This item is the archived peer-reviewed author-version of:

Early labour market trajectories of intermediate and second generation Turkish and Maghreb women in Belgium

Reference:

Maes Julie, Wood Jonas, Neels Karel.- Early labour market trajectories of intermediate and second generation Turkish and Maghreb women in Belgium
Research in social stratification and mobility - ISSN 0276-5624 - 61(2019), p. 65-78
Full text (Publisher's DOI): <https://doi.org/10.1016/J.RSSM.2018.11.001>
To cite this reference: <https://hdl.handle.net/10067/1558950151162165141>

Early labour market trajectories of intermediate and second generation Turkish and Maghreb women in Belgium

Julie Maes*, Jonas Wood, Karel Neels

University of Antwerp

Abstract

This study focuses on early labour market trajectories of Turkish and Maghreb origin women who graduated in Belgium (Flanders) between 2005 and 2016. In contrast to available literature that largely focuses on employment positions at one point, we assess whether there are ethnic differentials in entering a sustainable employment spell, operationalised as an employment spell of at least four consecutive quarters, leading to a gross monthly wage of at least 82% of the gross Belgian minimum wage and a work intensity of at least 40% of a full-time position in the fourth quarter of the employment spell. Subsequently, we consider ethnic differentials in the characteristics of the first sustainable employment spell (type of employment, type of contract and gross wage quintile), as well as the length of the sustainable employment spell. Using longitudinal microdata, we examine how and to what extent these differentials can be explained by individual, previous employment, household and parental characteristics. Results indicate that, compared to native women, Turkish and Maghreb origin women are less likely to enter and more likely to exit a first sustainable employment spell. These differentials with natives are largest for the intermediate generation and are reproduced and reinforced over labour market careers. Although ethnic differentials diminish after controlling for individual, previous employment, household and parental characteristics, substantial differences remain.

Keywords

Ethnic gap; Labour market trajectories; Sustainable employment spell; Second generation; Belgium

* Corresponding author: Julie Maes, University of Antwerp, Sint-Jacobstraat 2, 2000 Antwerp, Belgium
E-mail: Julie.maes@uantwerpen.be

1 Introduction

Over the past few decades, female labour force participation has increased strongly in most Western European countries, resulting in a shift from a male breadwinner to a dual earner model. Female labour participation differs strongly, however, across ethnic groups, with particularly high inactivity and unemployment rates for women with a non-European background (De Klerck et al., 2016; Khoudja & Fleischmann, 2014). Belgium has the largest employment gap between natives and women of non-European origin in the EU-15, reaching 35% (FOD WASO & UNIA, 2017; OECD, 2008; Rendall, Tsang, Rubin, Rabinovich, & Janta, 2010)¹. Although the migrant-native employment gap is most articulated among non-European origin women of the first generation, the labour market position of the second generation remains considerably worse compared to natives, and previous research has indicated that these employment gaps already emerge during early stages of the life course (Baert, Heiland, & Korenman, 2016).

Popular explanations for the weaker labour market outcomes of the second generation frequently refer to lower human capital (Becker, 1964). Research has demonstrated, however, that substantial ethnic penalties remain when controlling for differences in educational attainment (Corluy, 2014; Neels & Stoop, 2000). Alternatively, labour market disadvantages of the second generation have been linked to their social background: non-European origin children are disproportionately raised in working-class and low income families, which affects their labour market outcomes both directly (e.g. through social networks, economic resources) and indirectly through educational outcomes, language skills and labour market orientations (de Valk, 2008; Phaet, Deboosere, & Bastiaenssen, 2007; Verhaeghe, Li, & Van de Putte, 2013). Qualitative research for Belgium has also identified the lack of support and role models during education, school dropout due to a precarious income situation and low self-esteem as factors shaping labour market prospects and positions of the second generation (Elloukmani & Ou-Salah, 2018). Lower participation of migrant origin women has further been related to cultural differences with respect to traditional gender role attitudes, such as female responsibilities to take care of their children and the household (de Valk, 2008; Khoudja & Fleischmann, 2014). Longitudinal research for Belgium suggest, however, that lower maternal employment and uptake of parental leave among migrant origin women largely reflect their unfavourable pre-birth labour market positions. Since migrant origin women are already overrepresented in unstable labour market trajectories characterised by low incomes before motherhood, they face practical and financial challenges to combine motherhood and employment (e.g. affordability and availability of formal childcare) and fail to meet the eligibility criteria for parental leave² (Kil, Neels, Wood, & de Valk, 2017; Kil, Wood, & Neels, 2017). Finally, there is consistent evidence of different types of discrimination in the Belgian labour market (Baert, Cockx, Gheyle, & Vandamme, 2013; Vandezande, Fleischmann, Baysu, Swyngedouw, & Phaet, 2008). Particularly non-European origin women face often discrimination related to the veil (CGKR, 2012; Mescoli, 2016).

Although a wide range of explanations for migrant-native employment differentials have been suggested in the literature, previous research has not been able to fully explain ethnic penalties and many potential determinants have hitherto not been considered. More specifically, the empirical relevance of factors such as field of education, language skills and previous work experience has remained empirically untested due to the limited availability of large-scale longitudinal data. In

¹ Migrant origin women are defined as women who have a foreign nationality, who are born with a foreign nationality or who have at least one foreign born parent. Native women are defined as women whose parents are both born in Belgium.

² In order to be entitled to parental leave in Belgium, an employee needs to have worked for the current employer for 12 out of 15 months prior to the application.

addition, existing research on labour market participation of migrant origin women focuses mainly on their employment positions at a single point in time, hereby failing to acknowledge that individuals typically change jobs multiple times, shift between part-time and full-time employment, experience multiple unemployment spells and gradually increase their earnings across their careers. As a result, employment status at any point is conditioned by previous (dis)advantages in terms of education, unemployment spells and work experience.

Given the path dependent and incremental nature of labour market trajectories, this study focuses on early labour market trajectories of Turkish and Maghreb origin women who graduated in Belgium (Flanders) between 2005 and 2016. In contrast to the available literature that has largely focused on employment regardless of employment stability and associated income, we assess whether the likelihood to enter sustainable employment differs between natives and women with a migration background by considering employment spells that meet three conditions related to duration of the employment spell, wage and employment intensity. First, since the likelihood to become unemployed decreases with the length of the employment spell (VDAB, 2014), four consecutive quarters are considered to denote stable employment. Second, we consider employment spells that lead to the Belgian minimum wage being attained in the fourth quarter of the employment spell. Third, a condition for work intensity is adopted, indicating that the employment spell has to lead a work intensity of at least 40% of a full-time position in the fourth quarter of the employment spell. Subsequently, we additionally consider ethnic differentials in the characteristics of the first sustainable employment spell (type of contract, type of employment and gross wage quintile) and the duration of the sustainable employment spell. Using longitudinal microdata from the Belgian crossroads bank for social security that have been linked to longitudinal data from the employment office (VDAB), we examine how and to what extent ethnic differentials in i) entering/exiting the first sustainable employment spell and ii) characteristics of the first sustainable employment spell, can be explained by individual characteristics (e.g. level and field of education, Dutch language skills), previous employment experience (e.g. cumulated quarters work experience), household characteristics (e.g. number of children) and parental characteristics (income). Finally, we not only distinguish between origin groups, but also between the intermediate generation (migrant origin women who immigrated before the age of 18) and the second generation (migrant origin women who are born in Belgium), to take differences in terms of (gender role) socialisation, language development and educational opportunities into account (Hermansen, 2017; Neels, 2000).

2 The Belgian context

2.1 Turkish and Moroccan migration to Belgium

The presence of Turkish and Maghreb origin groups in Belgium is the result of three subsequent migration waves: the initial recruitment of guest workers, subsequent family reunification and finally marriage migration. After the Second World War, Belgium recruited guest workers for mining and heavy industries, who originally originated from Italy (Van den Broucke et al., 2015). After the mine disaster of Marcinelle in 1956, but also because of an increasing demand for labour during a period of economic growth, the government recruited new guest workers outside Europe from Turkey and Morocco during the early sixties (Reniers, 1999). Following the oil shocks and economic recession in the early 1970s, all immigration of non-EU guest workers was stopped in 1974. Given the growing uncertainty on how possibilities of family members to migrate would evolve, many Turkish and Moroccan guest workers decided to settle permanently in Belgium and bring over their spouses and family members. In subsequent decades, and in contrast to second generation migrants from European origin, a substantial share of second generation Turkish and Moroccan migrants continued to marry a partner from their parents' country of origin (Corijn & Lodewijckx, 2009). This form of migration, in

which brides and grooms are 'imported', had become the only available form of legal migration to Belgium for Turks and Moroccans (Reniers, 1999). As a result of these three migration waves, the Turkish and Maghreb origin groups account for a substantive share of the Belgian population: in 2014, 4,8% of the Belgian population had a Maghreb origin (16% of the population of foreign origin³) and 2,2% had an origin of a EU-candidate country, which includes Turkey (7,5% of the population of foreign origin) (FOD WASO & UNIA, 2017).

