private sector investment in natural resource 682 extraction for national development. A case study of labor and the Liquefied Natural Gas (LNG) 683 industry in Cabo Delgado, Mozambique. PhD proposal, Institute of Development Policy and 684 Management, University of Antwerp. 685

686 Grätz, T., 2003. Gold-mining and risk management: A case study from Northern Benin. Ethnos, 68:2, 687 192-208 688 689 Henderson, J.; Dicken, P.; Hess, M.; Coe, N. and Wai-Chung Yeung, H., 2002. Global production 690 networks and the analysis of economic development. Review of International Political Economy 9 (3): 691 436-464. 692 693 Hilson, G., 2009. Small-scale mining, poverty and economic development in Sub-Saharan Africa: an 694 overview. Resources Policy 34: 1-5. 695 696 Hilson, G., 2011. Artisanal mining, smallholder farming and livelihood diversification in rural Sub-697 Saharan Africa: an introduction. Journal of International Development 23: 1031-1041. 698 699 Jønsson, J.B. and Fold, N., 2009. Handling uncertainty: policy and organizational practices in 700 Tanzania's small-scale gold mining sector. Natural Resources Forum 33: 211-220. 701 702 Jønsson, J. B. and Bryceson, D.F., 2009. Rushing for gold: mobility and small-scale mining in East 703 Africa. Development and Change 40 (2): 249-279. 704 705 Larmer, M. and Laterza, V., 2017. Contested wealth: Social and political mobilisation in extractive 706 communities in Africa. The Extractive Industries and Society. Introduction special issue. 707 708 Le Billon, P., 2001. The political ecology of war: natural resources and armed conflicts. Political 709 Geography 20 (5): 561-84. 710 711 Le Billon, P. and Sommerville, M., 2017. Landing capital and assembling 'investable land' in the 712 extractive and agricultural sectors. Geoforum 82: 212-224. 713 714 Martin, R., 2007. An empire of indifference: American war and the financial logic of risk 715 management. Duke University Press, Durham. 716 717 McTernan, B. 2017. São Tomé e Príncipe dreams of a new business hub, The Africa Report, 718 05/12/2017, http://www.theafricareport.com/Central-Africa/country-focus-sao-tome-e-719 principe.html. 720 721 Miyazaki, H., 2003. The temporalities of the market. American Anthropologist, 105 (2): 255-265. 722 723 Miyakazi, H., 2006. Economy of dreams: hope in global capitalism and its critiques. Cultural 724 Anthropology 21 (2): 147-172. 725 726 Nyenyezi, A.; Geenen, S.; Ansoms, A. and Omasombo, J. (eds.), 2017. Conjonctures congolaises 2016 727 : glissement politique, recul économique. Paris, L'Harmattan. 728 729 Owen, J. R. and Kemp, D., 2013. Social licence and mining: A critical perspective. *Resources Policy* 38: 29-35. 730 731 732 Pijpers, R., 2017. 'I want to be a millionaire'. survival, trust and deception in Sierra Leone's economy 733 of dreams, In: de Rooij, V., (Ed.), Anthropological knowledge on the move. Amsterdam, Pallas 734 Publications, 135-153. 735 736 PWC, 2013. Metals mired in global uncertainty. Gold, silver and copper price report 2013. Price 737 Waterhouse Coopers, London.

738

744

748

750

753

759

762

- PWC, 2014. Realigning expectations. Review of global trends in the mining industry 2014. PriceWaterhouse Coopers, London.
- 741
  742 Skinner, J., 2000. The eruption of chances peak: Montserrat, and the narrative containment of risk. In
  743 Caplan, P. (ed.) Risk Revisited. London: Pluto Press.
- 745 Stanley, A., 2013. Natures of risk: Capital, rule, and production of difference. Geoforum 45: 5-16.
- Tversky, A. and Kahneman, D. 1986. Rational choice and the framing of decisions. The Journal ofBusiness 59 (4), 251-278.
- 749 Tsing, A. (2004) Friction. An ethnography of global connection. Princeton University Press.
- Verbrugge, B., 2015. The economic logic of persistent informality: Artisanal and Small-Scale Mining in
   the Southern Philippines. Development and Change 46(5): 1023–1046.
- Vogel, C. and Raeymaekers, T. 2016. Terr(it)or(ies) of Peace? The Congolese Mining Frontier and the
   Fight Against "Conflict Minerals". Antipode 48 (4): 1102-1121.
- 756
  757 Welker, M. 2014. Enacting the corporation. An American mining firm in post-authoritarian Indonesia.
  758 Berkeley, University of California Press.
- Weszkalnys, G., 2008. Hope & oil: Expectations in São Tomé e Príncipe. Review of African Political
  Economy, 35 (117): 473-482.
- Witte, A., 2016. Uncertain blessings. Imagining a future petro-state in Uganda. GISCA OccasionalPaper Series.
- 765

Wong, A. 2015. Articulation of informal labour: interrogating the e-waste value chain in Singapore
and Malaysia. In: Newsome et al (eds) Putting labour in its place. Labour process analysis and global
value chains, London, Palgrave, 100-116.

- 769
- World Bank, 2014. The Contribution of the mining sector to socioeconomic and human development.
   Extractive Industries for Development Series 30, World Bank Oil, Gas, and Mining Unit Working
- 772 Paper.
- 773
- 774