2.2 Gradual labour market entry

Labour market entry is no longer a one-time event from graduation to first employment, but rather a gradual process throughout young adulthood. Work experience is often already gained during education, as part-time education can be combined with part-time employment in Belgium from the age of sixteen onwards and can also be acquired during full-time education as part of a study program (e.g. internships) or other work experience outside school times (Baert, Neyt, Omeij, & Verhaest, 2017; Lucassen, 2003; Termote & Van Trier, 2011). The Labour Force Survey of 2009, for instance, shows that the transition from school to work is no longer single or unidirectional transition, as 13,5% of the 15-25 year olds had ever left education for more than a year for before returning to education. In addition, most school leavers change jobs multiple times, experience unemployment and start their career with interim jobs, temporary contracts and lower wages than the rest of the working population and gradually acquire more sustainable employment conditions over their career (Elchardus & Te Braak, 2014; Göbel & Verhofstadt, 2008; Stevens, 2009; Termote & Van Trier, 2011; Tielens & Herremans, 2009). However, results for the total Belgian working population seem to suggest that whereas natives often access a permanent contract, higher wages and full-time employment over their career, individuals with a non-European background face more difficulties in establishing a stable employment spell and more often remain employed in the secondary segment of the labour characterised by unstable labour market trajectories, temporary contracts, low wages and part-time employment (FOD WASO & UNIA, 2017; Kogan, 2004; Van Dooren, Struyven, & Sam, 2014; Vanduyndslager, Wets, Noppe, & Doyen, 2013). Whereas the larger part of the literature has adopted a cross-sectional perspective on employment positions, this study uses longitudinal microdata to analyse whether Turkish and Maghreb origin women who graduate in Belgium face more difficulties than native women to enter the labour market and to acquire sustainable employment.

3 Explaining labour market outcomes of migrant origin women

To explain the labour market outcomes of migrant origin women, and the differences with natives, scholars have addressed both factors external to a particular origin group (such as discrimination, segmented labour markets and spatial segregation), and factors intrinsic to the group, including social and human capital, socio-economic and cultural background, and country of origin (Baert et al., 2013; Glorieux, Laurijssen, & Van Dorsselaer, 2009; Heath, Rothon, & Kilpi, 2008; Khattab, 2009; Kogan, 2004; Pichler, 2011; Platt, 2005; Verhaeghe et al., 2013; Zhou, 1997). Over time and subsequent generations, these disadvantages are expected to weaken as migrants and their children learn the majority language and acquire local education (Chiswick, 1978).

As these theories have mainly focused on employment status, rather than how these different factors affect entry into and exit from employment spells, this section considers whether and how these theoretical frameworks can be used to understand transitions leading sustainable employment. More specifically, we assess to what extent human capital, household characteristics and social background can explain differentials between natives, and women of Turkish and Maghreb origin with respect to

³ Individuals with a foreign origin are defined as individuals who have a foreign nationality, who are born with a foreign nationality or who have at least one foreign born parent.

i) entries into and exits from sustainable employment, ii) characteristics of employment spells, and iii) how the impact of these factors differs between natives, the intermediate and second generation.

Human capital

Despite the fact that intermediate and second generation Turkish and Maghreb women (have partially) enrolled in the same educational system as native women, they are more likely to exit the educational system without obtaining a degree of secondary education, they less often have tertiary qualifications and they are typically enrolled in fields of education which offer poorer employment prospects such as textile, food and secretariat (Baert & Cockx, 2013; FOD WASO & UNIA, 2017; Glorieux et al., 2009; VDAB, 2004). Research has shown that highly educated school leavers (ISCED 5-6) not only have a shorter unemployment spell before finding a first job than low educated school leavers (ISCED 0-2), they are also more likely to enter a stable employment spell (Baert et al., 2016; Mazrekaj, De Witte, & Vansteenkiste, 2017; Uhlendorff & Zimmermann, 2006; VDAB, 2014, 2017). In addition, empirical evidence shows that level of education has a positive impact on wages and that highly educated are more likely than less educated individuals to have white collar and high autonomy jobs, as well as indefinite and full-time contracts (Fabra & Camisón, 2009; Vansteenkiste & Sourbron, 2016; Verhofstadt, 2007). Research has demonstrated, however, that substantial ethnic penalties remain when controlling for differences in educational attainment (Corluy, 2014; Neels & Stoop, 2000). In addition, many potential determinants of human capital, such as field of education, language skills and previous work experience have hitherto remained empirically untested due to the limited availability of large-scale longitudinal data. Once a spell of employment has been entered or several spells have been accumulated, work experience may gain importance to evaluate skills and productivity rather than the level of education initially obtained. However, since research has shown that lower educated are more likely than highly educated individuals to experience a transition from employment into unemployment or inactivity, as a result of an increased demand for highly educated individuals and their overrepresentation in occupations and economic branches that are particularly vulnerable during economic restructuring (Gesthuizen & Wolbers, 2010; Kogan, 2004; Lauer, 2003), we expect that educational credentials nevertheless offer an important explanation for ethnic differences in sustainable employment spell exits.

Apart from education, there is considerable evidence that proficiency in the host country's language strongly affects the likelihood to become employed (Heath et al., 2008; Van Tubergen, Maas, & Flap, 2004; VDAB, 2008), earnings (Chiswick & Miller, 1995), and other employment characteristics, although the relevance of linguistic skills and communication varies over sectors and occupational activities (Esser, 2006). Since Turkish and Maghreb origin youngsters often do not speak Dutch at home and generally have lower Dutch language skills than natives (UNIA, 2016; Vanduyndael et al., 2013), we expect that a lack of Dutch language skills is an important factor in explaining migrant-native differentials in entering a sustainable employment spell and in the characteristics of the employment spell. As migrant origin women who have entered a sustainable employment spell have already proven their Dutch language skills, we expect that language skills are less important in explaining the exit out of a sustainable employment spell.

Since Turkish and Maghreb women of the intermediate generation are not born in Belgium, they have had less exposure to the Belgian educational system than the second generation and natives. As children who arrive at older ages, for example after primary school, often miss out on important lessons on numeracy and literacy, age at arrival has a negative impact on educational attainment (Hermansen, 2017; Neels, 2000). In addition, as younger children learn new languages with greater ease and success than adolescents, Dutch language proficiency of the intermediate generation is expected to be lower than that of the second generation. In sum, we expect that various aspects of

human capital are more relevant to explain differentials between natives and the intermediate generation- especially for women who immigrated at later ages- than they are to account for differences between natives and the second generation.

Household characteristics

Women of Turkish or Maghreb origin are characterized by younger ages at marriage and childbearing than native women (Corijn & Lodewijckx, 2009), which may imply that these women marry before being (firmly) established in the labour market. For women in unstable labour market positions with low incomes and/or irregular working hours, however, family formation may hamper the entry into a sustainable employment spell, as a result of practical and financial difficulties associated with combining motherhood and employment (Kil, Neels, et al., 2017). On the other hand, women with rather traditional values of gender roles may prefer to stay at home full-time or work only part-time to take care of their children and the household, and may be thus not looking for a sustainable employment spell. Women of Turkish or Maghreb origin also frequently marry a partner of the same origin who was born in Belgium or an imported partner from the parents' country of origin. Whereas marrying a co-ethnic of the second generation often results in the endorsement of rather traditional gender roles, the choice of second-generation women to marry an imported groom may allow to avoid the traditional habit of moving in with their husbands' parents and thus bend traditional gendered power relations, given that their recently arrived husband has no or limited networks, does not know the country and the language, while frequently being higher educated (Khoudja & Platt, 2016). In the literature there is no consensus on whether and to what extent there are differences between native and migrant origin women in gender role attitudes, however, since gender values are subject to early socialisation processes (Khoudja & Platt, 2016), we expect gender role attitudes to vary across ethnic groups and between the intermediate and second generation. In addition, it is also important to stress that household conditions, human capital and female labour force participation are highly interrelated, as women with low ambitions and opportunities on the labour market may invest less in their education and may choose full-time parenthood as an alternative career (Khoudja & Fleischmann, 2014).

Social background

Due to the specific migration background of their parents, Turkish and Maghreb origin children are disproportionately raised in working-class and low income families by low educated parents who have limited Dutch language skills. Research suggests that socio-economic background affects early labour market outcomes both directly, through networks, economic resources and job advice, and indirectly, through educational outcomes and language skills (Glorieux et al., 2009; Gracia, Vázquez-Quesada, & Van de Werfhorst, 2016; Heath et al., 2008; Verhaeghe, Van der Bracht, & Van de Putte, 2015; Zuccotti, 2015). However, there is also considerable evidence that first generation parents have higher aspirations for their children's education and labour market outcomes as part of a social mobility project for their family (Modood, 2004; Van de Werfhorst & Van Tubergen, 2007; Zhou, 2005). Further, parents' employment status and gender roles may influence directly and indirectly (through women's own employment status) the gender roles attitudes of their children, which in the case of Turkish and Maghreb origin women may result in the endorsement of rather traditional gender roles (de Valk, 2008; Moen, Erickson, & Dempster-McClain, 1997). However, there might be an important difference between the intermediate and second generation. Whereas the former has experienced early-childhood socialisation in the country of origin, the latter has grown up in an intermediate position between a more egalitarian host society and a more traditionally oriented family of origin (de Valk & Milewski, 2011). We therefore expect that parental characteristics influence the probability of entering a sustainable employment spell, as well as the employment characteristics. However, if women have

entered a sustainable employment spell, we hypothesise that parental characteristics only indirectly influence the probability to exit the employment spell through the employment characteristics (Kogan, 2004).

4 Data and methods

4.1 Data

The analyses use data from the administrative panel on Migration, Integration and Activation (MIA Panel) from 2005-2016, which links longitudinal microdata from the Belgian Social Security Registers (KSZ/CBSS) to data from the public employment service of Flanders (VDAB). The data infrastructure provides information on a sample of individuals of i) Southern European origin, ii) non-European origin and iii) individuals without a migration background, aged 18-65 and legally residing in Belgium on January 1st 2005. Sampled individuals are subsequently followed until i) the age of 65, ii) emigration/death, or iii) the end of the observation period on December 31st 2016. To maintain cross-sectional representativeness, supplementary annual samples of 18-year-olds were drawn to guarantee the presence of the youngest age group in the data. For each observation year, household members of sampled individuals on the first of January are also included in the data. The data set is disproportionately stratified by age and migration background, with sampling fractions ranging from 0,5 per cent for individuals without a migration background to 20 per cent for individuals of Southern European origin and 15 per cent for non-European origin groups for 18-35 year olds. The sampling fractions for the group aged 36-65 years are half of the fractions used to sample 18-35 year olds.

The analysis of the transition into a first spell of sustainable employment is based on data for 5526 women who have reached the earliest possible age of graduation, given their highest level of education, in Flanders between 2005 and 2016⁴. The Crossroads Bank for Social Security provides data on first nationality of both women and their (grand)parents, allowing us to identify women of the intermediate and second generation. A woman is considered to be of migrant origin when she herself (intermediate generation) or one of her parents (second generation) have a first nationality that is not Belgian. When both parents have a different first foreign nationality, origin reflects the first nationality of the father⁵. The analysis include 1676 women of Belgian origin, 1781 women of Turkish origin (289 intermediate and 1492 second generation), as well as 2069 women of Maghreb origin (314 intermediate and 1755 second generation). The analyses on the characteristics and the duration of the first spell of sustainable employment only include women who have entered a spell of sustainable employment and who have not been censored before the fifth quarter of the spell. We observe these women until they become unemployed or inactive, or censoring. These analyses include 2595 women in total, consisting of 1033 women without a migration background, 852 women of Maghreb origin (119 intermediate and 733 second generation) and 710 women of Turkish origin (116 intermediate and 594 second generation).

⁴ If the level of education is unknown, which is the case for 41% of the sample, women are observed from the age of 18.

⁵ In the analyses on sustainable employment spell entry 1,6% of the observed women has two parents with a different first foreign nationality.

4.2 Analyses

Entering a first sustainable employment spell

The first set of analyses focuses on the transition into the first spell of sustainable employment which requires that three conditions are fulfilled. First, since the likelihood to become unemployed decreases with the length of the employment spell and becomes stable after twelve months (VDAB, 2014), an employment spell of four consecutive quarters is used as an indicator for stable employment. The second condition implies that the gross monthly wage in the fourth quarter of the employment spell is at least 82 per cent of the minimum wage in Belgium, as women can be observed from the age of 18 onwards, and individuals younger than 21 earn a certain percentage of the minimum wage⁶. Finally, because women with a non-European background are overrepresented in part-time employment of maximum 40 per cent of a full-time equivalent (FOD WASO & CGKR, 2013), the third condition implies that the employment spell has to lead to a work intensity of at least 40 per cent of the standard number of work hours for a full-time position in the sector of employment by the fourth quarter of the employment spell. We do not have information about income and work intensity for the self-employed, but since self-employment is a considerable step in Belgium, this is assumed as employment with at least 82 per cent of the minimum wage and a work intensity of at least 40 per cent.

Figure 1 shows the cumulative incidence of ever having entered a first spell of employment, contrasting different definitions of sustainable employment: i) employment of two consecutive quarters, ii) employment of four consecutive quarters, with iii) employment of four consecutive quarters with a at least 82 percent of the Belgian minimum wage and a minimum work intensity of 40 per cent in the fourth quarter. The cumulative incidence curve starts at 0 when no one has yet entered a first spell of employment and gradually increases over time (quickly if the discrete-time hazard or risk of entering is high) with a maximum value of 1. Clearly, the conditions on stability, income and work intensity result in a slower tempo of entering a first spell of sustainable employment and lowers proportions ultimately making the transition in the observation window, suggesting that women frequently experience short spells of work before entering what is considered here as sustainable employment.

Figure 1 about here

In order to assess whether and to what extent the differences between native women and women of Turkish or Maghreb origin in entering a first sustainable employment spell can be accounted for by individual, previous employment, household and parental characteristic, four nested discrete-time hazard models using a complementary log-log link function are estimated to analyse how the probability of entering a first spell of sustainable employment in a given quarter depends on time since leaving education and covariates. The overall time dependence of the hazard is estimated as follows:

$$\ln[-\ln(1 - q(t))] = \hat{\alpha} + \sum \hat{\beta}_k t_{ki} \quad (1)$$

$$[-\ln(1 - q(t))] = \int_t^{t+\Delta t} h(t) dt = H(t) = e^{\hat{\alpha} + \sum \hat{\beta}_k t_{ki}} \quad (2)$$

Where $q(t)$ represents the (discrete-time) probability of entering a spell of sustainable employment in quarter t , $h(t)$ the unobserved (continuous-time) hazard of entering an employment spell and $H(t)$

⁶ Individuals of 18, 19 and 20 year old earn respectively 82%, 88% and 94% of the minimum wage. For example, in the second semester of 2016, the Belgian gross minimum monthly wage was €1532, resulting in a minimum monthly wage of €1256 for 18 year olds.

the hazard that is accumulated within the quarter observed. The overall survivor function, $S(t)$, and the overall cumulative incidence function of entering a first spell of sustainable employment, $CI(t)$, can be derived as follows:

$$S(t) = e^{-\int_0^t h(t)dt} = e^{-\sum_0^t H(t)} \quad (3)$$

$$CI(t) = 1 - e^{-\sum_0^t H(t)} \quad (4)$$

To estimate gross ethnic differentials in the tempo and incidence of entering a spell of sustainable employment within the observation window, *Model 0* includes i) number of quarters since the earliest possible graduation moment, given the highest level of education (exposure), both linear and quadratic, ii) a time-varying dummy variable indicating whether someone is entitled to child benefits, which is an indicator for being a student⁷, iii) origin group (native, intermediate and second generation Turkish and Maghreb women), iv) the interaction between exposure and origin group, and v) the interaction between exposure and entitlement to child benefits. Entitlement to child benefits is included as a time-varying dummy, since women are observed from the earliest possible graduation moment, but can have had delays in their study programme, enrol in an educational program without completing it or leave education temporarily before resuming at a later stage. Also, if the level of education is unknown we observe women from the age of 18, but have an indicator for their educational participation by using this variable.

Three additional models are estimated to assess ethnic differentials in entering a first spell of sustainable employment net of individual, household and parental characteristics. *Model 1* additionally controls for individual-level characteristics (age, highest level and field of education and Dutch language skills⁸) and previous employment (cumulated quarters work experience and activity status in the previous quarter). A dummy indicating whether someone is ever registered in the public employment service of Flanders (VDAB) is also included, as information on educational credentials and language skills are derived from VDAB data and contact with VDAB is also related to entry in a sustainable employment spell. In addition to the interactions already included in Model 0, Model 1 includes interaction terms between exposure and i) level and field of education, ii) age, and iii) quarters work experience. *Model 2* additionally controls for household characteristics, which are i) the number of children, ii) the presence and iii) income of the partner. In addition to the interactions included in Models 0 and 1, Model 2 includes interaction terms between exposure and the number of children. Finally, *Model 3* additionally includes a time-varying covariate reflecting income of the parents⁹. Tables 1 and 2 provide the categories and distribution of the covariates, and the sample sizes for the analyses on entry in a first sustainable employment spell. As the baseline cumulative hazard function (reference) differs across models as a result of adding covariates – making it difficult to compare ethnic differentials across models - the parameter estimates representing the time-varying ethnic

⁷ Until 31 August of the year in which a child turns 18, she is unconditional entitled to child benefits. From 1 September of the year in which a child turns 18 until the month in which she turns 25, a child is entitled to child benefits if she is i) in secondary education, or ii) in tertiary education, with a study programme of at least 27 credits a year.

⁸ For women who were ever registered in the public employment service of Flanders (VDAB), we have information on Dutch language knowledge, which is self-reported. Other women are in the category unknown'.

⁹ For women who leave the parental home during the observation period, the variable becomes time-constant in the quarters after leaving the parental home, reflecting the last observed income of the parents.

differentials in models 0 through 3 have been applied to the overall survivor and cumulative incidence functions (equations 1-4) for the sake of representation.

Characteristics of the first job in the sustainable employment spell

For women who entered a first spell of sustainable employment in the observation window, a second set of analyses focuses on ethnic differentials in the type of employment, type of contract and gross wage quintile of the first job of the sustainable employment spell. Type of employment consists of four categories: i) white collar and civil servant, ii) blue collar, iii) self-employment, and iv) unknown type of employment. Type of contract distinguishes between i) full-time contracts, ii) part-time contracts, iii) temporary contracts (interim, seasonal employment, flexible employment), iv) self-employment, and v) unknown types of contract. Finally, also the gross wage quintile is taken into account¹⁰. For each job characteristic, a similar set of four nested multinomial logit regression models are estimated. *Model 0* only includes origin group and generation whereas *Models 1 through 3* assess ethnic differentials after additionally controlling for (1) individual characteristics (age, level and field of education and Dutch language skills) and previous employment characteristics (cumulated quarters work experience and activity status in the previous quarter), (2) household characteristics (number of children and the presence and income of the partner), and (3) parental characteristics (parental income). For each employment characteristic, we estimate ethnic differentials in predicted probabilities.

Exiting a first sustainable employment spell

Using four nested discrete-time hazard models similar to equations 1-4, we finally assess whether there are differentials between women of Turkish and Maghreb origin and Belgian women in the likelihood of becoming unemployed or inactive after a first spell of sustainable employment. If women are incapable to work or take up leave or time credit for one, two or three consecutive quarters this is not considered as an exit out of the employment spell. Women who are incapable to work for one year or longer are censored, and women who take up leave or time credit for one year or longer are considered as exiting of the employment spell¹¹. Similar to previous models, *Model 0* considers the gross ethnic differentials and only includes i) the number of quarters since the first sustainable employment spell of four quarters (exposure), ii) origin group (native women versus intermediate and second generation Turkish and Maghreb women), and iii) an interaction between exposure and origin group. *Model 1* additionally controls for individual characteristics (age, level and field of education and Dutch language skills) and previous employment experience (cumulated work experience, and type of contract and gross wage quintile in the previous quarter). *Model 2* additionally controls the number of children and the presence and income of the partner. Finally, *Model 3* additionally includes parental income. Variation across models in the ethnic differentials of exiting a sustainable employment spell over subsequent models, is illustrated by applying the parameter estimates that represent time-varying ethnic differentials to the overall survivor and cumulative incidence curves as before (equations 1-4).

Tables 1 and 2 about here

¹⁰ Since we do not have information about the income for the self-employed, we exclude the self-employed in the analyses on gross wage quintile.

¹¹ As a result of being incapable to work for one year or longer, 10 women are censored and 38 women are considered as exiting for taking up leave or time credit for one year or longer.

5 Results

5.1 Descriptive Analyses

Ethnic differentials in labour market positions already emerge at the beginning of the professional career, as women of Turkish or Maghreb origin face more difficulties in establishing themselves in the labour market. Figure 2a shows that women without a migration background are substantially more likely in each quarter to enter a sustainable employment spell than women of Turkish or Maghreb origin. These differences in transition rates cumulate over the life course, resulting in considerable differences between origin groups and generations in the proportion of women that ultimately enters a first sustainable employment spell in the observation window (Figure 2b). Whereas 86 per cent of the native women have ever entered a first sustainable employment spell in twelve years since leaving education, this is limited to 51 and 54 per cent for intermediate generation Turkish and Maghreb woman respectively, and 67 per cent for the second generation. Since 60 per cent of our sample consists of second generation women, the baseline largely reflects their labour market outcomes.

Figure 2 about here

Focussing on women who effectively entered a sustainable employment spell, Figures 3a-c show for each origin group and generation the type of employment, type of contract and gross wage quintile of the first job in the sustainable employment spell. The distribution of these three job characteristics differs significantly by origin group and generation. Women of Turkish or Maghreb origin are less likely than natives to start their sustainable employment spell with i) a white collar or civil servant job (differences range from 3 to 27 percentage points), ii) a full-time contract (differences ranging from 10 to 17 percentage points), and iii) a higher wage (differential proportions of women in the fifth income quintile ranging from 5 to 9 percentage points).

Figure 3 about here

Turkish or Maghreb origin women are not only less likely than native women to enter a sustainable employment spell, they are also more likely to become unemployed or inactive afterwards. In line with previous research Figure 4a shows that the probability to become unemployed or inactive decreases quickly as individuals have a longer employment spell (VDAB, 2014). However, women of Turkish or Maghreb origin are more likely to become unemployed or inactive after a spell of sustainable employment than native women, with differences being particularly large in the first two years. The likelihood to become unemployed or inactive in the first quarter immediately following a sustainable employment spell of four consecutive quarters amounts to 3 per cent for native women, but ranges from 6 to 9 per cent for women of Turkish and Maghreb origin respectively. These migrant-native differences result in considerable ethnic differentials in the proportion of women that becomes unemployed or inactive after a sustainable employment spell in the observation window (Figure 4b). Whereas 41 per cent of native women has become unemployed or inactive eleven year after a sustainable employment spell of four quarters, this ranges from 61 to 78 per cent among women of Turkish and Maghreb origin respectively.

Figure 4 about here

5.2 Multivariate analyses

As the descriptive findings do not control for confounding factors, multivariate models are used to assess whether these ethnic disadvantages can be accounted for individual characteristics, previous employment experience, household characteristics and parental characteristics. Section 5.2.1 focuses on the entry into a first sustainable employment spell. Subsequently, for women who effectively

entered a sustainable employment spell, section 5.2.2 considers ethnic differentials in the characteristics of the first job in their spell, whereas section 5.2.3 finally focuses on the likelihood of becoming unemployed or inactive following the initial spell of sustainable employment spell of four quarters.

5.2.1 Entering a first sustainable employment spell

For intermediate and second generation women of Turkish and Maghreb origin, Figures 5a-d show the gross and net ethnic differentials in the cumulative incidence of entering a first sustainable employment spell over subsequent models. Model 0 represents the gross ethnic differentials. Initially, the gap between women of Turkish or Maghreb origin and natives is relatively small, amounting to approximately 5 percentage points one year after leaving education. However, since Turkish and Maghreb origin women are also less likely to enter a sustainable employment spell in subsequent quarters, the differentials increase over the early life course, resulting in substantial gaps with native women. For intermediate generation Turkish women, the gross ethnic gap increases quickly, up to 47 percentage points from quarter 25 onwards. For intermediate generation Maghreb women, the gross ethnic gap reaches a maximum of 44 percentage points around quarter 20, which subsequently diminishes to 37 percentage points twelve years after the earliest possible graduation moment. Gross differentials with natives are smaller for the second generation, but still substantial, reaching a maximum of 25 percentage points around five years since leaving education.

Controlling for individual characteristics (age, educational level and field, Dutch language skills and ever contact with VDAB) and previous employment experience (cumulated quarters work experience and activity status in the preceding quarter) in Model 1, the likelihood of entering a sustainable employment spell decreases for native women and increases for the intermediate generation, resulting in a reduction of the ethnic penalty. This is due to the fact that intermediate generation Turkish and Maghreb women are, compared to native women, overrepresented in lower educational levels and suffer more limited Dutch language skills (Table 1). In addition, during the observation period 36 to 39 per cent of intermediate generation women were inactive while not being entitled to child benefits in the preceding quarter (Table 2), which may be an indicator that these women are not actively looking for a sustainable employment spell. For the second generation, the likelihood of entering a sustainable employment spell decreases in Model 1. This is due to the fact that, as a group, they are situated in positions that are characterised by relatively good chances to enter a sustainable employment spell (e.g. technical and post-secondary education, combined with good Dutch language skills). As a result, when controlling for their differential profile for these characteristics, we see that their likelihood to enter a sustainable employment spell decreases, but since there is a larger decrease for native women, the ethnic penalty is also reduced for the second generation. Additionally controlling for number of children and the partner's income in Model 2, further reduces ethnic disadvantages for the intermediate generation, which is largely explained by the number of children. Whereas only 4 per cent of Belgian women started family formation before having entered a sustainable employment spell, this ranges from 36 to 40 per cent for intermediate generation women of Turkish and Maghreb origin (Table 2). For the second generation, controlling for household characteristics results only in a small additional decrease (approximately 1 percentage point) in the ethnic gap. Finally, controlling for parental income significantly improves the model. Table 2 shows that women of Turkish or Maghreb origin are overrepresented in households with no working parents. Model 3 suggest that parental income adds little explanatory power, however, parental characteristics have mainly an indirect effect on labour market entry through individual characteristics (e.g. resources to support education), that are already included in Model 1, and have only a small direct effect.

Overall, we see that individual, previous employment, household and parental characteristics play an important role in explaining differences between Turkish and Maghreb origin women and native women in entering a sustainable employment spell. For intermediate generation Turkish women the decrease in the ethnic gap reaches a maximum around five years after leaving education, as it decreases from 45 percentage points in Model 0 to 24 percentage points in Model 3. For intermediate generation Maghreb women the ethnic gap decreases from 43 percentage points in Model 0 to 20 percentage points in Model 3 five years after leaving education. Results further show that these factors have more explanatory power for the intermediate generation than for second generation Turkish and Maghreb women, as the gap with native women decreases for second generation maximum with 7 percentage points.

Age at migration has an important impact on language development, educational opportunities and socialisation processes. As a result, we repeated the same analyses, but now additionally distinguishing between women of the intermediate generation that migrated to Belgium before and after the age of twelve. In our sample, respectively 53 and 67 per cent of the intermediate generation Turkish and Maghreb women who migrated after the age of twelve. The results (not shown) indicate that women who migrated before the age of twelve largely follow the same pattern as the second generation, whereas women migrated after the age of twelve are characterised by large ethnic gaps with native women that have decreased strongly in Model 3. Finally, although the ethnic gap diminishes after controlling for individual, previous employment, household and parental characteristics, there is still a substantial difference between women of Turkish and Maghreb origin and native women in the likelihood to enter a sustainable employment spell. The maximum gap ranges from 20 percentage points for intermediate generation Maghreb women and the second generation to 30 percentage points for intermediate generation Turkish women.

Figure 5 about here

5.2.2 Characteristics of the first job in the sustainable employment spell

Focussing on women who effectively entered a sustainable employment spell, Figures 6 a-c show the gross predicted probabilities by origin group and generation for a) the type of employment, b) type of contract and c) gross wage quintile of the first job in the sustainable employment spell (Model 0), as well as the predicted probabilities controlling for individual and previous employment characteristics (Model 1), household characteristics (Model 2) and parental characteristics (Model 3). In line with Figure 3, Model 0 shows that, compared to native women, women of Turkish and Maghreb origin are less likely to start their sustainable employment spell i) in a white collar or civil servant job, ii) with a full-time contract, and iii) a gross wage similar to natives. They are also 7 to 11 per cent more likely to enter the employment spell with a temporary contract (interim, seasonal or flexible employment). After individual and previous employment characteristics are taken into account, the ethnic differentials shift considerably. The likelihood to start the employment spell with a white collar or civil servant job, a full-time contract and a higher wage, increases for women of Turkish or Maghreb origin and decreases for native women. The difference with native women of entering a sustainable employment spell with a white collar job, decreases by 21, 14 and 10 per cent for Turkish G1.5, Maghreb G1.5 and Turkish G2 women respectively. Controlling for these characteristics, second generation Maghreb women are even 7 per cent more likely than native women to start the spell in a white collar job. The decrease of migrant-native differences is smaller for entering a sustainable employment spell with a full-time contract, amounting to 9 and 5 per cent for intermediate generation Turkish and Maghreb women respectively and 6 per cent for the second generation. The difference with native women in starting the sustainable employment spell with a job in the two highest wage quintiles has decreased with 4 to 8 per cent. Additionally controlling for household and parental

characteristics significantly improves the models, but these characteristics have only a small direct effect on the type of employment, type of contract and wage quintile, resulting in an additional decrease in the migrant-native differences of only 1 to 3 per cent. Overall, ethnic differences strongly diminish after controlling for individual, previous employment, household and parental characteristics and range from 1 to 4 per cent for type of employment, from 2 to 14 per cent for type of contract and from 0 to 5 per cent in the two highest wage quintiles.

Figure 6 about here

5.2.3 Exiting a first sustainable employment spell

Among women who have entered an employment spell of four consecutive quarters, leading to at least the Belgian minimum wage and a work intensity of 40 per cent, Figures 4a-b show that women of Turkish and Maghreb origin are more likely than native women to exit the sustainable employment spell. Figures 7a-d show for intermediate and second generation Turkish and Maghreb women whether these differentials with natives in the cumulative incidence of exiting a sustainable employment spell can be explained by individual and previous employment characteristics (Model 1), household characteristics (Model 2) and parental characteristics (Model 3).

The gross ethnic differentials in exit incidence after one year (Model 0) range from 2 percentage points for Turkish G1.5 women to 19 percentage points for Turkish G2 women. Differences with native women subsequently increase, resulting in a gap that ranges from 27 to 34 percentage points by the end of the observation period. After controlling for individual and employment characteristics in Model 1, the likelihood to exit the sustainable employment spell increases for natives and decreases for Turkish and Maghreb origin women, except for intermediate generation Maghreb women. As a result, the gap with native women decreases by 6 percentage points for women of Maghreb origin (G1.5 and G2) and by 11 percentage points for women of Turkish origin (G1.5 and G2). This is largely explained by the previous employment characteristics, as women of Turkish or Maghreb origin are underrepresented in full-time employment and the higher wage quintiles. Additionally controlling for household characteristics significantly improves the model and the gap with native women slightly declines with approximately 1 percentage point. Finally additionally including parental income in Model 3 offers no significant improvement of the model. Overall, the ethnic gap in exiting the first sustainable employment spell decreased with 8 percentage points for women of Maghreb origin (G1.5 and G2) and by 12 percentage points for women of Turkish origin (G1.5 and G2).

Figure 7 about here

6 Discussion and conclusion

Existing research on labour market participation of migrant origin women has predominantly focused on their employment positions at a single point in time, hereby failing to acknowledge that most individuals start their career with interim jobs and low wages, change jobs multiple times, experience multiple unemployment spells, and gradually acquire more stable and sustainable employment positions across early adulthood. For most Western-European countries, cross-sectional research suggests that migrant origin women, and especially non-European origin women, remain employed in the secondary segment of the labour market, characterised by unstable labour market trajectories, low wages and part-time employment (FOD WASO & UNIA, 2017; Pichler, 2011). Focussing on employment status, however, misses out on an important part of migrant-native differentials, as the question is not only whether there are ethnic differentials in employment positions, but also whether migrant origin women have the same probabilities as natives to acquire a stable employment spell with a sufficient income over their career. Moreover, prior longitudinal research on employment

trajectories of migrant women has shown that early disadvantages in acquiring stable labour market trajectories with low incomes affect labour market positions and opportunities (e.g. maternal employment) and social security (e.g. pensions) at later stages of the life course (Goos, Manning, & Salomons, 2009; Kil, Neels, et al., 2017; Neels, De Wachter, & Peeters, 2018; Peeters et al., 2017). Finally, successful labour market integration of migrant origin women has become increasingly important in a context of population ageing and is important to prevent the polarisation of households and inequalities in poverty risks (De Klerck et al., 2016; OECD, 2008).

Building on previous work, this study uses longitudinal microdata to study early labour market trajectories of Turkish and Maghreb origin women who graduated in Belgium (Flanders). We first assess whether the likelihood to enter a sustainable employment spell differs between natives and women with a migration background, operationalising a sustainable employment spell as an employment spell of at least four consecutive quarters, leading to a gross monthly wage of at least 82 per cent of the gross Belgian minimum wage and a work intensity of at least 40 per cent of a full-time position in the fourth quarter of the employment spell. For women who effectively entered a spell of sustainable employment in the observation period, we additionally consider ethnic differentials in the characteristics of the first sustainable employment spell (type of employment, type of contract and gross wage quintile), as well as the length of the sustainable employment spell. In doing so, we not only distinguish between origin groups, but also between the intermediate and second generation to take differences in (gender role) socialisation, language development and educational opportunities into account (Hermansen, 2017).

Our analyses show that women of Turkish and Maghreb origin who graduated in Belgium are not only less likely than native women to enter a sustainable employment spell, but are also more likely to exit the sustainable employment spell into unemployment or inactivity. These differentials with natives are larger for the intermediate generation- particularly for women who migrated after the age of 12- than for the second generation, and are reproduced and reinforced over labour market careers, as (dis)advantages cumulate over the early life course. To explain the weaker labour market outcomes of the second generation, the literature has frequently referred to lower human capital (Becker, 1964). Consistent with earlier studies, our results indicate that level of education only partially explains ethnic differentials in entering and exiting a first sustainable employment spell and the characteristics of the sustainable employment spell, and that substantial ethnic penalties remain as a result (Baert et al., 2016; Corluy, 2014; Mazrekaj et al., 2017; Neels & Stoop, 2000). In addition to earlier studies, we also included field of education, Dutch language skills and previous work experience as potential determinants. As expected, lower Dutch language skills offer an additional explanation for migrant-native differentials in i) entering sustainable employment and ii) the characteristics of the employment spell (Esser, 2006; Heath et al., 2008), however, in line with Kogan (2004) we find that employment characteristics (work experience, lower wages and part-time employment) play the most important role in explaining ethnic differentials in the risk of exiting the sustainable employment spell. Our results further demonstrate that women of Turkish or Maghreb origin, and particularly of the intermediate generation, more often started family before having entered a sustainable employment spell, which partially explains ethnic differentials in entering sustainable employment. It is unclear from our analyses, however, whether migrant origin women hold more traditional gender roles regarding female responsibilities to take care of the children and the household, and no longer actively look to enter a sustainable employment spell after the start of family formation (de Valk, 2008; Khoudja & Fleischmann, 2014), or whether migrant origin women more often than natives face financial and practical obstacles in combining motherhood and employment, such as affordability of formal childcare, due to unstable labour market positions and low incomes (Kil, Neels, et al., 2017; Kil, Wood, et al., 2017). In line with the former, our first models controlled whether women are inactive without

being entitled to child benefits, which may be an indicator that these women are not (actively) looking for a sustainable employment spell. However, considerable ethnic gaps remain, which may support the latter interpretation as also previous longitudinal research has pointed to a strong socio-economic and ethnic gradient in the use of childcare and parental leave in Belgium, resulting in a lock-in effect or inactivity trap for women who start family formation before they are firmly established in the labour market (Kil, Neels, et al., 2017; Kil, Wood, et al., 2017; Van Lancker & Ghysels, 2012). As non-European origin children are disproportionately raised in working-class and low income families, we finally also controlled for parental characteristics. Our results suggest, however, that parental income mostly has an indirect effect on entering a sustainable employment spell and the characteristics of the employment spell, through children's individual and previous employment characteristics. Regarding the exit from a sustainable employment spell, parental income offers no significant improvement of our model.

Although ethnic differentials diminish after controlling for individual, previous employment, household and parental characteristics- particularly for women who immigrated after the age of 12- women of Turkish or Maghreb origin who graduated in Belgium remain disadvantaged compared to natives in i) entering and exiting a sustainable employment spell, and ii) the characteristics of the sustainable employment spell. In addition, whereas native women enter a sustainable employment spell often directly after education, migrant origin women are more frequently looking for a job or employed without fulfilling the conditions on stability, income and work intensity, suggesting that the labour market consists of insiders on the one hand who enjoy greater job stability, and outsiders on the other hand who tend to move from one temporary contract to another (Van Dooren et al., 2014). Since difficulties in acquiring sustainable employment have long-lasting implications and social rights are in Belgium tied to the occupational position and conditioned on long and uninterrupted professional careers, future research should assess whether activation policies succeed in helping migrant origin women to enter employment, and more importantly, sustainable employment. In this line, for women who are ever registered in the public employment service of Flanders (VDAB) between 2005 and 2016, our data infrastructure includes information on trainings and courses, allowing future research to assess whether and to what extent language courses, internships and other interventions improve the likelihood to enter a sustainable employment spell.

The Belgian social security registers provide unique longitudinal microdata on the labour market position of women with and without a migration background, but data limitations remain. First, due to a lack of information about first nationality of the grandparents, we were not able to distinguish the third generation from native women. Second, our data does not allow to distinguish Maghreb origin women by country of origin, while previous research has demonstrated that the culture of women and work is rather different across the Maghreb countries (Moghadam, 2003). Third, information on educational credentials is not fully documented, resulting in unknown levels and fields of education of approximately 40 per cent of the sampled women and making it impossible to assess the educational levels of the parents. Finally, our data does not provide direct information on gender role attitudes, informal networks and discrimination, which are also likely to account for part of the remaining variation (Baert et al., 2013; de Valk, 2008; Djait, 2014).

7 References

- Baert, S., & Cockx, B. (2013). Pure ethnic gaps in educational attainment and school to work transitions: When do they arise? *Economics of Education Review*, 36, 276-294.
- Baert, S., Cockx, B., Gheyle, N., & Vandamme, C. (2013). Do employers discriminate less if vacancies are difficult to fill? Evidence from a field experiment.
- Baert, S., Heiland, F. W., & Korenman, S. (2016). Native-Immigrant Gaps in Educational and School-to-Work Transitions in the 2nd Generation: The Role of Gender and Ethnicity. *De Economist*, 164(2), 159-186.
- Baert, S., Neyt, B., Omeij, E., & Verhaest, D. (2017). *Student Work, Educational Achievement, and Later Employment: A Dynamic Approach*. Retrieved from
- Becker, G. (1964). Human capital: A theoretical and empirical approach. In: Co.
- CGKR. (2012). *Diversiteitsbarometer werk*. Retrieved from Brussel:
- Chiswick, B. R. (1978). The effect of Americanization on the earnings of foreign-born men. *Journal of political Economy*, 86(5), 897-921.
- Chiswick, B. R., & Miller, P. W. (1995). The endogeneity between language and earnings: International analyses. *Journal of Labor Economics*, 13(2), 246-288.
- Corijn, M., & Lodewijckx, E. (2009). *De start van de gezinsvorming bij de Turkse en Marokkaanse tweede generatie in het Vlaamse Gewest: Een analyse op basis van Rijksregistergegevens*: Studiedienst van de Vlaamse Regering.
- Corluy, V. (2014). *Labour market outcomes and trajectories of immigrants in Belgium*. Universiteit Antwerpen (Belgium),
- De Klerck, W., Boey, R., Djait, F., Gonzalez-Garibay, M., Jacobs, M., & Raymenants, J. (2016). *De Vlaamse arbeidsmarkt na 2020*. Retrieved from Brussel:
- de Valk, H. A. (2008). Parental influence on work and family plans of adolescents of different ethnic backgrounds in the Netherlands. *Sex Roles*, 59(9-10), 738-751.
- de Valk, H. A., & Milewski, N. (2011). Family life transitions among children of immigrants: An introduction. *Advances in Life Course Research*, 16(4), 145-151.
- Djait, F. (2014). Integratie op de Vlaamse arbeidsmarkt. *Internationale Migraties en Migranten in Vlaanderen*, 85-96.
- Elchardus, M., & Te Braak, P. (2014). Toekomstverwachtingen van jongvolwassenen. In: Rapport.
- Elloukmani, S., & Ou-Salah, L. (2018). Thuisblijven of Werken? Marokkaanse vrouwen op de arbeidsmarkt. *Armoede en sociale uitsluiting: jaarboek 2018*.
- Esser, H. (2006). *Migration, language and integration*: WZB.
- Fabra, M. E., & Camisón, C. (2009). Direct and indirect effects of education on job satisfaction: A structural equation model for the Spanish case. *Economics of Education Review*, 28(5), 600-610. doi:<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.econedurev.2008.12.002>
- FOD WASO, & UNIA. (2017). *Socio-economische monitoring: Arbeidsmarkt en Origine*. Retrieved from
- Gesthuizen, M., & Wolbers, M. H. J. (2010). Employment transitions in the Netherlands, 1980–2004: Are low educated men subject to structural or cyclical crowding out? *Research in Social Stratification and Mobility*, 28(4), 437-451. doi:<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.rssm.2010.06.001>
- Glorieux, I., Laurijssen, I., & Van Dorsselaer, Y. (2009). *Zwart op wit: de intrede van allochtonen op de arbeidsmarkt*: Garant.
- Göbel, C., & Verhofstadt, E. (2008). *The role of temporary employment for the integration of schoolleavers into permanent employment*. Paper presented at the XXII Annual Conference of the European Society for Population Economics, June.
- Goos, M., Manning, A., & Salomons, A. (2009). Job polarization in Europe. *American economic review*, 99(2), 58-63.
- Gracia, P., Vázquez-Quesada, L., & Van de Werfhorst, H. G. (2016). Ethnic penalties? The role of human capital and social origins in labour market outcomes of second-generation Moroccans and Turks in the Netherlands. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies*, 42(1), 69-87.

- Heath, A. F., Rethon, C., & Kilpi, E. (2008). The second generation in Western Europe: Education, unemployment, and occupational attainment. *Annu. Rev. Sociol.*, 34, 211-235.
- Hermansen, A. S. (2017). Age at arrival and life chances among childhood immigrants. *Demography*, 54(1), 201-229.
- Khattab, N. (2009). Ethno-religious background as a determinant of educational and occupational attainment in Britain. *Sociology*, 43(2), 304-322.
- Khoudja, Y., & Fleischmann, F. (2014). Ethnic differences in female labour force participation in the Netherlands: Adding gender role attitudes and religiosity to the explanation. *European Sociological Review*, 31(1), 91-102.
- Khoudja, Y., & Platt, L. (2016). Labour market entries and exits of women from different origin countries in the UK.
- Kil, T., Neels, K., Wood, J., & de Valk, H. (2017). Employment After Parenthood: Women of Migrant Origin and Natives Compared. *European Journal of Populations*.
- Kil, T., Wood, J., & Neels, K. (2017). Parental leave uptake among migrant and native mothers: Can precarious employment trajectories account for the difference? *Ethnicities*.
- Kogan, I. (2004). Last hired, first fired? The unemployment dynamics of male immigrants in Germany. *European Sociological Review*, 20(5), 445-461.
- Lauer, C. (2003). Education and unemployment: A French-German comparison.
- Lucassen, S. (2003). Bijbanen van onderwijsvolgende jeugd. CBS, *Sociaal-economische Maandstatistiek*, 2, 16-18.
- Mazrekaj, D., De Witte, K., & Vansteenkiste, S. (2017). Het rendement van een diploma middelbaar onderwijs op de Vlaamse arbeidsmarkt. *Leuven: Steunpunt Werk*.
- Mescoli, E. (2016). *Forgotten women: The impact of Islamophobia on Muslim women in Belgium*. Retrieved from Brussels:
- Modood, T. (2004). Capitals, ethnic identity and educational qualifications. *Cultural trends*, 13(2), 87-105.
- Moen, P., Erickson, M. A., & Dempster-McClain, D. (1997). Their mother's daughters? The intergenerational transmission of gender attitudes in a world of changing roles. *Journal of Marriage and the Family*, 281-293.
- Moghadam, V. M. (2003). *Modernizing women: Gender and social change in the Middle East*: Lynne Rienner Publishers.
- Neels, K. (2000). *Education and the transition to employment: young Turkish and Moroccan adults in Belgium*: na.
- Neels, K., De Wachter, D., & Peeters, H. (2018). The effect of family formation on the build-up of pension rights among minority ethnic groups and native women in Belgium. *Ageing & Society*, 38(6), 1253-1278.
- Neels, K., & Stoop, R. (2000). *Reassessing the ethnic gap: Employment of younger Turks and Moroccans in Belgium*: na.
- OECD. (2008). *Jobs for Immigrants (Vol. 2)*: OECD Publishing.
- Peeters, H., Neels, K., Havermans, N., Mortelmans, D., Donvil, N., De Wachter, D., & Cordeel, L. (2017). *De kleur van de vergrijzing*. Leuven: LannooCampus.
- Phalet, K., Deboosere, P., & Bastiaenssen, V. (2007). Old and new inequalities in educational attainment: Ethnic minorities in the Belgian Census 1991—2001. *Ethnicities*, 7(3), 390-415.
- Pichler, F. (2011). Success on European labor markets: A cross-national comparison of attainment between immigrant and majority populations. *International migration review*, 45(4), 938-978.
- Platt, L. (2005). The intergenerational social mobility of minority ethnic groups. *Sociology*, 39(3), 445-461.
- Rendall, M. S., Tsang, F., Rubin, J. K., Rabinovich, L., & Janta, B. (2010). Contrasting trajectories of labor-market integration between migrant women in Western and Southern Europe. *European Journal of Population/Revue européenne de Démographie*, 26(4), 383-410.
- Reniers, G. (1999). On the history and selectivity of Turkish and Moroccan migration to Belgium. *International Migration*, 37(4), 679-713.

- Stevens, E. (2009). *Jongeren in beeld. Een analyse op basis van EAK/LFS*. Retrieved from Leuven:
- Termote, A., & Van Trier, W. (2011). Hoe kan men best de overgang van school naar werk opvolgen? *Over.Werk. Tijdschrift van het Steunpunt WSE*, 21(2), 98-109.
- Tielens, M., & Herremans, W. (2009). *Schoolverlaters in hun eerste job. Een analyse op basis van het Datawarehouse AM&SM*. Retrieved from
- Uhlendorff, A., & Zimmermann, K. F. (2006). Unemployment dynamics among migrants and natives.
- UNIA. (2016). *Diversiteitsbarometer Onderwijs*. Retrieved from Brussel:
- Van de Werfhorst, H. G., & Van Tubergen, F. (2007). Ethnicity, schooling, and merit in the Netherlands. *Ethnicities*, 7(3), 416-444.
- Van den Broucke, S., Noppe, J., Stuyck, K., Buysschaert, P., Boyen, G., & Wets, J. (2015). *Vlaamse Migratie- en Integratiemonitor 2015*. Retrieved from
- Van Dooren, G., Struyven, L., & Sam, C. (2014). National report on the labour market position of vulnerable groups in Belgium.
- Van Lancker, W., & Ghysels, J. (2012). Who benefits? The social distribution of subsidized childcare in Sweden and Flanders. *Acta Sociologica*, 55(2), 125-142.
- Van Tubergen, F., Maas, I., & Flap, H. (2004). The economic incorporation of immigrants in 18 western societies: Origin, destination, and community effects. *American sociological review*, 69(5), 704-727.
- Vandezande, V., Fleischmann, F., Baysu, G., Swyngedouw, M., & Phalet, K. (2008). De Turkse en Marokkaanse tweede generatie op de arbeidsmarkt in Antwerpen en Brussel.
- Vanduyndslager, L., Wets, J., Noppe, J., & Doyen, G. (2013). *Vlaamse Migratie- en Integratiemonitor 2013*. Retrieved from Brussel:
- Vansteenkiste, S., & Sourbron, M. (2016). Op weg naar de arbeidsmarkt. De arbeidsmarktintrede van Vlaamse schoolverlaters. *Over. Werk. Tijdschrift van het Steunpunt WSE*, 26(01-2016), 92-105.
- VDAB. (2004). *Fatima of Sil, een wereld van verschil. Een vergelijkend onderzoek naar de slaagkansen op de arbeidsmarkt tussen etnisch E.U. en allochtone schoolverlaters*. Retrieved from Brussel:
- VDAB. (2008). *De taal van de arbeidsmarkt*. Retrieved from Brussel:
- VDAB. (2014). *Duurzaam werk voor jongeren: fictie of realiteit*. Retrieved from Brussel:
- VDAB. (2017). *Werkzoekende schoolverlaters in Vlaanderen*. Retrieved from
- Verhaeghe, P.-P., Li, Y., & Van de Putte, B. (2013). Socio-economic and ethnic inequalities in social capital from the family among labour market entrants. *European Sociological Review*, 29(4), 683-694.
- Verhaeghe, P.-P., Van der Bracht, K., & Van de Putte, B. (2015). Inequalities in social capital and their longitudinal effects on the labour market entry. *Social Networks*, 40, 174-184.
- Verhofstadt, E. (2007). *Qualitative aspects of entry jobs*. Ghent University,
- Zhou, M. (1997). Growing up American: The challenge confronting immigrant children and children of immigrants. *Annual review of sociology*, 23(1), 63-95.
- Zhou, M. (2005). Ethnicity as social capital: community-based institutions and embedded networks of social relations. *Ethnicity, social mobility and public policy: comparing the US and UK*, 131-159.
- Zuccotti, C. V. (2015). Do parents matter? Revisiting ethnic penalties in occupation among second generation ethnic minorities in England and Wales. *Sociology*, 49(2), 229-251.

8 Appendix

Figure 1: Cumulative incidence of entering a first employment spell under different definitions of sustainable employment by duration since leave education.

Note: The income condition implies a gross monthly wage of at least 82% of the gross Belgian minimum monthly wage. The condition of work intensity implicates a work intensity of at least 40% of a full-time position in the activity sector. The hazard models are based on a sample of 5526 Belgian, Turkish and Maghreb origin women who reached the earliest possible graduation moment between 2005 and 2016. Source: MIA Panel, 2005- 2016, calculations by authors.

Table 1: Distribution over key covariates by origin group (in %) in the analyses on sustainable employment spell entry.

	Belgium	Maghreb G1.5	Maghreb G2	Turkey G1.5	Turkey G2	Total
Level of education						
Max 2nd grade secondary	6.4	31.9	17.1	35.0	18.0	15.9
3th grade general & arts	3.0	1.9	3.2	1.4	2.9	2.9
3th grade technical	6.5	4.1	8.2	3.8	6.7	6.8
3th grade vocational	3.2	6.1	6.3	8.0	6.9	5.6
Post-secondary	8.5	16.6	16.0	15.6	19.2	14.6
Higher education, PhD	24.3	4.1	9.7	4.5	7.6	13.0
Unknown	48.1	35.4	39.5	31.8	38.8	41.3
Total	100	100	100	100	100	100
Field of education						
Basic qualifications	3.6	12.1	5.1	13.2	6.1	5.7
Education	6.4	0.3	1.7	1.0	1.3	2.9
Arts, humanities, social science, journalism	9.6	3.5	4.1	3.1	2.6	5.3
Business, administration, law	8.8	13.7	22.6	18.0	25.2	18.4
Technical studies, sciences	5.4	10.2	3.4	2.8	4.4	4.6
Health, welfare, services	18.1	24.8	23.7	30.1	21.7	21.8
Unknown	48.2	35.4	39.6	31.8	38.8	41.3
Total	100	100	100	100	100	100
Dutch language knowledge						
No or limited knowledge	0.5	6.7	2.2	5.2	1.5	1.9
Good knowledge	1.6	17.2	3.7	18.3	9.6	6.2
Very good knowledge	62.5	44.0	63.1	46.7	58.5	59.7
Unknown	35.4	32.2	31.0	29.8	30.4	32.2
Total	100	100	100	100	100	100
Ever in contact with VDAB						
No	23.9	22.9	21.7	22.1	19.6	21.9
Yes	76.1	77.1	78.3	77.9	80.4	78.1
N Persons	1676	314	1755	289	1492	5526

Note: The sample is restricted to native women and women of Turkish and Maghreb origin who reached the earliest possible graduation age, between 2005 and 2016 in Flanders.

Source: MIA Panel, 2005-2016, calculations by authors.

Table 2: Distribution over key covariates by origin group (in %) in the analyses on sustainable employment spell entry.

	Belgium	Maghreb G1.5	Maghreb G2	Turkey G1.5	Turkey G2	Total
Mean exposure	9	14	11	14	11	11
Mean age	21.00	22.00	21.00	22.00	21.00	21.00
Entitled to child benefits						
No	21.75	55.20	31.96	61.65	32.40	33.07
Yes	78.25	44.80	68.04	38.35	67.60	66.93
Total	100	100	100	100	100	100
Number of cumulated quarters work experience						
No work experience	77.92	71.74	69.22	65.66	69.98	71.66
1 to 2 quarters	10.58	11.52	14.03	13.69	15.49	13.31
3 to 4 quarters	4.78	5.17	7.85	8.62	5.80	6.34
5 to 6 quarters	2.46	3.27	3.70	4.36	3.28	3.27
7 to 8 quarters	1.61	2.29	1.89	3.45	2.02	1.98
9 or more quarters	2.65	6.01	3.31	4.23	3.44	3.43
Total	100	100	100	100	100	100
Activity status in the previous quarter						
Entitled to child benefits	76.44	42.85	65.43	36.99	64.75	64.6
Employed, not entitled to child benefits	7.69	8.97	7.36	9.92	8.09	7.93
Looking for a job	2.6	7.66	7.16	9.38	7.68	6.28
Inactive, not entitled to child benefits	7.9	35.98	14.64	39.07	13.84	15.84
Unknown	5.38	4.54	5.41	4.65	5.63	5.35
Total	100	100	100	100	100	100
Number of children						
No children	95.99	60.85	87.78	64.02	89.22	86.78
1 child	2.83	15.42	7.44	17.46	7.02	7.37
2 or more children	1.18	23.73	4.78	18.52	3.76	5.86
Total	100	100	100	100	100	100
Income partner						
Partner unemployed/inactive	1.03	10.76	4.82	7.61	5.21	4.55
Quintile 1	0.5	3.56	1.78	4.68	2.08	1.85
Quintile 2	0.6	5.86	1.59	5.34	2.26	2.07
Quintile 3	0.93	6.81	2.02	4.93	2.48	2.41
Quintile 4	0.62	5.14	2.04	4.11	1.48	1.88
Quintile 5	0.57	2.43	1.05	0.61	0.4	0.82
Partner, unknown income	0.53	3.04	1.01	4.92	1.4	1.39
No partner	95.23	62.39	85.69	67.81	84.7	85.03
Total	100	100	100	100	100	100

Parental income

No working parents	8.25	37.62	46.45	29.36	35.17	31.57
Quintile 1	6.89	6.69	9.09	8.16	11.03	8.8
Quintile 2	8.37	6.98	9.86	11.16	10.62	9.55
Quintile 3	9.52	5.85	10.16	8.45	12.83	10.28
Quintile 4	16.59	1.79	8.53	2.53	7.73	9.54
Quintile 5	28.87	0.99	3.77	0.12	2.54	9.59
Not living in parental home	4.08	29.7	2.65	28.3	3.52	6.95
Unknown	17.44	10.37	9.49	11.92	16.57	13.73
Total	100	100	100	100	100	100
N Person Quarters	23658	6634	29335	5940	24473	90040

Note: The sample is restricted to native women and women of Turkish and Maghreb origin who reached the earliest possible graduation age, between 2005 and 2016 in Flanders. As work experience, number of children, partner's income and parental income are time-varying variables they are expressed in number of Person Quarters.

Source: MIA Panel, 2005-2016, calculations by authors.

Figure 2: Conditional probability (a) and cumulative incidence (b) of entering a first sustainable employment spell by duration since leaving education, origin group and generation.

Note: The transition into a first sustainable employment spell is operationalized as the first quarter of an employment spell of 4 consecutive quarters leading to a gross monthly wage of at least 82 per cent of the minimum wage and a work intensity of at least 40 per cent of a full-time position in the fourth quarter of the employment spell.

Source: MIA Panel, 2005-2016, calculations by authors.

Figure 3: Characteristics of first job in the first sustainable employment spell by origin group and generation.

Note: The sample is restricted to native women and women of Turkish and Maghreb origin who entered a first sustainable employment spell between 2005 and 2016. The distribution of type of employment (Cramer's $V=0.12^{***}$), type of contract (Cramer's $V=0.08^{***}$) and gross wage quintile (Cramer's $V=0.08^{***}$) differs significantly by origin group and generation. Source: MIA Panel, 2005-2016, calculations by authors.

Figure 4: Conditional probability (a) and cumulative incidence (b) of exiting a first sustainable employment spell by duration since fourth quarter of the spell, origin group and generation.

Note: The sample is restricted to native women and women of Turkish and Maghreb origin who entered a first sustainable employment spell and who have not been censored before the fifth quarter of the spell between 2005 and 2016. If women are incapable to work or take up leave or time credit for one to three consecutive quarters this is not considered as an exit out of the employment spell. Women who are incapable to work for one year or longer are censored, women who take up leave or time credit for one year or longer are considered as exiting the employment spell. Source: MIA Panel, 2005-2016, calculations by authors.

Figure 5: Cumulative incidence of entering a first spell of sustainable employment: gross (Model 0) and net (Models 1-3) ethnic differentials between natives and intermediate and second generation women of Turkish or Maghreb origin.

Note: Cumulative incidence curves of discrete-time hazard models of entering a first sustainable employment spell (equations 1-4). Model 0 reflects gross ethnic differentials. Model 1 controls for individual characteristics (age, level and field of education, Dutch language skills, ever contact with VDAB) and previous employment experience (cumulated quarters work experience, activity status in the previous quarter), Model 2 additionally controls for household characteristics (number of children and income partner) and Model 3 additionally controls for parental income.

Source: MIA Panel, 2005-2016, calculations by authors.

Figure 6: Predicted probabilities of the characteristics of the first job in the sustainable employment spell by origin group and generation, Models 0-3.

6c: Gross wage quintile

Note: Model 0 reflects gross ethnic differentials. Model 1 controls for individual characteristics (age, level and field of education and Dutch language skills) and previous employment experience (cumulated quarters work experience, activity status in the previous quarter), Model 2 additionally controls for household characteristics (number of children and income partner) and Model 3 additionally controls for parental income.
Source: MIA Panel, 2005-2016, calculations by authors.

Figure 7: Cumulative incidence of exiting a first spell of sustainable employment: gross (Model 0) and net (Models 1-3) ethnic differentials between natives and intermediate and second generation women of Turkish or Maghreb origin.

Note: Cumulative incidence curves of discrete-time hazard models of exiting the first sustainable employment spell (equations 1-4). Model 0 reflects gross ethnic differentials. Model 1 controls for individual characteristics (age, level and field of education and Dutch language skills) and previous employment experience (cumulated quarters work experience, type of contract and gross wage in the previous quarter), Model 2 additionally controls for household characteristics (number of children and income partner) and Model 3 additionally controls for parental income.
Source: MIA Panel, 2005-2016, calculations by authors. This study focusses